

logos & littera

Issue 7 / 2020



Editor-in-Chief Vesna Bratić

Journal of Interdisciplinary Approaches to Text

Faculty of Philology
University of Montenegro

LOGOS ET LITTERA
Journal of Interdisciplinary Approaches to Text
ISSN: 2336-9884

Issue 7
2020

Podgorica, Montenegro

Editors	Prof. dr Vesna Bratić
Associate editors	Prof. dr Milica Vuković-Stamatović Prof. dr Igor Lakić
Publisher	Faculty of Philology University of Montenegro
Secretary	Dragana Čarapić, PhD

Editorial board (in alphabetical order)

Duška Rosenberg, PhD, Emeritus Professor, University of London

Goran Radonjić, PhD, Assistant Professor, University of Montenegro

Jagoda Granić, PhD, Associate Professor, University of Split

Jelena Pralas, PhD, Assistant Professor, University of Donja Gorica

Marina Katnić-Bakaršić, PhD, Full Professor, University of Sarajevo

Michael Byram, PhD, Emeritus Professor, Durham University

Neda Andrić, PhD, Associate Professor, University of Montenegro

Nike Pokorn, PhD, Full Professor, University of Ljubljana

Olivera Kusovac, PhD, Associate Professor, University of Montenegro

Radojka Vukčević, PhD, Full Professor, University of Belgrade

Ranko Bugarski, PhD, Full Professor, University of Belgrade (retired)

Slavica Perović, PhD, Full Professor, University of Montenegro (retired)

Snežana Gudurić, PhD, Full Professor, University of Novi Sad

Svetlana Kurteš, PhD, Research Associate, University of Madeira

Tatiana Larina, PhD, Professor, Peoples' Friendship University of Russia and
Moscow State Linguistic University

Vesna Polovina, PhD, Full Professor, University of Belgrade

Vladimir Žegarac, PhD, Assistant Professor, University of Madeira

Vojko Gorjanc, PhD, Full Professor, University of Ljubljana

Zoran Paunović, PhD, Full Professor, University of Belgrade

ISSUE 7

LOGOS & LITTERA
Journal of Interdisciplinary
Approaches to Text

Podgorica, 2020

Faculty of Philology
University of Montenegro

CONTENTS

Ewa A. Łukaszyk: <i>Language – audibility – marginalisation: On dying tongues and creative participation</i>	1
Igor Lakić: <i>Evaluative aspects of print media texts</i>	12
Maria Angeles Ruiz-Moneva: <i>The use of whereas and whereas-clauses in Swift's The Drapier's Letters</i>	24
Tolulope Akinseye: <i>Thematic selection and progression patterns in L2 humanity- and science-based theses abstracts</i>	49
Sabina Osmanović: <i>Franz Kafkas „Ein Landarzt“ als komplexes Deutungsbeispiel der modernen Parabel – ein gattungsgeschichtlicher Abriss</i>	64
Mahsa Sadat Razavi and Maryam Soltan Beyad: <i>Mapping the journey: A study of maturing femininity in Alice Munro's Lives of Girls and Women</i>	76



Ewa A. Łukaszyk¹

DOI: 10.31902/LL.2019.7.1

LANGUAGE – AUDIBILITY – MARGINALISATION ON DYING TONGUES AND CREATIVE PARTICIPATION

Abstract: *The paper is dedicated to the problems of linguistic revitalisation and the dynamics leading to language death. Among such factors as colonial oppression and policies of state centralisation, a special attention is paid to the causes of language relinquishment and the situations in which minor languages are abandoned in favour of major ones. The author muses on the lure of larger, more attractive speech communities and the importance of language choice in building global solidarity and networks of exchange of ideas. The main question asked is how to foster the participation and visibility of creators and intellectuals representing minor ethnolinguistic communities, making the diversity of outlooks and cognitive modalities associated with minor languages available and enriching for global majorities.*

Key words: *endangered languages, global culture, marginalisation, participation*

Introduction

In the essay *The Fragility of Languages*, published in 2015 as the Editor's Column in the influential *PMLA*, Simon Gikandi mused on the phenomenon of language death, an aspect, perhaps a paradoxical one, of the universal penchant toward extinction that seems to mark our times. Paradoxical, since the Anthropocene as the new geological period in which the humankind becomes the most powerful force shaping the Earth is a time in which the products of cultural – not only natural – evolution disappear at an unprecedented pace. Tongues die out apparently in just the same way as biological species do. It has also been observed that the hotspots of linguistic diversity tend to coincide with the hotspots of biodiversity. Although the reasons of such coincidence are not entirely clear, the researchers associated a total of 3,202 tongues (that may correspond to as many as a half of all languages spoken on Earth) with 35 biodiversity hotspots (cf. Gorenflo et al. 2012). They are situated in such regions as East Melanesian Islands (also known as the Solomons-Vanuatu-Bismarck moist forests area that is to be found, just to give a rough idea, around Papua New Guinea), Guinean Forests of West Africa, Indo-Burma, Mesoamerica, and Wallacea (i.e. the group of Indonesian islands including Sulawesi, Lombok, Sumbawa, Flores, Timor, etc.).

All those remote areas have in common not only their geographical isolation on islands or in mountain ranges covered by dense forest, but also, in most cases, the historical absence of strong centres that might merge them together into powerful strands of written culture and hegemonic traditions. “A language is endangered when its native speakers feel powerless in the face of encroaching languages or think that their language is a shameful mark of backwardness”, says Gikandi (12). And he goes on evoking conquest, colonisation and powerful

¹ Former full professor at the University of Warsaw; currently guest researcher at Leiden University in the Netherlands.

centralised states prohibiting regional tongues that might provide a voice for decentralising tendencies. Such would be, for instance, the case of Catalan in Franco's Spain. The linguistic diversity survived in those areas that were sufficiently remote to escape such imperialistic, or simply centralising dynamics. Thus, there may exist an exploitable relationship between the linguistic diversity and the concept of Zomia, introduced in 2002 by Willem Van Schendel to refer to the Southeast Asian Massif that historically escaped the control of the governments based in the lowlands. He coined this term using the word "Zomi", common to several Tibeto-Burman languages spoken in the area; it simply means "highlander". For many centuries, this elevated, rugged terrain was the home of distinct ethnolinguistic communities cultivating a diversity of forms of social organisation, all of them avoiding being integrated into powerful states, the fact that led to James C. Scott's influential vision of the "art of not being governed" and "anarchist history" (2009). Such an anarchist history may preserve minor tongues from the "encroaching languages" backed up by a centralised power.

Language revitalisation as an engaged academic practice

Over the last two or three decades, language revitalisation has been considered 'sexy'. The idea of linguistic rights has been propagated all over the world. The urgency of studying, cataloguing or at least archiving the tongues before they disappear justified the mobilisation of considerable human and financial resources; it fostered individual careers of the researchers. Even in a nearly monolingual context such as Poland, not only Kashubian and Lemko, but also Wymysorys – an endangered language spoken exclusively in one town, Wilamowice, in Lesser Poland – have focused a considerable academic and public attention. Since 2001, Lemko has been studied and taught, in the framework of Russian Philology, at the Pedagogical University in Kraków; since approximately 2013, Wymysorys has been researched and actively revitalised by a team based at the Faculty "Artes Liberales", University of Warsaw. These facts contrast sharply with nearly complete oblivion and strong depreciation of those languages before 1989, offering, at the same time, an exemplification of the concept of cultural democracy used to describe the readiness of the state and majoritarian society to accept the claims of ethnolinguistic minorities. Unfortunately, with the present-day advent of right-wing nationalisms in various parts of Central and Eastern Europe, including Poland, the progress of linguistic revitalisation risks to be compromised. The minoritarian cause may easily be deferred to another period of political thaw and cultural democratisation. The lemma of "Reversing Language Shift", advocated by Joshua A. Fishman (2001), actually acquires a sinister, bivalent connotation, as a positive reversal of a negative trend (language endangerment), as well as a possible negative reversal of a positive trend (political endangerment of language revitalisation). The matter depends strongly on the incessant turns of political tides.

Certainly, such issues acquire even greater importance in the regions that are linguistically more diversified, such as the Balkans or the Caucasus. In any case, the question if and why the languages should be revitalised, including the purpose of archiving the dying tongues, may be seen as awkward, misplaced, or strongly dependent on the political correctness adopted under given circumstances. The

linguists usually take the answer for granted: it is generally admitted that the linguistic diversity is an important patrimony of the humanity. Languages should be preserved simply because they took such a long time to grow and diversify; they are regarded as receptacles of the experience of countless generations, something that links us to the past, even if we know that also the process of their change and reinvention is constant. Also the so-called Sapir-Whorf hypothesis, or the hypothesis of linguistic relativity, is often invoked. It consists in the claim that language shapes not only the speaker's world view, but also his or her cognition and the way of experiencing the reality. Thus, it may be argued that the death of a language implies a loss of a specific modality of being human. Even if this legacy, for any practical purpose, apparently remains far beyond the horizon of a great majority of us, hidden somewhere in the depths of the moist forests of Wallacea, while we live in an impoverished, often monolingual reality close at hand. The argument that may eventually appeal stronger to the general imagination is that the linguistic grail, the secret of the origin and evolution of human speech, may remain forever an inscrutable mystery if we lose – as many prognostics indicate – up to 90% of all languages before the end of the current century.

Language death and cultural dynamics

The causes of the death of languages are often presented in the scholarly literature as complex, yet relatively clear. As Brenzinger and de Graaf present it, “language endangerment may be caused primarily by *external* forces such as military, economic, religious, cultural, or educational subjugation. It may also be caused by *internal* forces, such as a community’s negative attitude towards its own language or by a general decline of group identity. Internal pressures always derive from external factors” (3). Yet, countering this prevalent opinion stressing the role of external factors, the question of cultural evolution and autonomous decisions taken by the members of the communities, preserving a degree of independence in the deliberate adoption of certain ways of responding to external pressures, should also be taken into account.

In the assessment based on the analogy between biodiversity and linguistic diversity, the fact that numerous tongues exist is treated as an obviously positive factor, since it is inferred that with diversity comes strength and resilience. Diverse ecosystems adapt more easily to changes, those impoverished may be easily destroyed even by minor events. Certainly, at the best academic level, the resilience theory applied to linguistics is not to be seen as such a simplified approach (cf. Bradley 2011). As David Bradley explains in a recent publication,

“resilience thinking is a developing paradigm in ecology which recognizes ecological challenges and tries to identify and quantify the factors behind them. Accepting that some changes are irreversible once a threshold is crossed, it sets out to ameliorate the situation of an ecosystem through changes in the ways humans use and interact with that ecosystem and to reach a new stable state. [...] Human language is also a complex adaptive system which goes through phases of stability and growth and also through phases of change; our challenge as linguists is to help communities to make

and implement informed language-related choices that meet their new needs in a changed world, and where possible lead to renewal of the language and preservation of its cultural riches, and to develop more positive attitudes about the language and its users, both within the community and outside” (Bradley 2019: 509-510).

Yet the application of biology-inspired theories to cultural phenomena should always be done with due caution; certainly, they are not fully analogous to the functioning of ecosystems. The variety of tongues comes at a price: it seems to be associated with a degree of cultural weakness. On the other hand, the accumulation of cultural potential, reinforced with writing that permits to preserve and transmit symbolic achievements across generations, tends to merge together or bring about the demise of minor tongues, creating linguistic uniformity associated with broad horizons of communication across extensive territories and numerous populations. This is how the languages die – not just under direct oppression, but also due to the lure of stronger languages that offer richer opportunities to communities and individuals, especially those who are more active and creative than the majority. As they act as trendsetters, their personal options may have a powerful impact on communities.

A tongue is, after all, a tool of communication. The tools judged obsolete are abandoned as the speakers move into new contexts of communication. It is often enough to get out of one's own village to be confronted with such a situation, and the members of small communities may identify their language as a hindrance and chose to reject it in the course of their autonomous development. Endangered languages are, in the first place, those with less than 10,000 speakers, usually lacking standardised writing. Such is – or was – the case of nearly a half of the 6,000 or 7,000 spoken in the world by the half of the 20th century. This is why, in Gikandi's rather macabre phrasing, “the world seems littered with dying or dead languages” (10). The expression seems to evoke a battlefield covered by corpses, yet it is better to keep in mind a clear distinction between tongues and people. It is true that in modern history, some languages died as a consequence of physical elimination of their speakers. Such events took place, just to give an example, in Tasmania during the 19th century. Also in the present-day world large-scale ethnic cleansing still exist, as the cases of Uygur and Rohingya communities testify. Nonetheless, the scale of spontaneous shift toward major languages is not to be underestimated as a major factor shaping global linguistic reality.

Language relinquishment

The Angolan writer and jazz musician Kalaf Epalanga illustrates this situation as he writes in the foreword of his volume of urban chronicles *O Angolano que comprou Lisboa (por metade do preço)*:

Eu sou esse órfão cultural que mal sabe contar até dez na língua dos meus pais, dos pais destes e por aí fora. Mosi, vali, tatu, kuãla, cinco, seis, sete, oito, nove, ekui... (14)

I am such a cultural orphan who can hardly count to ten in the language of my parents, their parents, and so on. Mosi, vali, tatu, kuāla, five, six, seven, eight, nine, ekui... (my trans.)

At the first glance, it looks like a lament on one of those cadavers evoked by Gikandi. But Epalanga does not actually seem to suffer from bereavement, lamenting on the loss of those traditional identities and languages that had disappeared under the pressure of Portuguese colonisation. Quite to the contrary, he is celebrating the urban, hybrid culture that comes from Angola to conquer – at least symbolically, through fashionable dances and other forms of cultural creativity – the ex-metropolis that, according to the suggestion included in the title, is ready to sell itself to the newcomer for half price. His native Umbundu, one of the languages belonging to Bantu family, is the major language of Angola. The ethnic group that speaks it constitutes one third of the country's population. Although this population traditionally inhabited the Central Highlands of Angola, recent migrations have brought Umbundu to the coastal cities: Luanda, Benguela and Lobito. Thus, not exactly a dying tongue. Rather a tongue that came to the city only to be abandoned by those speakers who prefer to follow the lure of some thrilling, fashionable speech better befitting, as they believe, the status they acquired. In Epalanga's case, a transcontinental variant of Portuguese.

The passage from one's native tongue into a larger linguistic horizon certainly has a thrill. I have myself experienced it, – as well as the discomfort of abandoning one's first and innermost modality of expression –, when I ceased to be an academic author writing in Polish and started to write in English instead. Knowing only too well the symbolic rewards of such a decision, I cannot blame anyone who abandons a minor language in order to gain a voice and an opportunity of participation in a larger intellectual or creative community, even if we are to regret so bitterly the loss of linguistic diversity. Concomitant cultivation of two (or more) tongues of expression may appear as an obvious, ideal solution. In practice, such a parallel progress comes at a price that is often too high to pay. It implies the division of time and resources, often leading to diminished efficiency. Those who already at the starting point are forced to face the globalised competition with considerable handicaps simply cannot accept the additional effort of multilingual development.

Such is the case of a schoolchild in Indonesia, speaking a dying tongue while the nearest school is at a distance of many hours of marching through the forest. Although assuming quite different proportions, such is still the case of a scholar from Central and Eastern Europe eager to join the international academia. In both cases, the lure of succeeding comes at the price of adopting one of those “encroaching languages” mentioned by Gikandi. The hegemony of globalised English only exemplifies a much more universal process of language suppression and replacement. It is the same process by which Portuguese replaces Umbundu for the emergent urban middle class in Angola, epitomised by Kalaf Epalanga. It is important to notice that he testifies of a language shift that is no longer to be attributed – at least not in a simple, linear way – to the colonial oppression. The writer belongs to the generation born after the independence, that nonetheless

experiences the loss of language – or rather its relinquishment or deferral – as a part of their present.

Participation as the stake of language choice

Relatively lesser scholarly attention has been dedicated to this process; to speak about relinquished minor languages in terms of rejected marginalisation and increasing participation does not even sound politically correct. Nonetheless, without denying the necessity and urgency of linguistic preservation, it is important and legitimate to ask what costs and consequences it implies for individuals and communities, how it empowers or hinders their participation in the exchange of ideas and the planetary community of shared culture. Behind the endangered languages there are endangered people struggling against poverty, low symbolic status or political oppression. Their choice of abandoning local tongues as a tool of expression is often closely connected with their strive to gain sufficient visibility in the dominating symbolic systems in order to make their voices audible. Contemporary writers are often confronted with the choice between the fidelity to their native tongue and the will of transmitting their story to a larger audience. They choose major languages not only to make themselves published, read or famous, but also to bring to the general awareness the tragedies that are routinely overlooked. Such was the case of Moses Isegawa, a writer from Uganda, who learned Dutch to publish his *Abessijnse kronieken* in Amsterdam (1998); another example is Donato Ndongo-Bidyogo, who chose to subscribe to the Hispanic African movement, instead of cultivating any of the native languages. He did so in order to endow himself with sufficient audibility and symbolic power to challenge the sanguinary regime of Equatorial Guinea. Once again, I chose my examples in such a way as to accentuate the point that the “encroaching language” is not exclusively global English. Also other languages play the same role. It is also important to stress that they are not exclusively a destructive force. “Encroaching languages” play a crucial role as doors that lead to communities of shared values; they serve as important tools for building global networks of solidarity. This is why, long after the end of the colonial period, they are far from being abandoned or rejected; at least not by the creators and intellectuals. Meanwhile, Teodoro Obiang, the bloodthirsty dictator of Equatorial Guinea, tried to sever these links, adopting such apparently “progressive” strategies as banishing the use of Spanish and fostering the education in Fang, the tongue spoken by his own ethnolinguistic group. Native language was to become a subtle form of incarceration of minds in a country transformed into a prison.

Certainly, the distance between the individual defection of a writer and the death of a language is enormous. Nonetheless, such individual creative choices establish trends and paradigms; what is more, they may arguably possess a transhistorical value. The endangered languages of today are those lacking accumulated achievements, literatures, strong traditions that would make them worth preserving, at least in any form of ritualised usage such as a recitation of a poem or chanting of a song. And it is not – as it might be argued – my insufficiently informed or colonially distorted view that matters, but the depreciation of languages by their own users. After all, the languages die, in the first place, because people renounce speaking them and transmitting them to their own children. Certainly, the

motivations of such choices vary; both the lure and oppression acquire varying degrees of intensity across the diversity of local contexts. But the importance and validity of the speakers' choice should not be covered up by any form of political correctness. If the target of linguistic preservation is to be maintained, it should foster creativity in the endangered languages and empower the formation of lasting, valorised and respected canons, as well as communities of shared aesthetic and spiritual values finding in them their expression.

These communities have also the right to participate in the globalized culture, which is nowadays such a lure for everybody. They ought to find their place in the academic world, with such modalities as non-English speaking journals and publications, a reality that currently tends to disappear under the unrelenting pressure of international structures, rankings and organisations. They also ought to be present, through competent translations, on the global literary market. What should be the grail of the present-day work on linguistic diversity is not only to preserve languages as such, but also to foster full participation of their speakers in the world culture as a shared space of knowledge exchange. What is more, this participation should be free from complexes, shyness, the persistent sensation of being minor – even such as I have often experienced as an academic writer in Polish. I can easily imagine that such a sensation could be even more acute for many colleagues working in a number of languages of Central and Eastern Europe, without evoking a variety of distant locations and identities.

Such considerations may be extremely timely, since we are currently at a turning point in which future destinies of participation and marginalization are decided. This is the moment in which a global academic space of a new kind is emerging. New universities are created outside the Western world and develop at an unprecedented pace; what is more, the academic space acquires new characteristics due to digital media. It is thus alarming that only a tiny fraction of this space is actually occupied by minor languages. The scarcity of print (books and magazines are still a rare luxury in an extensive part of Africa, as well as other regions) is apparently a resolved issue due to the emergence of the digital media. Nonetheless, the relative facility of producing and distributing digital materials still has only a reduced impact on the preservation of linguistic diversity. Electronic means, such as computers and the infrastructure enabling the access to the Internet, are difficult to obtain precisely in those areas where the dying languages are located. What is more, the digitalisation of the humanities empowered in the first place the major academic players and fostered their further expansion. It facilitated the global spread of forms of expression they control and dictate (I refer to the use of globally standardised academic English, but also the predominant genres and discourses that, contrasted with the background of the cultural diversity existing worldwide, present relatively few traits of cultural diversity).

Material hindrances are relatively easier to overcome than the deficiencies of competence in dealing with hegemonic symbolic systems. For those who aspire to play an active role in the global exchange of ideas, creating and launching one's own intellectual content, the mastery of a major language is still essential. On the other hand, those who do not achieve such a mastery or do not reproduce the dominant discourse with sufficient fidelity continue reduced to silence. The point that should

be stressed is, once again, that this reality is no longer a simple consequence of the former, colonial and postcolonial forms of symbolic violence (by postcolonial, I wish to evoke the centralising aspirations of the young independent states that have often fostered policies aimed at reducing the linguistic diversity). With the advent of the digital, a qualitatively novel danger of exclusion lurks as a counterpart of new opportunities. It may deepen the abyss between those who are able to participate and those who will remain marginalized.

In search of a synergistic solution

Speaking of the effects of the globalization on the endangered languages, Grenoble and Whaley stress that the assimilation, that is usually seen as prevailing, is not the only factor in play: “Much less examined is the fact that globalizing forces have triggered reacting forces as some people seek to assert, or better to reassert, their unique cultural identity” (2006: 3). Fostering synergy between minor and major languages instead of their contradiction and mutual exclusion is thus a crucial task. Such a synergy requires the creation of paths of participation in the global exchange of ideas directly from the level of native languages. It requires an equitable distribution of symbolic rewards, prestige, recognition and merit among minor and major participants. Only in such a way, shortening the distance between native worlds and the global space of exchange, getting rid of parasitic intermediaries, the diversity of outlooks and ways of experiencing the world, derived from the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis, will cease to be a mere theoretical construct to become a truly enriching legacy available to global majorities. Meanwhile, the current situation privileges, in quite a disproportionate way, the representatives of the major, English-speaking system of knowledge production. Speaking of intermediaries, I think about unscrupulous researchers and activists coming from major centres, with access to prestige and generous funding, who are often keen to maintain their native collaborators in a subaltern position, denying their ability of conducting independent research on their own. Personally, I could observe similar situations on various occasions, while the preservation of the linguistic patrimony of the humanity continues a major academic industry. This is not a place, of course, to cite names, yet the recollection of my Buryat PhD student, commenting on the unpleasant thrill she felt as she thought she might one day receive the same demeaning treatment she saw reserved to an instructor of Sylheti (a minor language spoken in Bangladesh), is hard to obliterate. The fact that our conversation took place at the SOAS in London, a leading institution presumably dictating the best standards in the domain, indicates how much remains to be done.

Native cultures need to adapt their traditional symbolic instances in order to survive and to affirm their own place in a larger context, confronting both their states and the transnational reality. Meanwhile, in the traditional cultures a homeostatic tendency prevails over the tendency to change. This is why, as I believe, the emergence and empowerment of the native intellectual is a crucial step in this process of adaptation to the accelerated rhythm of development and change that characterises our times. As a paradigmatic figure that opens new questions and creates fields of debate, the intellectual helps the native culture to change, acting against its homeostatic tendencies. This is why the intellectual is a crucial internal

instance, invested with an authority to question and to criticize the established cultural order, provoking a change from within. On the other hand, he or she is responsible for representing the minor culture in confrontation with the external forces, speaking for it to the state and to the international community. Without intellectuals of their own, native cultures are mute and remain silent victims of symbolic – and not only symbolic – oppression.

The emergence and empowerment of the intellectual is closely connected to the question of language. As defined by Edward Said, “the intellectual is an individual endowed with a faculty for representing, embodying, articulating a message, a view, an attitude, philosophy or opinion to, as well as for, a public” in order to “represent all those people and issues that are routinely forgotten or swept under the rug” (9). As the Palestinian thinker suggests, the power of the intellectual is linguistic at its deepest level, connected to his or her exceptional mastery of language. “Knowing how to use language well and knowing when to intervene in language are two essential features of intellectual action” (15). It is his or her language mastery that enables the intellectual to dispute the place of the official narrations and to oppose the media controlled by the dominating cultural power; due to his or her literary, discursive, rhetorical excellence, the intellectual is able to express in a convincing way, and thus efficiently represent those points of view that had been absent or silenced.

The role of the intellectual is played both at the intracultural level (representation of the wronged and pointing to the situations of injustice within the community) and in the interaction with external world. The intellectual must thus assume the burden of the multilingual development that I have already mentioned, building a double mastery and a double excellence; certainly not an easy task. It is not enough to cultivate a minor language; if the intellectual is to confront the dominant institutions, he or she must operate with sufficient ease at a non-local level. If his or her voice remains incomprehensible, the community will continue being swept under the rug over and over again. This is what makes the linguistic issue so complex. If the preservation of the local language may be seen as a fundamental aspect of identity, there is still a necessity of adopting any of the “encroaching languages”. Meanwhile, such a pragmatic option risks to become a linguistic Trojan horse. Once the intellectual finds himself or herself at home in the major language, he or she may never truly return to the restrictive domain of the minor one. His or her voice may become sufficiently audible to safeguard the interests of his or her culture and community, but the minor language is lost in the process.

Thus the forced bilingualism of intellectual elites introduces more danger than just the division of creative energy. Such a duality of targets, aspirations and requests demands a constant care in order to preserve a fragile equilibrium. Rather than synergy of minor and major languages, it may create a fissure that impairs the creative development, splitting a native culture into incongruous or opposing currents. This is why the initiatives of linguistic revitalization, often brought into the communities in crisis by foreign researchers and activists, should not appear as isolated projects. They should be inscribed in some larger, holistic vision of cultural development. Linguistic revitalization cannot be understood as a target in itself,

consisting in conservation of a (presupposed) past state, which in many cases is merely a construct or a conviction of the researcher concerning the reality in question. People coming to minor communities with the best intentions are often advocates of an abstraction, of some imaginary state of their cultures; this is why they tend to represent a conservative tendency, opposing the need for a change that the minor participants may see more clearly than the researchers coming with some well-crystallised ideas from their intellectually hegemonic centres. As they appear as lovers of the obsolete, their prestige may act against the cultural change and creative development.

Conclusions

Languages and ethnolinguistic communities are *not* the same as dying zoological species, with which they have been misleadingly compared, since they happen to inhabit the same biodiversity spots. The pace of change in cultural evolution – including the evolution of language – has nothing to do with biological evolution and the threat of extinction that looms over the natural world. People constantly abandon and reinvent their cultural practices; nostalgia of the origins, especially if it is brought into the native words from outside, have no right to prevail over or interfere with the ongoing creative processes. No one has right to privilege any form of patrimony in detriment of the desired change, even if minor communities seem only too keen to abandon their old symbolic stock. Of course, the external intervention may often save some important parts of the legacy that the community is ready to neglect, but no one should feel authorised to impair vital evolution or invert the movements that might possibly lead to new forms of emancipation, even if it happens at a cost of an irrecoverable loss, such as the death of a language.

Projects of intervention in favour of dying languages often encounter a profound scepticism of local communities. Linguistic revitalization should not be a trap or a way of maintaining cultures and communities in their marginalised position. It should not foster the state of self-satisfaction in the margin. Having been taught to feel proud of one's exclusive linguistic patrimony may only sweeten a reality of perpetual exclusion. This is why so many ethnolinguistic communities are much keener to adopt major languages they associate with increased income, prestige, vital opportunities. Including the lure of buying one's own ex-metropolis for a half of the regular price.

References

- Bradley, David. "Resilience Thinking and Language Endangerment". In: Bai, Bibo and Bradley David (eds.), *Extinction and Retention of Mother Tongues in China*. Beijing: Nationalities Press, 2011.
- Bradley, David. "Resilience for Minority Languages". In: *The Palgrave Handbook for Minority Languages and Communities*, Hogan-Brun, Gabrielle and O'Rourke, Bernadette (eds.), London: Palgrave-Macmillan, 2019.
- Brenzinger, Matthias and Graaf, Tjeerd de. "Documenting Endangered Languages and Maintaining Language Diversity". In: Anita Sujodjic (ed.), *Linguistic Anthropology*, [Paris]: UNESCO-EOLSS, 2009.

- Epalanga, Kalaf. *O angolano que comprou Lisboa (por metade do preço)*. Lisboa: Caminho, 2014.
- Fishman, Joshua A. (ed.). *Can Threatened Languages Be Saved? Reversing Language Shift Revisited: A 21st Century Perspective*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters, 2011.
- Gikandi, Simon. "The Fragility of Languages". *PMLA* 130.1 (2015): 9-14.
- Grenoble, Lenore A. and Whaley, Lindsay J., *Saving Languages. An Introduction to Language Revitalisation*, Cambridge – New York: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Gorenflo, L. J., Romaine, Suzanne, Mittermeier Russell A., and Walker-Painemilla, Kristen. "Co-occurrence of linguistic and biological diversity in biodiversity hotspots and high biodiversity wilderness areas". *PNAS* 109.21 (2012): 8032-8037.
- Isegawa, Moses. *Abessijnse kronieken*. Amsterdam: De Bezige Bij, 1998.
- Revitalising Endangered Languages. University of Warsaw, 2016. <<http://www.revitalization.al.uw.edu.pl/>>.
- Said, Edward. *Representations of the Intellectual. The 1993 Reith Lectures*. London: Vintage, 1994.
- Scott, James C. *The Art of Not Being Governed: An Anarchist History of Upland Southeast Asia*. New Haven & London: Yale University Press, 2009.
- Van Schendel, Willem. "Geographies of Knowing, Geographies of Ignorance: Jumping Scale in Southeast Asia", *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 20.6 (2002): 647-668.



EVALUATIVE ASPECTS OF PRINT MEDIA TEXTS

Abstract: *This paper revisits the concept of macrostructure, i.e. the thematic and organizational structure of texts, in this case that of the news discourse and its link with Critical Discourse analysis (CDA). Special focus is put on the Evaluation as a part of the news story macrostructure. The paper presents the author's model of news structure in print media, based on the models of van Dijk (1988a, 1988b) and Bell (1994). The following parts of the macrostructure are identified: (1) Headline, (2) Lead, (3) Main Event(s), (4) Background of the Event, (5) Verbal Comment(s), (6) Evaluation, and (7) Results of the Event. The author also points out that pure linguistic analysis itself cannot lead to proper interpretation of news discourse. Based on these two aspects, the paper specifically focuses on Evaluation as a part of the macro structure and its linguistic exponents on the microstructure level. Evaluation includes attitudes, opinions or the evaluation of the event by the journalist or the newspaper he/she writes for. It is the Evaluation that gives sense or meaning to the text. Evaluation will be discussed in terms of its explicit presence in the text, as a distinctive unit in the schematic structure of news, but also in its implicit form, very often hidden behind other parts of macrostructure such as Headline, Lead, Main Event or Verbal Comments. The examples of Evaluation will be taken from a corpus comprising examples from three British and three Montenegrin dailies reporting on the NATO airstrikes against former Yugoslavia.*

Key words: *evaluation, discourse analysis, macrostructures, microstructures, CDA*

1. Introduction

Media shape the world around, influencing our opinions and conclusions on the context in which we live. These views are always dependent on different aspects, such as political orientation, interests of the media owners, advertisers etc. In the times of crises, the tendency of the media to shape their readers'/viewers' opinions is particularly evident. Such situations lead media to present events from a specific, sometimes biased point of view, in order to attract the attention and trust of their readers or viewers for a specific cause. Media's evaluation of events is therefore crucial in shaping public opinion.

Martin and White (2005: 1) refer to evaluation as a "subjective presence of writers/speakers in texts as they adopt stances towards both the material they present and those with whom they communicate".

Bednarek (2006: 4) claims that evaluation occupies a significant place in our lives through which we interpret the world around us and offer this evaluation to others. It also determines our behaviour. In such a way, our short-term evaluations may become long-term values which determine our personality, the way of life, the friendships we make, etc. She also adds that "... evaluation is extremely important in actual discourse, in that it is difficult if not impossible for human beings (and perhaps not even desirable) to speak with a completely 'objective' voice, *not* to impose evaluations on one's utterance, and *not* to communicate value judgements" (Bednarek: 2006: 5).

¹ Associate professor at the University of Montenegro.

In addition, Martin and White (2005:92) claim that “all utterances are seen as in some way stanced or attitudinal“. This means that even an attempt to be neutral and impartial can still have a hint of a biased stance, although unintentional.

This paper is based on a more comprehensive analysis (Lakić, 2011) of selected examples from three British dailies (*the Guardian*, *the Independent* and *the Times*) on NATO airstrikes on Yugoslavia. Quantitative analysis is not presented here due to the limited space and the scope of the paper, but our findings are certainly based on linguistic evidence. The purpose of this paper is therefore to show the evaluative force of media text from the qualitative point of view in combination with the analysis of the units on the micro level. Different ideas are certainly expressed through linguistic means, such as words or phrases, but the impact of these ideas is seen much more on the metalinguistic rather than purely linguistic level.

After the introduction, the paper first offers some theoretical insights into the topic of evaluation as a part of the macrostructure of news story. The next chapter presents and discusses examples of evaluation in the selected corpus. The paper ends with conclusions.

2. Theoretical framework

News story, just like any other story, has its constituent parts. The theory of ‘news schemata’ developed by van Dijk deals with the organisational pattern of news in print media and the linguistic analysis of texts. Van Dijk (1988a: 51) distinguishes between *macrostructure* (functional units or thematic and organisational structures of texts) and *microstructure* (linguistic aspects of texts such as syntax, vocabulary, cohesive devices, etc.).

Van Dijk (1988a, 1988b) and Bell (1994) provided their own models of the organisational pattern of news. The two models are quite similar, although the terminology used does not fully overlap. For the purpose of my analysis, I developed my own model of the organisational pattern of the analysed texts, using the terminology that best reflected the purpose of my research. The model (Lakić, 2011: 52) is as follows:

1. *Headline*
2. *Lead* (summarising the main event)
3. *Main event* (elaboration of the news mentioned in the lead)
4. *Background of the event* (who, how, where and when)
5. *Verbal comment* (of the most important participants in the event)
6. *Evaluation* (attitudes, expectations and evaluation of the event by the journalist)
7. *Results of the event* (why the event is important and how serious its consequences are).

Evaluation, as a part of this macrostructure, is the functional unit in which journalists express their attitudes, opinions and evaluation of the event(s). Many believe that facts and personal opinions should not be mixed (van Dijk, 1988a: 56),

but this category is still very much present in the news, directly or indirectly. This part is actually important because it gives a meaning to the story and contributes to its coherence.

Evaluation, also known as appraisal or stance, is "... a category that features the comments, opinions and evaluations of the journalist or newspaper itself" (van Dijk, 1988a: 56).

Thompson and Hunston (2000: 5) define evaluation in the following way:

„... the broad cover term for the expression of the speaker’s or writer’s attitude or stance towards, viewpoint on, or feelings about the entities or propositions that he or she is talking about. That attitude may relate to certainty or obligation or desirability or any of a number of other sets of values.“

These sets of values are referred to as evaluation parameters (Bednarek, 2006: 3-4). Bednarek assumes that speakers can evaluate aspects of the world as:

- good or bad (the parameter of EMOTIVITY),
- important or unimportant (the parameter of IMPORTANCE),
- expected or unexpected (the parameter of EXPECTEDNESS),
- comprehensible or incomprehensible (the parameter of COMPREHENSIBILITY),
- (not) possible or (not) necessary (the parameter of POSSIBILITY),
- genuine or fake (the parameter of RELIABILITY).

She also suggests that speakers may evaluate propositions as:

- more or less reliable (RELIABILITY: LOW/MEDIAN/HIGH), and
- that they can make evaluative comments on the language that is used (the parameter of STYLE),
- on other social actors’ mental states (the parameter of MENTAL STATE), and
- on the source of their knowledge (the parameter of EVIDENTIALITY).

At the time of war, it can be assumed that readers evaluate news based on the parameters of emotivity and reliability, although the first parameter is probably the most prominent one, bearing in mind the impact of war on readers’ life. Reliability is also crucial in evaluating propositions.

Bednaek (2006: 8) claims that evaluation can be correctly understood, interpreted and analysed only from the context, adding that linguistic means of evaluation are context-dependent to a large extent and that evaluation “extend like a wave over the text and lends a specific 'evaluative prosody' to it“.

Bednarek (2006: 8) adds that such an analysis would not only pick up instances of writer evaluation but also instances where evaluation is simply quoted. She also claims that there is no clearly-defined list of linguistic means of evaluation (the co-called evaluators) that could be looked for in a large-scale corpus with the help of a computer, while an endless list of lexico-grammatical means used to

express evaluation would lead to a complicated and lengthy list of evaluators in a large corpus.

This raises the question of the possibility to identify evaluation only on the basis of overt linguistic means. This can hardly be the case, since the linguistic means used to express evaluation can be endless and hard to cope with.

Arrese, Begoň and Perucha (2006: 226) say that “news is characterized by the presence of expressions of attribution, whereby the writer acknowledges or distances him/herself from the viewpoints and assessments attributed to external voices“. They propose patterning of various linguistic resources. They analyse text taking into account engagement, writer’s stance and (inter)subjectivity. According to them, engagement includes not only the evaluative language means by which a writer or a speaker adopts a particular position or stance, but also the elements by which they interact with their potential or real audience – readers or hearers. These linguistic means are mainly evidentiality, modality or hedging (Arrese, Begoň and Perucha, 2006: 227-228).

Again, the question is whether it is really possible to define clear-cut patterns and language means based on which it is possible to deal with evaluation. Martin (2003: 177) claims that the function of evaluation in a culture cannot be understood if our studies are based, however quantitatively, on the analysis of “decontextualized” examples, while Stotesbury (2003: 331) proposes that it is not possible to notice the evaluative force of linguistic expressions in an automatic corpus-based study.

Looking from the perspective of our analysis, there are certainly linguistic means that point to evaluation and they can be identified quite easily, even without making a list of language units, which, no matter how extensive, can be limiting. Each text has its own rationale and ideas and each can, as a result, offer different units on the microlevel to express evaluation of events. On the other hand, without these linguistic units, it can be hardly possible to interpret the text, as such an analysis could easily slip into subjectivity. That is why a combination of the two is the best way.

This is certainly where the Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) has a crucial role. CDA goes beyond pure linguistic analysis and aims at using linguistic findings in order to interpret events in a certain way, taking into consideration social and other indicators that lie outside linguistics. This is why this approach is also referred to as a socio-political discourse analysis.

Fairclough (1996: 311-13) proposes three dimensions of the linguistic analysis of news: text, discursive practice and social practice. While *text analysis* offers just formal characteristics of texts including both form and meaning, *discursive practice* deals with the production, consumption and distribution of discourse under study. Constant and quick changes in our societies lead to changes in the discursive practice of the media. The third dimension, *social practice*, refers to the analysis of social and cultural events, such as the study of the political context of events and how ideology influences and contributes to social changes. This allows linguists to put any text in a certain social context.

Fairclough (1996: 314-15) also discusses the distinction between linguistic analysis and intertextual analysis of texts. According to him, linguistic analysis is

more descriptive in nature, while intertextual analysis is more interpretative and it analyses the text from the point of view of discourse practice. Fairclough advocated a connection of linguistic analysis and intertextual analysis in order to overcome the gap between text on the one hand and society and culture on the other.

However, another question comes up here. Is evaluation always so explicit that linguistic units on the micro level clearly point to its existence? My analysis has shown that evaluation, in addition to being *explicit*, can be also *implicit*. Little attention in literature has been paid to the implicit presence of evaluation in the news. Still, van Dijk (1988: 56) provides such a possibility: "Although many newsmakers share the ideological view that fact and opinion should not be mixed, the final Comments category frequently appears in the news, albeit sometimes in an indirect form."²

The literature on structuring information in news texts usually describes these parts as separate entities, although my research (Lakić, 2011) shows that a clear line between them cannot always be drawn. I have identified three possible instances of these combinations as a result of my research:

(1) Two parts of a macrostructure are combined into one sentence or a shorter paragraph, where both parts are given equal importance.

(2) One part of a macrostructure is embedded into another, whereby the embedded part is usually shorter and of less formal importance, although it can cause a change in the point of view expressed in the text.

(3) A certain part of the text can be interpreted in two ways. For example, *Headlines* may often express attitudes of journalists. In such a situation, *Headline* can be interpreted as an *Evaluation* at the same time. My research shows that this is especially true for *Evaluation*, probably because in wartime journalists try to avoid expressing their opinions openly. Instead, they express their ideas in a less direct form, mainly through *Headlines*, *Leads* or *Verbal Comments*.

While the possibilities (1) and (2) are examples of somewhat explicit evaluation, although not always very visible, because linguistic units clearly point to the explicit nature of evaluation, the third possibility clearly points to an implicit (indirect) evaluation.

These elements are identified on the basis of their functions within a text, but also bearing in mind the linguistic aspects such as lexis, syntax, semantics, discourse markers etc. In the next part we will pay attention to these possibilities.

3. Analysis

When it comes to the *explicit* presence of evaluation in the analysed papers, it is possible to identify such cases, although they do not prevail among all the instances of evaluation found in the analysed texts. Let us consider the following example:

"With refugee crisis worsening, NATO governments are under increasing pressure to show that the air bombardment is having results on the ground."
(G, Apr 3)

² Van Dijk uses here the term *Comments* for what I label as *Evaluation*, while the adjective *indirect* stands for my term *implicit*.

Here, evaluation is obvious, as the author expresses their opinion about the NATO action. The author's claim that NATO governments are under increasing pressure to show that bombardment is giving results on the ground is actually a criticism of NATO, especially in the light of the fact that such an action was not approved by the UN and has, as a result, caused some disputes within the Alliance.

In other texts, it is possible to find different anti-NATO stances. Thus, NATO aims are presented as *far from clear*. According to these texts, the Alliance offers *few specific details*. While NATO's air-raids are labelled as *an increasingly desperate attempt*, causing *disastrous mistakes*, *a sense of desperation*, *growing fear/worries*, *frustration* within the Alliance and *civilian carnage*, leading NATO to a *strategic stalemate*. Most of these elements on the micro level are noun phrases and they clearly point to a criticism of NATO coming from journalists. Here are some examples from *the Guardian*:

"There is a sense of desperation among NATO officials..." (G. Apr 1)

"Under growing pressure to demonstrate concrete results, NATO's military spokesman in Brussels has become less forthcoming about military operations." (G. Apr 1)

An explicit evaluation is obvious in the following example:

"After reciting a bitter litany of agreements betrayed..." (G, Mar 24)

This example refers to a speech of Tony Blair, the then British Prime Minister, whose aim is to justify the beginning of NATO air-strikes on Yugoslavia. The speech of the Prime Minister is referred to as *a bitter litany of agreements betrayed*. It is preceded by the verb *recite* that could be also interpreted as ironical. This position of *the Guardian* is, if not negative, definitely cautious regarding Blair's intentions.

On the other hand, there are journalists who openly express their anti-Serb stances. Thus, they say that the Serbs are *perpetrators of mass killings*, *berserk warriors* and *rogue elements*, that they *terrorize the civilian population into flight* and that they carry out *the worst massacres*, *mass killings*, *ethnic separation and expulsion* and *merciless slaughter*. The activities of the Serbian forces are even seen as *killing spree* and the activities on the field testify of the *fury of the Serb forces*. All these phrases are clear signals of evaluation in the news.

A paper dealing with the situation in Kosovo during the NATO airstrikes on Yugoslavia (Lakić, 2018: 202-203) discusses the use of various elements on the micro level to achieve a specific goal: "On the micro level, verbs, nouns and noun phrases mainly describe the Serbian forces and adjectives are mostly used to describe the condition of Albanian refugees. The two sides are represented black-and-white, the Serbs as active perpetrators of atrocities, and the Kosovar refugees are passive victims." With explicit units on the micro level, these examples represent presence of explicit evaluation in texts.

In addition, the examples above show that a ready-made list of evaluators is practically impossible to make as the context imposes a specific selection of language units on the micro-level.

We can now move to *less explicit* and *implicit* presence of *Evaluation* in text. We will first look into the option (1) when two parts of a macrostructure are combined into one sentence or a shorter paragraph, where both parts are given equal importance. Let us consider the following example from *the Guardian*:

"NATO has so far emerged from the conflict almost unscathed, but last night the US army confirmed that one of its unmanned reconnaissance aircraft had been lost." (G, Apr 8)

This example is a compound sentence where the first clause is *Evaluation*, while the second sentence is an indirect *Verbal Comment*. The adverb phrase *so far* leads to the conclusion that NATO has been almost unscathed in the conflict, but that it is not the case anymore, which is confirmed by the second clause. However, the two clauses here have an equal role and can therefore be treated as a combination of two parts of macrostructure – *Evaluation* and *Verbal Comment*.

Evaluation is also combined with *Verbal Comment* in the following example:

"Although NATO claims 'air superiority' over Yugoslavia, Sir Charles Guthrie, chief of the defence staff, acknowledged yesterday that air defence systems which include hand-held anti-aircraft missiles easy to disperse and hide still pose a threat to NATO planes." (G, Apr 20, p. 2)

The first part of the sentence, i.e. the dependent clause, is an example of *Evaluation*, although it does not seem to be the case at first glance. However, the noun phrase *air superiority* put between inverted commas points to an ironical stance of the journalist regarding NATO offensive. The remaining part of the sentence is a *Verbal Comment*.

Another option is (2) when one part of a macrostructure is embedded into another, whereby the embedded part is usually shorter and of less formal importance, although it can cause a change in the point of view expressed in the text. Here is an example from *the Independent*. The *Main Event* starts as follows:

"NATO aircraft and warships finally launched their long-awaited air offensive..." (I, Mar 25)

With the adverb *finally* and the adjective phrase *long-awaited* the journalist sends a message that can be interpreted as a support to the NATO campaign. Thus, although the purpose of this part is to present the *Main Event*, there are obvious elements in the sentence that point to the presence of *Evaluation*. This is an example of option (2), where one part of a macrostructure (*Evaluation*) is embedded into another (*Main Event*). In addition, although the embedded part is given less space, it definitely changes the tone of the sentence, shifting the emphasis from the launch of an air offensive to the support given by the author for such an action. Thus, the

sentence that would be expected to inform the readers about a NATO air offensive gains an additional element of *Evaluation*. Without the two elements, the sentence would have a neutral stance and would be a straightforward example of the *Main Event*.

Another example is a statement of George Robertson, the British Minister of Defence at the time:

“We are now concentrating our attention on the specific groups of people who are terrorising, who are obliterating villages, torturing and maiming.” (G, Mar 29)

Formally, this sentence represents *Verbal Comments*. However, the verbs *terrorise*, *obliterate*, *torture* and *maim* refer to the opposing side – the Serbs. Thus, this example illustrates a presence of *Evaluation* even within *Verbal Comments*. We do not know, though, whether the journalist approves of such verbs, but implicit *Evaluation* is definitely present. The next paragraph in this text contains the words of a NATO general who says that the military campaign will be *stepped up*, *broadened* and *intensified*. It seems that putting three or four verbs in a row is used to strengthen the effect of the actions undertaken in this conflict.

The third option covers the situation in which (3) a certain part of the text can be interpreted in two ways. For example, *Headlines* may often express attitudes of journalists. In such a situation, *Headline* can be interpreted as an *Evaluation* at the same time, although there are no explicit linguistic means that clearly point to the existence of *Evaluation*. My research shows that such combinations usually include *Evaluation*, probably because in wartime journalists try to avoid expressing their opinions openly. Instead, they express their ideas in a less direct form, mainly through *Headlines*, *Leads* or *Verbal Comments*.

Indicative of this kind of combination is the article "Two Serb jets shot down over no-fly zone", published on March 27 in *the Times*, which reports that the Serbian planes were shot down five miles within the Bosnian territory but the pilots had not been caught. It is interesting that the paper published a statement of Yugoslav foreign minister who denied that the planes had been shot down, adding that NATO had made up the story to cover up their own losses.

The same day *the Times* published another article on shooting down of an American Stealth fighter.

Headline: “Stealth fighter ‘shot down’ as Serb slaughter hundreds”

Lead: “Bombers target Serb army units. NATO tries to halt Kosovo exodus.” (T, Mar 27)

It is possible to notice immediately two interesting things in the *Headline*. First, in the second article, *shot down* is put under inverted commas, which implies that it was not a pleasant information for NATO or even that it may not have been shot actually. In addition, the second half of the *Headline* (“as Serbs slaughter hundreds”) immediately turns the attention of the readers from shooting down of

the Stealth to the action (slaughter) carried out by the Serbs. This is certainly an implicit *Evaluation* by the journalist.

Actually, both texts start with the information on shooting down the enemy's planes. However, the news about shooting down of the Serbian planes was put already in the *Lead*, but it looks like the first paragraph of the body of the article, because the real introductory paragraph does not repeat the information in the form of the *Main Event*, but starts with the Pentagon spokesperson's statement that the Yugoslav planes had been shot by American fighters. On the other hand, shooting down of the American Stealth was presented as the *Main Event*, in the first paragraph, in a text without *Lead*. What is much more striking, though, is the way in which the two pieces of information were presented.

The information on shooting down of two Serbian planes reads as follows (*Lead*):

"NATO aircraft yesterday shot down two Serb MiG29s after they flew into the United Nations no-fly zone over Bosnia."

The information on shooting down of the American Stealth was reported in the first paragraph as the *Main Event*, as follows:

"An American stealth fighter was reported to have been shot down near Belgrade last night, hours after NATO announced that it would begin low-level bombing missions against Serbian forces in response to reports of hundreds of Albanian civilians being massacred during an all-out offensive in Kosovo."

These examples show that the two events are not reported in the same way. Obviously, the news of the Serbian planes was short, but it clearly shows that NATO can take the "credit" for shooting the planes, which is why NATO is the subject of the sentence. The verb is in active voice, while the second part of the sentence provides the reason for this action.

When reporting the shooting down of the American plane, *American Stealth fighter* is subject of a passive sentence. The verb *shoot down* is put at the end of the sentence and the verb *report* is put in passive. Thus, the article does not say that "the Serbian forces shot down the American Stealth fighter". The sentence continues to set the context of the action (beginning of low-level bombing missions against Serb forces), implying that the reason for shooting down was the fact that they were flying too low. The same sentence shifts the blame to the Serbian forces who massacred hundreds of Albanian citizens in Kosovo. The link between Bosnia and Kosovo is not clear in this case. The text later reports on the Serbian actions in Kosovo, neglecting the situation with the Stealth completely. This means that the journalists tried to cover up the embarrassment with the shot Stealth with the Serbian massacres in Kosovo.

In this way, the *Headline*, *Lead* and *Main Event* in the second text clearly contain an implicit *Evaluation*. There are no obvious linguistic means that would substantiate the claim that *Evaluation* is also hidden behind the three parts of

macrostructure. Still, its presence is obvious in the manner the accident was reported, especially when analysed against the previous article on shooting down of Serbian planes.

Examples like this are numerous. *Evaluation* may also involve cases when *Verbal Comments* are put in less conspicuous positions in the text if they are not in favour of the cause supported by the journalist. The verbal comment is put in the text, which fulfils the technical requirement, but its position in the text indicates a certain extent of partiality of the journalist. Sometimes, the order of events is presented in a way which favours the side supported by the journalist. In the periods of wars, media publish false information to mislead the enemy, which is also an implicit *Evaluation*. Media are also used to present the power and the strength of the weapons used by an army, to confound the enemy. Here is an example:

“Lancers, which can fly more than 6,000 miles without refuelling, are equipped with an array of defence systems to confound enemy radar and missiles and a new bombing system which will allow NATO to destroy Serbia armour and artillery in Kosovo without the weather and visibility problems which have hampered missions so far.”

All these instances point to an implicit presence of *Evaluation*, without using any linguistic means to present it.

4. Conclusion

The presence of different parts of macrostructure in news stories is usually clear and follows some rules of journalistic profession. Still, when it comes to *Evaluation*, things are not that straightforward. *Evaluation* is the part where journalists express their opinions, attitudes or criticisms. There is abundance of descriptions in literature where *Evaluation* is clearly identified based on linguistic elements used to express it.

However, *Evaluation* is not always easy to identify, especially when no linguistic means are used to express it. That is why any attempt to produce a list of linguistic elements that point to *Evaluation* cannot be successful in dealing with all the situations where *Evaluation* appears. Each story is different and takes place in a different context, which creates various and hardly predictable linguistic possibilities of expressing one's attitude.

There are certainly cases when *Evaluation* is very evident and direct and these instances of explicit *Evaluation* are easy to cope with. The problem occurs when *Evaluation* is combined with other parts of macrostructure, i.e. when *Evaluation* appears within a sentence or paragraph next to or in combination with another part of macrostructure. However, in these instances *Evaluation* can still be identified based on linguistic means. The most problematic situation, though, is when *Evaluation* is hidden behind another part of macrostructure in a form of a meta-message. In such cases, it is possible to notice its existence only by reading “between the lines”.

Journalists resort to the latter option mainly when reporting events such as wars, accidents or disasters. These are very sensitive events that usually have a huge impact on readers, where the parameter of emotivity is the most prominent. Such situations may lead journalist to conclude that some sort of withdrawal from the story is the best position, especially if there is a danger that readers may evaluate their propositions as unreliable. This may be the reasons why *Evaluation* in such texts is mainly indirect or implicit.

Additional research on this issue can certainly identify many possible nuances of *Evaluation* and create a basis for a more consistent method in researching this part of macrostructure.

References

- Bell, Alan. *The Language of News Media*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1994.
- Bell, Alan and Garret, Peter (eds.). *Approaches to Media Discourse*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1998.
- Bednarek, Monika. *Evaluation in Media Discourse: Analysis of a Newspaper Corpus*, New York, London: Continuum, 2006.
- Curran, James and Seaton, Jean. *Power Without Responsibility*. London: Routledge, 1997.
- Fairclough, Norman. *Language and Power*. London: Longman, 1989.
- Fairclough, Norman. *Media Discourse*. London: Edward Arnold, 1995a.
- Fairclough, Norman. *Critical Discourse Analysis, the Critical Study of Language*. New York: Longman, 1995b.
- Fairclough, Norman. "Critical Analysis of Media Discourse". *Media Studies: A Reader*. Eds. Marris, Paul and Sue Thorntam. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1996. 308- 325.
- Fairclough, Norman and Wodak, Ruth. "Critical Discourse Analysis". *Introduction to Discourse Analysis*. Ed. Van Dijk, Teun. London: Sage, 1997. 258-284.
- Fowler, Roger. *Language in the News, Discourse and Ideology in the Press*. London: Routledge, 1991.
- Geoff, Peter (Ed.). *The Kosovo News and Propaganda War*. Vienna: International Press Institute, 1999.
- Hammond, Peter (Ed.). *Degraded Capability: the Media and the Kosovo Crisis*. Pluto P, 2000. Hopkinson, Nicolas. *War and Media*. London: HMSO, 1992.
- Lakić, Igor. "Media Discourse and Manipulation". *Lingvističke analize*. Eds. Perović Slavica and Vesna Bulatović. Podgorica: Institut za strane jezike, 2004. 85–96.
- Lakić, Igor. *Diskurs, mediji, rat*. Podgorica: Univerzitet Crne Gore, Institut za strane jezike, 2011.
- Lakić, Igor. (2019) "Constructing realities on war in print media discourse", *Revue roumaine de linguistique*, LXIV, 1 (2019): 99–111.
- Lakić, Igor. "Portraying refugees in British print media: the case of NATO airstrikes on Yugoslavia", *Círculo de Lingüística Aplicada a la Comunicación*, Vol. 75 (2018): 191– 214.

- Lau, Ursula, Mohamed Seedat, and Victoria McRitchie. "Discursive Constructions of the Israel-Hezbollah War: The Struggle for Representation". *The American Journal of Islamic Social Sciences* 28:2 (2011): 1 – 33.
- Marín Arrese, Isabel Juana, and Perucha Begoñ Núñez "Evaluation and Engagement in Journalistic Commentary and News Reportage". *Revista Alicantina de Estudios Ingleses* 19 (2006): 225-248
- Martin, James and Peter White. *The Language of Evaluation. Appraisal in English*. New York: Palgrave, 2005.
- Stotensbury, Hilka. "Evaluation in research article abstracts in the narrative and hard sciences". *Journal of English for Academic Purposes* 2 (2003): 327-341.
- Thompson, Geoff and Susan Hunston. "Evaluation: an introduction". *Evaluation in Text. Authorial Stance and the Construction of Discourse*. Eds. Hunston, Susan and Geoff Thompson. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Van Dijk, Teun. "Structure of News in the Press". *Discourse and Communication*. Ed. Van Dijk, Teun. Berlina: De Gruyter, 1985. 60 – 93.
- Van Dijk, Teun. *News as Discourse*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum, 1988a.
- Van Dijk, Teun. *News Analysis*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum, 1988b.
- Wodak, Ruth and Busch, Brigitta. Approaches to Media Texts. In:) *The Sage handbook of media studies*. Downing, John (Ed.). London: Sage, 2004. 105-123.
- Zoltán, Kiszely. "Media Discourse from a Contrastive Rhetoric Perspective". *Novelty*. 8(3) (2001): 4-26.



THE USE OF *WHEREAS* AND *WHEREAS* CLAUSES IN SWIFT'S *THE DRAPIER'S LETTERS*

Abstract: *Jonathan Swift (1667-1745) was actively involved in the political affairs of the Ireland of his life-time. Even though he belonged to the higher social classes, namely, the Anglo-Irish ruling minority, he sought to make the whole of the Irish population aware of their economic and political conditions, so that his "Countrymen" or "Fellow-Servants" (as he addressed the whole of the Irish) may pursue to improve their situation. In order to become closer to his intended audience, he decided to use several personae or fictional characters. One of these was the drapier, as the identity chosen in most of the series of seven Letters known as The Drapier's Letters (1724). Although he adopted many colloquial expressions and the register that a shop-keeper would employ, he was fully aware of the legal implications both of the whole issue at large and also of the particular proposals that he was making. This apparent inconsistency was meant to provide the Irish with the tools which he found necessary for them in their struggle to attain better political and economic conditions. It may be hypothesized that one of the aspects illustrating Swift's use of both colloquial language and the legal register is the connector whereas: on the one hand, as a discourse marker with its everyday meanings; on the other hand, with legal senses. The present paper seeks to explore and systematise these uses.*

Key words: *Swift's The Drapier's Letters, pragmatics, legal English, whereas, whereas clauses, legal implications.*

Introduction

The Anglo-Saxon writer Jonathan Swift (1667-1745) undertook a very active role in political affairs in the Ireland of his time. Despite being a member of the higher social classes, he struggled to improve the economic and political conditions of all the Irish, at a time when Ireland was under British sovereignty. With a view to becoming sympathetic and closer to his intended audience, in his production devoted to the Irish Question, he adopted the perspective of several *personae* or fictional characters. One of these was the *drapier*, which he used in a series of seven *Letters* (1724). Most of his political writings came as Swift's response to concrete events. *The Drapier's Letters* were composed by Swift on the occasion of the grant of a patent that enabled an individual, William Wood, to coin large sums of copper money for Ireland. This metal was going to be used instead of gold or silver, which were the metals commonly used, because at that time the value of money closely depended on the value of the metals employed. This meant, therefore, deleterious consequences for the economy of Ireland. A *drapier*, that is, a shopkeeper, represented a suitable mask not only to come as close as possible to Swift's intended audience, but to act as a perfect antagonist to a metal-dealer like Wood (Monck Mason, 1820; Temple Scott, 1903/2004; Usandizaga, 1982; Welch 2000; Martin, 2007).

This being so, however, at the same time, Swift struggled to lay clear the foundation of the claims that he put forward and that he believed could be useful in the defence of Ireland. As a matter of fact, some scholars that have undertaken the

¹ Associate professor at the University of Zaragoza (Spain).

study of these *Letters* – namely, Temple Scott 2004 (1903) – have shown that Swift must have pursued legal aid, and that he was aware of the legal intricacies of the whole issue, as well as of the proposals that he himself was suggesting. Concretely, Temple Scott remarks that Mr. Robert Lindsay, a Dublin lawyer, is believed to have helped Swift in the writing of this text, and also to have written two letters addressed to Chief Justice Whitshed on the issue of his conduct towards the grand jury that discharged Harding, the printer (1724/2004: 59, footnote n. 23).

It will be hypothesised that one of the aspects that might have been expected to illustrate the coalescence of the legal register with more colloquial uses of language is the use of the discourse marker *whereas*. The use of this connector within *The Drapier's Letters* will be studied, and its use will also be explored in other texts of the period that are closely related and entrenched with the matter under consideration. In the Appendix, we have listed the whole series of occurrences of *whereas* that will be analysed in the paper. The different contexts have been numbered, and will be referred to in the analysis.

After this overall introduction to the main topic dealt with in the paper as well as to the historical context of Swift's *The Drapier's Letters*, Section One draws on the main theoretical background that will be applied in the study. This concerns two main aspects: first, the grammatical study of the conjunction *whereas* and also the particular constructions with it employed in legal language; and second, a discussion of the main traits of legal language. It is certain that Swift's *The Drapier's Letters* is not a legal text. However, it is our contention that the Anglo-Irish author dwelled upon this register in order to substantiate his claims and his attempt to help his "Countrymen" and "Fellow-Servants". This section will particularly focus upon the uses of the so-called *whereas clauses* in legal language. After these theoretical notes, Section Two corresponds to the main part of the paper and will analyse the use by Swift of both the conjunction *whereas* and the *whereas clauses*. Finally, the main conclusions reached in our study will be presented.

1. Theoretical background

For the writing of the present paper, two main theoretical contexts have been taken into consideration, together with the literary, cultural, political and socio-historical context where *The Drapier's Letters* has to be inserted – referred to in the previous section: functional grammar and the study of legal language.

Quirk *et al.* (1985/1991) note down that *whereas* is one of the subordinating conjunctions that may introduce only finite clauses. *Whereas* may connect concessive clauses and also clauses of contrast, which convey this type of relationship between two clauses. It is regarded as a formal sort of conjunction, and it calls for an antithesis or a contrast of some kind between the two situations that it links.

Legal language may be characterised not just by lexical and semantic features. As authors such as Alcaraz (1994/2002), Alcaraz and Hughes (2002, 1993/2003), or Borja Albi (2000) have shown, morphologic, syntactic, discourse and stylistic features are also important to define the way legal texts are constructed. These features will be briefly referred to next, before concentrating upon the so-called *whereas clauses*.

Legal English is an extremely peculiar and complex variety of language. From the point of view of its lexical and semantic features, Legal English may generally be characterised by its *obscurity* (Alcaraz, 2002). The main lexical and semantic features of Legal English have to do with the following aspects (Alcaraz and Hughes, 2002; Alcaraz, 1994): the use of Latinisms; the existence of terms of French or Norman origin; a formal register and an archaic diction; the selection of certain archaic adverbs and prepositional phrases; redundancy, by using doublets and triplets; the frequent appearance of performative verbs and verbs of an empirical meaning; the preference for certain euphemisms instead of more literal expressions; the use of certain colloquial words and phrases; the presence of abbreviated forms of language; the ascription of a semi-technical meaning to certain adjectives when used in a juridical context; or the use of nominalisations.

The language used in law is characterised by “*lexical vagueness* and *syntactic ambiguity*” (Alcaraz and Hughes, 2002: 30), which lie at the core of many of the difficulties raised by the interpretation and translation of legal texts. From the point of view of lexis and semantics, *vagueness* is reflected in the use of certain rhetorical functions, such as definitions; in the relationship between connotation and denotation, and the implications that both may have in the selection of a definite register; in lexical categories such as polysemy, homonymy, synonymity, antonymy, hyperonymy and hyponymy, or false cognates and false friends; and finally in phenomena connected with the use of certain resources of figurative language (Alcaraz and Hughes 2002; Alcaraz 1994).

Following Alcaraz and Hughes (2002) and Alcaraz (1994), as well as Borja Albi (2000), some of the main features of the morphology and syntax of Legal English are summarised next: first, unusually long sentences; second, the anfractuosity of English legal syntax; third, an abundant use of the passive voice, including constructions not frequently found elsewhere; fourth, conditionals and hypothetical formulations; fifth, the simple syntax of plain judicial narrative; sixth, the use of the suffixes *-er (or)* and *-ee* to refer to the active and the passive parties in legal relationships; seventh, the frequency of gerundive constructions; eighth, a somehow peculiar use of the conjunction *that*; ninth, the scarcity of connectors; tenth, the repetition of certain words and syntactic constructions that is avoided in Spanish; eleventh, insufficient and even inadequate punctuation. Other features pointed at by Borja Albi (2000) are the following: the abundant number of nominalisations followed with postmodifications; the use of special determiners with premodification; certain peculiar verbal groups; and the appearance of certain adverbs in initial position as connectors. Another feature, also briefly referred to when speaking about the lexical and semantic archaisms present in legal English, has to do with the use of *-th* as an ending in the third singular person in the simple present tense, which may also be approached as a morphologic archaism.

More concretely, and directly connected with the issue under study in this paper, the *West's Encyclopaedia of American Law* notes that the word *whereas*, as used in legal matters, traces its origin to Middle English. This work also refers to several meanings of this connector which can be used in law: first, it can mean “on the contrary”; second – and more closely associated to the uses that we shall find in

the *corpus* under study – it may be used as the introductory word to a *recital* in a formal document.

Recitals correspond to the introductory words of certain legal documents, such as *contracts, statutes, resolutions or proclamations*. For instance, in a *contract*, *whereas clauses* are introductory statements with the meaning of “considering that” or “that being the case”, so that they explain the reasons why the contract is executed or celebrated, therefore describing its purpose. The West Encyclopaedia also signals that *whereas clauses* may be used in *court orders* before those clauses that contain the directions of the court. The content and composition of these *whereas clauses* will let the public know the reasons why a certain resolution is published.

No matter if they are not actually regarded as essential components of the operative provisions of those legal documents, these *whereas clauses* may be used for the *interpretation or construction* of such texts. Each of these clauses should contain a statement of fact logically related to the intent or purpose of the resolution. They may correspond, therefore, to the preamble of the resolution. On the whole, these *whereas clauses* explain the reasons why this resolution will be adopted and also justify the needs for it.

In the following sections of this essay, the use of *whereas* and also of *whereas clauses* in Swift's *The Drapier's Letters* will be analysed. Possible kinds and meanings conveyed by these constructions will catered for, in both the aspects of the text which are intended for a lay, non-specialised readership, on the one hand, and on the other hand, in those fragments which deal with the legal intricacies of the whole issue, and in whose writing Swift must have sought legal advice. On the whole, it can be expected that both *whereas* and also *whereas clauses* will appear in a variety of contexts.

2. Analysis of *whereas* and *whereas clauses* in Swift's *The Drapier's Letters* and in related works

We start this section with a note on the corpus selected and the methods applied in this study.

2.1 A note on the corpus selected for the study and on the method followed

The corpus that has been used for the analysis has been taken from the critical edition of Swift's *The Drapier's Letters* signed by Temple Scott (1903/2004) and which, as noted in the reference section, may currently be found at two different Internet websites. For the purposes of the present paper, the selection of the items to be analysed has included not only those samples that actually belong to Swift's *The Drapier's Letters*. The reason for such a choice is grounded on the fact that in the Appendices of the edition used, several texts which have a close relationship with the matter at stake in Swift's work have been included. These are contemporary to Swift's work, and have to do with original material and historical documents that are being referred to in the *Letters*. Therefore, they are certainly endowed with unmistakably historical interest, because they enable readers to further contextualise the matter being discussed. Besides, some of these documents have to

do with legal matters. Consequently, in our view, these texts may offer insights on the use of *whereas* and *whereas* clauses at Swift's time, both in legal texts and in other text types. The corpus used compiles the whole of the instances of the use of *whereas* in both the text of Swift's *Drapiers Letters* and the appendices referred to in this critical edition.

The list of the utterances that have been used for the analysis has been included as an Appendix to the paper. A somehow larger sample of the context where they appear has been quoted, so that the use and meaning of *whereas* can be adequately grasped in the corresponding context. Therefore, the corpus includes, on the one hand, samples from those *Letters* by the Drapier where instances of *whereas* may be found (either as a conjunction or as part of the so-called *whereas clauses* of legal texts), namely, Letters II ("To Mr. Harding, the Printer"), III ("To the Nobility and Gentry of the Kingdom of Ireland"), IV ("To the Whole People of Ireland"), and V ("A Letter to Lord Chancellor Middleton"), as well as the so-called "Seasonable Advice". On the other hand, the contexts where *whereas* has been found in the different appendices of this edition have been included, for the reason commented upon above. Concretely, these refer to a report made by Sir Isaac Newton on the composition of Wood's coinage (Quotation 15), letters to the Honourables who had to determine on the issue at stake (16 and 17), the Presentment of the Grand Jury of the County of the City of Dublin (Appendix V), and also the Proclamation against the Drapier (Appendix VI), and finally a fragment of the way in which the case was presented to the Parliament (Appendix VIII). These will be commented upon next.

2.2. Analysis (I): The Letters. – Letter II: TO MR. HARDING THE PRINTER

The first instances of the uses of *whereas* can be traced in Letter II (vid. quotations 1 to 4, in the section APPENDIX: CORPUS OF THE INSTANCES ANALYSED; henceforth, Appendix). This Letter was addressed by the drapier, M.B., to Harding, the printer of the First Letter, and who would eventually undertake to publish the whole of the series of the Letters written by Swift under the *persona* of the drapier. It has also been regarded by critics as a sort of introduction to the fourth letter of the same series, *To the Whole People in Ireland*, as well as for a response and preparation of the public mind for the report that the Privy Council – a consultative body formed by prestigious people who undertakes to advise the King of Britain – was about to issue concerning Wood's coinage of copper money. This epistle was published on August 6, 1724, shortly after news appeared in several Dublin papers that the inquiry of Wood's coinage, ordered by a Committee of the Council in London, had found in Wood's favour and would soon be made public in an official report. Not only does Swift criticise the assay itself, but he also intends this *Letter* to counterargue Wood's proposed compromise that no more than £40,000 of copper would be minted, which Swift regarded as a real threat to the economy and welfare of Ireland.

To begin with, *whereas* (vid. Q. 1) is used to draw an effective contrast between the speaker himself, under the persona of the drapier, on the one hand, and on the other hand, his antagonist Wood, a metal trader. What is more, the speaker as a shopkeeper has sought to know the opinions of traders and other people. Likewise, instances of the lexis associated with computation can be traced in the work, which will also be a constant, recurrent trait in some other works by Swift on the Irish

Question. Here, it is interesting to see that this preference for exactness and precision is applied to the number of people actually inhabiting Ireland at the time ("computed to be one million and a half"). Thus, it is important for the speaker to find out the actual requirements for coinage that would be necessary in Ireland. It is to this precise computation of money ("will amount only to five and twenty thousand pounds") that the much larger amount of coinage of copper that Wood must have planned to introduce in Ireland is contrasted against. It is this comparison that is introduced by means of *whereas*, which in this context has its habitual meaning of the expression of a contrast. Besides the number of people in Ireland ("two hundred and fifty thousand families") is balanced against one single individual, Wood, who is moreover ironically defined as "... whereas this honest liberal hardwareman". Therefore, the word *whereas* also enhances the ironic characterisation of the Drapier's antagonist and target of his attack. Needless to say, for Swift or the Irish Wood was furthest from being either "honest" or "liberal". The role of irony in Swift's writings has consistently been shown by criticism (e.g., Eilon, 1988; Bullit, 1961).

Soon after, Letter II focuses upon one of the proposals actually made by Wood, who claims to have coined a certain quantity of copper money, which is then harshly criticised by the Drapier (vid. Q.2). This is one of the instances that may be said to embrace a twofold meaning, both signalling contrast and at the same time pointing at a sort of initial situation. Thus, Wood's proposals take into account certain initial conditions, which come under the subordinate clause introduced with the conjunction *whereas*. In the context, it equals and may have been substituted for by "considering that", or "taking into account that". At the same time, however, the concessive meaning is not really lost. It is altogether clear from context that. On the whole, the meaning intended to be conveyed is that the Drapier makes it clear that Wood has not any intention to stop his trade of coining brass or copper money for Ireland, which means the ruin of the whole country.

A word that recurs in this and in the following passages (vid. Q.3, Q.4) is *proposal*, and in the two cases it is used to refer to one that has been put forward by Wood, the antagonist of the Drapier and indeed the main target that Swift seeks to criticise in these *Letters*. For readers familiar with Swift's works – in particular, those connected with "the Irish Question", and even more so with *A Modest Proposal* (1729) – it will perhaps not be hard to associate those expressions with Swift's 1729 desperate work. Similar words can be found in works by Swift, not only in those dealing with political matters, but also in the Third of the *Voyages* made by Gulliver, or in *A Tale of a Tub*: thus, lexical items such as *project*, *projector*, *undertaker*, *proposal*, or *scheme* (to name just a few representative instances) are usually endowed with very negative connotations. In general, these have to do with a recurrent topic in Swift's work, as is the criticism of the blind faith in progress and in science, which for the Anglo-Irish author may have led into the neglect of the deleterious consequences that mankind's actions may eventually have.

In this context, therefore, it should not come as a surprise that the patent granted to Wood and the subsequent actions undertaken by him are referred to as "proposals": as a consequence, they are endowed with the most negative kind of connotations and encyclopaedic meaning that may have been expected from Swift.

What Swift aims to achieve is, then, to arouse the most energetic reaction of refusal amongst the whole population of Ireland.

After the reference to Wood's first proposal, a more generic allusion to the whole of the projects put forward by the ironmonger follows, and which Swift, under the persona of the Drapier, seeks to undermine (Q.3). Here, Swift charges his opponent Wood with "perfect high treason". As in many other instances and highly characteristic of Swift's style (Downie, 1984; Ward, 1973; Speck, 1969; Bullit, 1961; Davis, 1964, 1947; Quintana, 1948/1964), a hypothetical-deductive process of reasoning is followed, where Swift makes use of devices such as the logical syllogism, and its rhetorical counterpart, the enthymeme. The conclusion of such a logical and rhetorical reasoning process is introduced by the words "by which it is plain". Here, we find a significant enough use of the term *whereas*, in so far as it is employed with its more general meaning that denotes contrast, but yet it appears in a context where both reference to legal matters and also the use of other features characteristic of legal texts are not scarce. Thus, in these fragments (Q.2, 3 & 4) we find the use of archaisms (such as the verbal form *hath*); the use of the subjunctive mood and of conditional clauses ("unless the *exigencies of trade require* it"; "if it be offered"), or the use of the modal auxiliary *shall* with grammatical persons other than the first one, and in order to convey obligation ("He promises, that no person *shall* be obliged to receive more than fivepence halfpenny of his coin in one payment"). Not only can we find these morphological and syntactic traits characteristic of legal language. The use of technical terms of the legal register can also be traced, in words such as *prerogative by law*, or *claim such a power*.

A new reference to the patent that enables Wood to coin copper money for Ireland as *a proposal* can be found soon after (vid. Q.4). If, on the one hand, we have just seen a profuse employ of terms and constructions characteristic of legal texts; now, on the other hand, we can associate this mention of the patent with expressions that typically recur in many other texts by Swift. This is the case of phrases such as the following: "Perhaps I have been too tedious" – also found in "The Story of the Injured Lady" (Swift, 1707); "melancholy subject", or "humbly offering one proposal" – found in works such as *A Modest Proposal* (Swift, 1729). Likewise, Swift's mastery of language and also of multiple registers is observed in the polysemic use of the word *judicious* in his next words: "Let some skilful *judicious* pen draw up an advertisement to the following purpose". Thus, on the one hand, *judicious* may refer to what is sensible or reasonable; on the other hand, it is applied to something that is connected or related to law, to legal matters. We feel that in this passage both interpretations may be possible.

This is precisely the context where new instances of the use of *whereas* may be traced. As a matter of fact, the proposal that Swift (or the Drapier) will put forward next, which will be fully sensible and common-sensical (in contrast to what will happen in *A Modest Proposal*), will be worded through a series of *whereas clauses*. In our view, such a listing of *whereas clauses* imitates the sort of register to be found in certain legal texts, such as resolutions. Thus, *Webster's Online Dictionary* and *West's Encyclopedia of American Law* note the following about this use of *whereas*:

WHEREAS: considering that; it being the case, since; -- used to introduce a preamble which is the basis of declarations, affirmations, commands, requests, or like, that follow (Webster's). In the law the term *whereas* also is used as the introductory word to a recital in a formal document. A recital contains words of introduction to a contract, statute, proclamation, or other writing.

The passage found in Q.4 reproduces, therefore, the style of a legal text, through the use of different *whereas clauses*. It must have been intended to endow the Drapier's statement of the main aspects concerning Wood's case with the precise level of formality. Moreover, it cannot be forgotten that, in writing *The Drapier's Letters*, Swift purports to achieve the withdrawal of the patent that had been granted to Wood, an objective that he will eventually accomplish. For this reason, he does not hesitate to employ a register – that of legal language – which is indeed one of the most formal registers of the language. And this is so even though, we could say, this breaks or suspends the verisimilitude endowed to the *persona* of the Drapier, which Swift had devised with a view to reaching his intended readership. However, at the same time, Swift must have intended to furnish his "Countrymen" and "Fellow-Servants" with arguments powerful and valid enough, so that they may eventually achieve to turn down the prerogative that had been conceded to Wood. The proposals put forward by the Drapier, then, resemble the preamble or recitals of a contract. This also demonstrates the Drapier's (and certainly, Swift's) commitment with the task of helping his "Countrymen" and "Fellow-Servants" and furnishing them with suitable arguments to attack Wood's patent.

2.3. Analysis (II): *The Letters. Letter III: "TO THE NOBILITY AND GENTRY OF THE KINGDOM OF IRELAND"*

It may be argued that the intended addressees of Letter III, "To the Nobility and Gentry of the Kingdom of Ireland", surpass those social groups referred to in the title, as the Drapier's claims will embrace the whole nation. Indeed, this Letter contains some of the best-known arguments by Swift addressed to all the Irish: "Were not the people of Ireland born as free as those of England? (...) Am I a freeman in England, and do I become a slave in six hours by crossing the Channel?" (p. 37). Here, we shall find uses of *whereas* and of *whereas clauses* both in the body of the "Letter", and also in the notes introduced in connection with it.

The first reference to the patent granted to Wood that reflects the use of *whereas* is shown in Q. 6. Its everyday, general meaning allows the Drapier to draw a clear contrast between the value of the copper money coined by Wood for Ireland and the value of the money coined in British mints. As critics have noted, this is indeed one of the main issues at stake in the whole controversy: at the time the value of money was directly related to the material in which it was coined. Therefore, it made a whole difference depending on whether it was coined in gold or silver – as was currently being done, and was certainly the case in Britain – or in copper, as Wood purported to do for Ireland.

The fragment quoted in Q.7 deepens precisely into this particular aspect. The arguments of those who oppose Wood's patent are then endowed with legitimacy, in

so far as it is the Parliament itself that has come to “represent this grant to be «destructive of trade, and dangerous to the properties of the people»”. This may even be more interesting if it is borne in mind that at the time the Irish Parliament was fully dependent on the British: it could not even assemble without the previous permission granted by Britain. It may also be emphasised how Swift – who socially belonged to the upper classes, and, most important of all, was a member of the Anglo-Irish ruling minority, felt the need that Ireland had to overcome its divisions (be they political, social, economic or religious), and indeed undertook the task to struggle for the union of his “Fellow-Servants” and “Countrymen”, in most of his political writings.

Furthermore, the discussion has to be set against the context of a contrast that is drawn between the patent granted to Wood, on the one hand, and on the other hand, previous patents that had allowed particular individuals the coinage of money. Swift will reach the conclusion that the system was fully deleterious for the Irish economy, and avowed for an Irish central bank, or a mint where money could be coined. This was one of the most important aspects in which, together with the political submission to the British regime, Ireland had become “a depending kingdom”. Wood’s patent is, in this context, compared to previous patents that had been allowed to coin money for Ireland. This is the message conveyed through *whereas* in this context, which therefore retains its everyday meaning, as a way to draw a contrast.

Soon after, Swift (or the Drapier) goes a step further, and in a much more explicit manner than before, his discussion focuses upon the legal intricacies that are involved in the granting of patents to coin money (Q.8). He does so by even questioning the King’s authority to grant a patent to an individual, an aspect that he will retake afterwards: his claim – expressed in a form of enthymeme – is that, had the King known or realised that the patent was deleterious for his most loyal servants, the Irish, he would not have allowed such a thing. Indirectly, then, he comes to compromise the King, and makes him ultimately responsible for the situation.

Swift’s boldness comes even further, by openly questioning the British legal system as a whole, which, because of the fact that it is based on common law, relies on precedents. Thus, the precedent that Swift makes reference to that situation which might have resembled the current one at his own time occurred at a moment of rebellion against Queen Elizabeth I. The use of *whereas* enables him to come back to his own time and situation. It is perhaps significant that this time the subordinate clause introduced by it has been somehow isolated from its main clause, in so far as a strong punctuation (colon), has been used, in order to contrast that time, of the sixteenth century, with Swift’s own time, of the eighteenth. It is as if Swift were implicitly – and boldly – trying to draw apart the two historical moments, and as if he were attempting to ground his claims on the coinage of money as a means to avoid rebellion against the King. Again, therefore, we find a use of *whereas* with its commonest meaning of drawing a contrast in a fully legal and political context.

His questioning of the legal system also has consequences in the most immediate context of the Report issued by a committee designated by the Privy Council. This is so because the Privy Council is a consultative organism of the British

legal system that is formed by barristers and other important advisors, and which may be sitting at the King's request, in order to provide him with advice that may ground and orient his decisions.

The doctrine of the *precedents* characteristic of the common law that represents one of the main sources of law, together with equity, is then challenged with regard to the differences that Swift and the Drapier see between the patent granted to Wood and previous patents (Q.9). In this sense, it should not be forgotten that the British legal system as a whole relies upon the doctrine of the binding precedent, which is in fact one of its main sources. Only can the *ratio decidendi* from a court of record create *binding precedent*. Through this doctrine of binding precedent the decisions made by the higher courts in the hierarchy are bound and compulsory on the courts below them. This is so because consistency is called to play an essential role. What *consistency* means is that similar cases should be treated alike. Therefore, the decision adopted by a certain court shall be consistent with decisions in previous cases, and at the same time, it will also confer certainty for future cases. This procedure should also provide people with certainty when arranging their affairs, and will make the courts' opinion be regarded as reliable. Even though it is a fundamental pillar of the British legal system, the doctrine of binding precedent is based on the Latin maxim "Stare decisis et non quieta movere". A somehow loose or free translation of the maxim could read as follows: *stand by what has been decided and do not unsettle the established*. All in all, it means that a decision made in one case is binding on all following cases of similar fact in lower courts (Alcaraz 1994/2002; Poor, 1971). It is likewise interesting to note that the clause introduced by *whereas* is used with its usual meaning of contrast, even though it appears in a context that deals with the legal implication. Furthermore, it actually raises the main point of the controversy, no matter if it introduces a subordinate clause.

2.4. Analysis (III): The Letters. Letter IV: "A Letter to the Whole People of Ireland"

This Letter is interesting in so far as it does not only focus upon the issue of the copper money, but pursues to make the Irish aware of their own condition and situation. Swift wrote it under the persona of the Drapier so that his "Countrymen" and "Fellow-Servants" would become aware of their right to freedom, and would also strive for the consecution of the same rights as the citizens of Britain.

One of the aspects dealt with by the Drapier in this *Letter* is the discussion and his refusal of the status of Ireland as "a depending kingdom" (Q.12). In this case, the clause introduced by *whereas* is again enhanced and emphasised, as it actually puts forward the main point upheld by the speaker. It shows, therefore, the *counter-argument* that contradicts such a status, and gives way to the conclusion that Swift must have intended his primary readers to assimilate: "and Ireland is on the contrary called in some statutes an «imperial crown»". Graphically, it is also significant to note that the clause introduced by *whereas* is preceded and followed by a strong punctuation mark (a semicolon ;), so that it is somehow treated as if it were indeed a main clause. Swift's purpose is definitely here to undermine and argue against the status of Ireland as being dependent on England, while he strives

to make his target readership aware of the fact that they should struggle to achieve their freedom and independence.

2.5. *Analysis (IV): Seasonable Advice to the Grand Jury, Concerning the Bill Preparing Against the Printer of The Drapier's Fourth Letter*

The "Seasonable Advice" was published after the Fourth Letter, and because of the fact that the printer of the previous letters, Harding, had been imprisoned. It is addressed to the Grand Jury who has to hear the charges presented against the printer and whose members are lay-people – that is, lacking any specific training in legal matters, following the British legal system. It was devised by Swift with a view to influencing their decision, and indeed he was successful in doing so. Even though it is itself presented unsigned, and is therefore anonymous, anybody familiar not only with the controversy raised around Wood's half-pence, but also with the active role taken by Swift, would have no doubts in ascribing it to him. No matter if a reward of three hundred pounds had been offered, for whomever that might have given Swift away, nobody betrayed him.

Despite the fact that the members of the jury must have been lay-people, as has just been noted, the language used comes close to the register of a legal text. Be it as it may, only one use of *whereas* has been registered in this piece (Q.13). It is used to draw a contrast between two main groups of people: on the one hand, the members of the jury, who are acting selflessly, and most of whom actually happen to be merchants and shopkeepers, and therefore, may come close to or at least be sympathetic with the drapier's situation; on the other hand, those who seek to influence or even entice them.

2.6. *Analysis (V): The Letters. Letter V: A Letter To The Lord Chancellor Middleton*

Letter V represents the last part of the series of Letters where some use of *whereas* has been traced. This time, the speaker gives up the perspective of a shopkeeper – as had been recurrent in the previous letters, and refers to himself as "a member" or "a lawyer" (p.68). Just to offer an instance, even in the previous writing, the *Seasonable Advice to the Grand Jury*, the speaker had endeavoured to identify himself as a shopkeeper and accordingly establish a distance between himself and the members of his class, or even the Jury – formed up by laypeople, on the one hand, and the Lord Justice, on the other hand. Now, he declares to take this perspective in order to speak with the utmost respect and with no purpose of drawing on a controversy: "My Lord, I desire you will consider me as a member who comes in at the latter end of a debate; or as *a lawyer* who speaks to a cause, when the matter hath been almost exhausted by those who spoke before" (p. 68, my italics). In contrast to the rest of *Letters*, Letter V, addressed to Lord Middleton, is signed by "J.S.", that is, by Jonathan Swift himself.

No matter if, as has just been seen, the speaker has compared himself to a lawyer, yet only one instance of the use of *whereas* has been traced, and moreover, it has a clearly concessive meaning (Q.14): thus, despite the existence of "a malicious report", such a report was "false and groundless".

2.7. Analysis (VI): Paratext (I): the Appendices

The Appendices found in the edition issued by Temple Scott, employed in the present essay, illustrate some of the main aspects that Swift developed in his series of *Letters*. As before, we have selected those fragments in which some use of *whereas* has been made. In our view, because of the fact that some fragments actually pertain to legal texts, they may exemplify the use made of *whereas* in this sort of register at the time.

The first sample (Q. 15) corresponds to a fragment of the Report made by Isaac Newton, Edward Southwell and Thomas Scroope on the composition of the coinage issued by Wood. Such coinage is compared to those issued thanks to previous patents in different moments of history, in the reigns of King Charles II, James II, William III and Queen Mary, respectively. Therefore, *whereas* is used to draw the contrast between the coinages issued at those moments in history, on the one hand, and Wood's coinage, on the other hand.

The same may be said of Q. 16 and 17, which reproduce some fragments of Letters addressed to "the Right Honourable". The first of these Letters upholds the role of the King, within a historical context, with a view to showing that in contrast to tyrannical princes, clement leaders were never blamed for clemency or for the pious acts that they may have undertaken. Once more, the Drapier intends to get the King involved and even defy and compromise his role.

In the second Letter, the word 'counsel' is explained, so that a contrast is drawn between the counsel of a king, on the one hand, and the counsel of a juror, on the other hand. Thus, even though this aspect of the Letter dwells upon aspects that have a legal application, it is the meaning of contrast contributed by *whereas* that pervades. Therefore, we find this general meaning of *whereas* in a legal register or context, so that legal terminology and expressions are used: *finding or not finding; sworn to keep secret; Latinisms, such as *billa vera or ignoramus*, or archaisms of the kind of *hereafter*.*

The last three examples selected from the Appendices – namely, Q. 18 to 20 – are taken from texts that may have been regarded as purely legal, and which are related to the whole case or process against the Drapier. These are, namely: "The Presentment of the Grand Jury of the County of the City of Dublin"; the "Proclamation against the Drapier by the Lord-Lieutenant and Council of Ireland"; and, finally, "Ireland's Case Humbly Presented to the Honourable the Knights, Citizens, and Burgesses in Parliament Assembled".

A *presentment* is defined by the electronic edition of the Merriam-Webster Dictionary consulted in the following terms: "the act of presenting to an authority a formal statement of a matter to be dealt with; *specifically*: the notice taken or statement made by a grand jury of an offense from their own knowledge without a bill of indictment laid before them". *Whereas* has been typically used in the manner of that conjunction which puts forward the context where a resolution will be indicted next; and therefore, with a fully legal sense.

The Proclamation reproduces the actual legal document that was issued, in which a reward was offered for that individual that might have been ready to betray the Drapier. Even so, (as shown above) nobody gave Swift away. Moreover, the Proclamation against the Drapier shows other features characteristic of legal texts,

such as the following: the use of grammatical archaisms (the use of *ye* instead of *the*; *hath* as the verbal form for the third singular person of the simple present of *to have*); the use of lexical archaic words, such as "intituled"; the use of repetitions, in the form of doublets, of the kind of "printed and published", or "publish and declare"; the use of archaic adverbs and prepositions, such as *hereby*, *hereof*, *thereby*. *Shall* has been used in the third person, in order to establish an obligation. The punctuation is likewise scarce, in the use of long clauses which are accompanied by plenty of coordination and subordination. Even so, sometimes the punctuation follows rules that are more akin to other Germanic languages, such as German: for instance, a comma has been used before the introduction of a subordinate noun clause introduced by the conjunction *that*. Finally, some words of everyday use acquire a more specific meaning in the text, as is the case of semi-technical terms used in the legal register. This is the case of the word *given*, with the meaning of "proclaimed", or "issued".

Very similar features can be appreciated in the fragment corresponding to Q.20, the Presentment of Ireland's Case in Parliament. *Whereas* is used in order to introduce the premises that will be taken into consideration in order to formulate the declaration that will be proclaimed in the assembly of Parliament. It has, therefore, a legal meaning. Once more, other features of legal texts can be traced, such as the following: the use of long clauses, with plenty of coordination, subordination and embedded clauses; or the use of morphologic and syntactic archaisms, such as *sheweth*.

2.8. Analysis (VII): Paratext (II): the Footnotes

In some of the footnotes of the edition followed, different texts related to the controversy have been included. They reproduce actual documents issued in connection with some particular aspects of the patent granted to Wood. All three footnotes that will be analysed are found in Letter III, "To the Nobility and Gentry of the Kingdom of Ireland".

The first of these documents, reproduced in Q.5, corresponds to a Letter issued by the Archbishop of Dublin. It shows the difficulties that the Parliament of Ireland must have faced in important occasions, even to assemble. This was so because a preliminary authorisation of the Parliament sitting in London was compulsory. In this context, *whereas* is used to show the contrast between two hypothetical situations, which are differentiated depending on whether the Parliament had been sitting or not.

The second piece, found in Q. 10 (from footnote 15, to Letter III) corresponds to a report commented upon by Monck Mason, author of a *History and Antiquities of the Collegiate and Cathedral Church of St. Patrick near Dublin from its Foundation in 1190, to the Year 1819*. The argument put forward by this author credits Swift's central claim in his *Drapier's Letters* that the only coinage accepted was that of gold or silver. If such coinage were not possible, tracking commodities was even found preferable. As a matter of fact, this will be a solution also accepted by Swift. The constructions formed with *whereas* found in this fragment establish contrasts, either between what was done before and what is currently being done; or between the situation of coinage between England and Britain at the time. This fragment is also

interesting because it reflects another of the critical standpoints adopted by Swift throughout the whole of his production devoted to the Irish Question, namely, his harsh criticism of the Irish gentlemen and nobility who preferred to live in England, even though their possessions were mostly in Ireland.

The third fragment, corresponding to Q. 11 (footnote 20, to Letter III), reproduces several advertisements made public by certain tradesmen, who declared to be unrelated to or have nothing to do with Wood's patent for the coinage of copper money for Ireland. In these advertisements, *whereas* is used in order to show preliminary conditions, premises or hypothetical situations. Once more, in the same contexts, other features of legal texts have been traced, such as the use of performative verbs and also of archaic adverbs and prepositions, as in "do hereby declare"; the use of long clauses and sentences, with a great deal of subordination and embedded clauses. Among such embedded clauses, we have found new instances of the use of subordinate *that*-clauses that have been preceded and separated from the main clause by means of a comma, as in: "And we do further declare, *that* we will not directly or indirectly, be anyways concerned with the said Wood's halfpence or farthings;". What is more, even the signers of these texts refer to them as *resolutions*: "And of this my resolution I gave notice to the person who sent me the bills of lading, (...)".

3. Results and discussion

The analysis just carried out may be synthesised in the following table:

TEXT	USE OF <i>WHEREAS</i>		
	Contrast	Legal meaning	Ambiguous
Drapier's Letter II	(Q.1) (Q.3), in a legal context	(Q.4)	(Q.2)
Drapier's Letter III	(Q.6) (Q.7) (Q.8), in a legal context (Q.9), in a legal context		
Drapier's Letter IV	(Q.12), in a legal context		
Seasonable Advice	(Q.13), in a legal context		
Drapier's Letter V	(Q.14), in a legal context		
Appendix II: Report	(Q. 15)		
Appendix IV: Letter	(Q. 16)		
Appendix IV: Second Letter	(Q.17), in a legal context		
Appendix V: Presentment of the Grand Jury		(Q.18)	
Appendix VI: Proclamation against the Drapier		(Q. 19)	
Appendix VIII: Ireland's Case Presented (...) In Parliament (...)		(Q.20)	
Footnote 4 to Letter III	(Q.5), in a legal context		
Footnote 15 to Letter III	(Q.10): 2 instances of <i>whereas</i> expressing contrast		
Appendix VIII: Ireland's Case Presented (...) In Parliament (...)			
Footnote 4 to Letter III	(Q.5), in a legal context		
Footnote 15 to Letter III	(Q.10): 2 instances of <i>whereas</i> expressing contrast		
Footnote 20 to Letter III		Q.11, footnote 20, 1st. and 2nd. advertisements	Footnote 20 to Letter III

The results summarised in the table above show that in the text of Swift's *The Drapier's Letters* there is a remarkable tendency to use *whereas* with its meaning of contrast, as is characteristic of general English and everyday prose. We should like to account for this in the following general aspects: it must be borne in mind that, no matter if Swift was dealing with a subject matter that inevitably had legal implications, his intended readership was indeed the common public. Therefore, Swift's main concern was that the message could reach the whole of his intended *audience*, as he used to say, the whole of the Irish, whom he regarded as and addressed to as his "Countrymen" and "Fellow-Servants". Consequently, he must have assumed that the acquaintance with legal matters of the average, prototypical "Fellow-Servant" was scarce. For this reason, he undertook to explain the whole matter, including its legal implications, in such a manner that his message could be understandable by everybody.

This factor of the *intended audience* also accounts for the fact that, even in those parts of the text that are addressed to those who may be regarded as "legal subjects", most uses of *whereas* that have been spotted remain close to its everyday meaning of contrast. In our view, this is so because the members of the jury were lay-people, following the characteristics of the British legal system. What is more, it is said that many of its members were shopkeepers and traders. Therefore, the speaker's *intention* is make them stand on his side: he does not seek so much to train them in legal matters, as to show them clearly the standpoint that they are expected to uphold.

In our view, another reason that accounts for this pre-eminence of the use of *whereas* with its everyday meaning of contrast, even in contexts where legal matters are dealt with, may be related to the *genre* of the texts studied. Thus, it may be noted that, no matter if a topic which has legal implications is being addressed by Swift in his *Drapier's Letters*, the text cannot really be regarded as legal, strictly speaking. In this sense, it is remarkable to find that *whereas* has tended to maintain its usual sense of contrast even in some of those contexts where a particular legal aspect or implication has been commented upon.

A further aspect that enhances these results has to do with the comparison with the appendices that have been referred to. These have been the following: the "Presentment of the Grand Jury of the County of the City of Dublin", the "Proclamation against the Drapier" and "Ireland's Case Humbly Presented to the Honourable the Knights, Citizens, and Burgesses in Parliament Assembled". Therefore, these may be regarded as legal or administrative texts. It is in those texts that the instances of *whereas* with a legal meaning, distinct from its everyday senses, have been traced.

Conclusions

To sum up the above discussion, let us say that in *The Drapier Letters*, on the one hand, Swift adopts the persona of a shopkeeper, which enables him to become close to the problems that his intentional or primary addressees had to face. On the other hand, he also sought legal advice and showed himself to be concerned about the legal implications of the claims that he was putting forward. A particular

consequence is connected with the uses of the word *whereas*, in so far as this must have meant that we may expect uses of *whereas* both in legal and everyday English contexts. We have drawn on those uses, with a view to attempting to establish some kind of systematisation. Our preliminary hypothesis pointed at the co-existence of the two main kinds of uses of *whereas* referred to above – namely, with its everyday meanings, and also with a more specific, legal orientation. The analysis undertaken has confirmed our hypothesis that Swift mastered both sorts of senses, and, depending on the different contexts, he must have used *whereas* (and, more specifically, also *whereas* clauses) with a twofold purpose: to come closest to his “Fellow-Servants” and “Countrymen”, and also to provide them with legal grounds to uphold their claims against the British.

Even so, the analysis of the *corpus* has shown a much greater pre-eminence of the use of *whereas* with those meanings that are normally used in everyday language. In our view, the reason for the relative quantitative scarcity of the legal uses of *whereas* has to do probably with the fact that we are not dealing with legal texts, strictly speaking. As noted above, however, not only the *text types* used may account for this preponderance of the general uses of *whereas*. The *speaker's intention* as well as the features that characterise the *target audience or readership* may also shed light on this aspect. Thus, Swift intended above all to raise the rejection of the patent fostered by Wood, and wanted such refusal among his “Countrymen” and “Fellow-Servants” to be as broad as possible.

We have also traced instances of *whereas* in which this connector, generally with its everyday meaning of contrast, enhances ironic attitudes that Swift sought to arouse. These refer, above all, to his own appraisal as a pretended shopkeeper or Drapier as contrasted to Wood, the metal ‘fake’ trader who was only concerned about his own interest and did not hesitate about ruining the Irish to achieve his purposes. As for footnotes and appendices, they have been found to allow the reader to trace the chronological evolution of the whole issue, with some of the actual legal and administrative documents released within the whole controversy.

On the whole, the analysis has shown that in *The Drapier's Letters*, Swift, under the *persona* of the Dubliner shop-keeper, seems to have been attempting to establish some kind of covenant or contract with his “Countrymen” and “Fellow-Servants”. Above all, he has sought to make the Irish, his “Fellow-Servants” and “Countrymen”, aware of the situation of oppression that the British exerted upon them, and to make them react against it. As regards the use of *whereas*, we can perhaps point to a twofold contrast or continua between everyday uses and legal uses of the term, and to the enhancement of either literal or ironic uses. In synthesis, Swift used *whereas* and *whereas* clauses as concrete resources to convey his message effectively, and pinpoint the attitudes that he sought to arouse amongst his primary or intended readership.

Acknowledgements

The research for the writing of the present paper started thanks to a project financed by the Spanish Ministry of Science and Technology, “Jonathan Swift: The translation and dissemination of his work” (BFF 2002-00653), and a research group

sponsored by the Government of Aragon, through the research team "SWIFT" H46 (245-132), formed in 2006 and whose activity has continued to the present.

References

- Alcaraz Varó, Enrique. *El inglés jurídico*. 5th ed. Madrid: Ariel Derecho, 2002 (1994).
- Alcaraz, Enrique, and Brian Hughes. *Legal Translation Explained*. Manchester: St. Jerome, 2002.
- Alcaraz Varó, Enrique, and Brian Hughes. *Diccionario de términos jurídicos inglés-español, español-inglés*. 7th ed. Madrid: Ariel Derecho, 2003 (1993).
- Biber, Douglas. *Corpus Linguistics: Investigating Language Structure and Use*. 7th ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Birch, Dinah. *The Oxford Companion to English Literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Borja Albi, Anabel. *El texto jurídico inglés y su traducción al español*. Barcelona: Ariel Lenguas Modernas, 2000.
- Bullit, John M. "Satiric Detachment: Invective, Diminution, and Irony". *Jonathan Swift and the Anatomy of Satire. A Study of Satiric Technique*. Cambridge. Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1961. 38-67.
- Cannon, J.A., ed. *The Oxford Companion to British History*. 2nd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Connolly, S. J., ed. *The Oxford Companion to Irish History*. 2nd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007 (2002).
- Davis, Herbert. *The Satire of Jonathan Swift*. London: Macmillan, 1947.
- Davis, Herbert. *Jonathan Swift: Essays in his Satire and Other Studies*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1964.
- Downie, J.A. *Jonathan Swift. Political Writer*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1984.
- Eilon, Daniel. "Swift's Satiric Logic: On Parsimony, Irony, and Antinomian Fiction". *The Yearbook of English Studies*. Vol. 18, Pope, Swift, and Their Circle Special Number (1988), pp. 18-40.
- Martin, Sydney. *The Hibernia Coinage of William Wood (1722-1724)*. Ann Arbor, Mich.: C4 Publications, 2007.
- Mason, William Monck. *History and Antiquities of the Collegiate and Cathedral Church of St. Patrick near Dublin from its Foundation in 1190, to the Year 1819*. Dublin: Folds, 1819. Web 10 July 2020
<https://books.google.es/books/about/The_History_and_Antiquities_of_the_Colle.html?id=y5ogAQAAMAAJ&redir_esc=y>
- Merriam-Webster's Dictionary Online: Web 10 July 2020
<<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/>>
- Poor, H. 1971. *You and the Law*. Pleasantville, New York: R.D.A.
- Quintana, Ricardo. "Situational Satire: A Commentary on the Method of Swift". *Swift: A Collection of Critical Essays*. Ed. Ernest Tuveson. Prentice-Hall: Englewood Cliffs, 1964 (1948): 91-99.
- Quintana, Ricardo. *Swift: An Introduction*. London: Oxford University Press, 1966 (1955).

- Quirk, Randolph *et al.* *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London: Longman, 1991 (1985).
- Speck, W.A. *Swift*. London: Evans Bros. Ltd., 1969.
- Swift, Jonathan. "The Story of the Injured Lady (Being a True Picture of Scotch Perfidy, Irish Poverty and English Partiality)". *Irish Tracts 1720-1723*. Ed. Herbert Davis. Oxford: Blackwell, 1968 (1707). 1-9.
- Swift, Jonathan. *The Drapier's Letters. The Prose Works of Jonathan Swift. Vol. VI*. Ed. Temple Scott. The Project Gutenberg E-Book of the Prose Works of Jonathan Swift, 2004 (1903) [1724].
<http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/12784>
<http://www.wattpad.com/15780-the-prose-works-of-jonathan-swift-d-d-volume-06> Web 10 July 2020
- Swift, Jonathan. "A Modest Proposal for Preventing the Children of Ireland from being a Burden to their Parents or Country and for making them beneficial to the Publick". *Jonathan Swift. "Gulliver's Travels and Other Writings*. Ed. Louis Landa. London, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1976 (1729). 439-446.
- Usandizaga, Aránzazu (ed.). 1982. *Jonathan Swift. Irish Tracts. La cuestión de Irlanda*. Barcelona: Erasmo-Bosch.
- Ward, David. *Jonathan Swift: An Introductory Essay*. London: Methuen, 1973.
- Webster's Online Dictionary: <http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/> Web 10 July 2020
- Welch, Robert. *The Concise Oxford Companion to Irish Literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- West's Encyclopedia of American Law:
http://www.lincolnlibraries.org/databases/Wests_Encyclopedia_of_American_Law.htm Web 10 July 2020
- Yale University Office of the Vice President and General Counsel:
<http://ogc.yale.edu/> [With information about legal issues of general interest]. Web 10 July 2020

Appendix: Corpus of the instances analysed

1. I am no inconsiderable shopkeeper in this town, I have discoursed with several of my own and other trades, with many gentlemen both of city and country, and also with great numbers of farmers, cottagers, and labourers, who all agree that two shillings in change for every family would be more than necessary in all dealings. Now by the largest computation (even before that grievous discouragement of agriculture, which hath so much lessened our numbers [6]) the souls in this kingdom are computed to be one million and a half, which, allowing but six to a family, makes two hundred and fifty thousand families, and consequently two shillings to each family will amount only to five and twenty thousand pounds, **whereas** this honest liberal hardwareman Wood would impose upon us above four times that sum. (Letter II, p. 27).
2. His first proposal is, that "**whereas** he hath already coined seventeen thousand pounds, and has copper prepared to make it up forty thousand pounds, he will be content to coin no more, unless the EXIGENCES OF TRADE REQUIRE IT, though his patent empowers him to coin a far greater quantity." (Letter II, p. 29).
3. His proposals conclude with perfect high treason. He promises, that no person shall be _obliged_ to receive more than fivepence halfpenny of his coin in one payment: By which it is plain, that he pretends to _oblige_ every subject in this kingdom to take so much in every payment, if it be offered; **whereas** his patent obliges no man, nor can the prerogative by law claim such a power, as I have often observed; so that here Mr. Wood takes upon him the entire legislature, and an absolute dominion over the properties of the whole nation (Letter II, page 30).

4. Perhaps I have been too tedious; but there would never be an end, if I attempted to say all that this melancholy subject will bear. I will conclude with humbly offering one proposal, which, if it were put in practice, would blow up this destructive project at once. Let some skilful judicious pen draw up an advertisement to the following purpose.
That "**Whereas** one William Wood hardware-man, now or lately sojourning in the city of London, hath, by many misrepresentations, procured a patent for coining an hundred and forty thousand pounds[12] in copper halfpence for this kingdom, which is a sum five times greater than our occasions require. And **whereas** it is notorious that the said Wood hath coined his halfpence of such base metal and false weight, that they are, at least, six parts in seven below the real value. And **whereas** we have reason to apprehend, that the said Wood may, at any time hereafter, clandestinely coin as many more halfpence as he pleases. And **whereas** the said patent neither doth nor can oblige His Majesty's subjects to receive the said halfpence in any payment, but leaves it to their voluntary choice, because, by law the subject cannot be obliged to take any money except gold or silver. And **whereas**, contrary to the letter and meaning of the said patent, the said Wood hath declared that every person shall be obliged to take fivepence halfpenny of his coin in every payment. And **whereas** the House of Commons and Privy-council have severally addressed his Most Sacred Majesty, representing the ill consequences which the said coinage may have upon this kingdom. And lastly **whereas** it is universally agreed, that the whole nation to a man (except Mr. Wood and his confederates) are in the utmost apprehensions of the ruinous consequences, that must follow from the said coinage.
Therefore we whose names are underwritten, being persons of considerable estates in this kingdom, and residents therein, do unanimously resolve and declare that we will never receive, one farthing or halfpenny of the said Wood's coining, and that we will direct all our tenants to refuse the said coin from any person whatsoever; Of which that they may not be ignorant, we have sent them a copy of this advertisement, to be read to them by our stewards, receivers, &c." (Letter II, p. 32-33)
5. "And, as to the witnesses, it was a query whether my lord lieutenant by his own power could send them; and, if he have such power, yet it will not be possible to come at the witnesses, for several in each house vouched several facts on their own knowledge, to whom the houses gave credit; my lord lieutenant can neither be apprised of the persons nor of the particulars which the members testified; **whereas**, if the parliament was sitting, those members would appear, and make good their assertions. (From "Letter from William King, Archbishop of Dublin, to Edward Southwell, Esq., dated the 23d March, 1723. Footnote n.4 to Letter III, p. 47-48)
6. You will here please to observe, that the profit allowed to Wood by the patent is twelvepence out of every pound of copper valued at 1s. 6d. **whereas** 5d. only is allowed for coinage of a pound weight for the English halfpence, and this difference is almost 25 per cent. which is double to the highest exchange of money, even under all the additional pressures, and obstructions to trade, that this unhappy kingdom lies at present. This one circumstance in the coinage of three hundred and sixty ton of copper makes a difference of twenty-seven thousand seven hundred and twenty pounds between English and Irish halfpence, even allowing those of Wood to be all of the heaviest sort. (Letter III, p.52)
7. The Parliament, who in matters of this nature are the most able and faithful counsellors, did represent this grant to be "destructive of trade, and dangerous to the properties of the people," to which the only answer is, that "the King hath a prerogative to make such a grant."
It is asserted that in the patent to Knox, his "halfpence, are made and declared the current coin of the kingdom," **whereas** in this to Wood, there is only a "power given to issue them to such as will receive them." The authors of the Report, I think, do not affirm that the King can by law declare anything to be current money by his letters-patents. (Letter III, p. 55)
8. First we desire to know, why His Majesty's prerogative might not have been as well asserted, by passing this patent in Ireland, and subjecting the several conditions of the contract to the inspection of those who are only concerned, as was formerly done in the only precedents for patents granted for coining for this kingdom, since the mixed money[12] in Queen Elizabeth's time, during the difficulties of a rebellion: **Whereas** now upon the greatest imposition that can possibly be practised, we must go to England with our complaints, where it hath been for some time the fashion to think and to affirm that "we cannot be too hardly used." Again the Report says, that "such patents are obligatory." After long thinking, I am not able to find out what can possibly be meant here by this word obligatory_. (Letter III, p. 56).
9. But because much weight is laid on the precedents of other patents, for coining copper for Ireland, I will set this matter in as clear a light as I can. Whoever hath read the Report, will be apt to think, that a dozen precedents at least could be produced of copper coined for Ireland, by virtue of patents passed in England, and that the coinage was there too; **whereas** I am confident, there cannot be one precedent shewn of a patent passed in England for coining copper for Ireland, for above an hundred years past, and if there were any before, it must be in times of confusion. (Letter III, p. 59)
10. "What argument," quotes Monck Mason from the tract issued in 1724 entitled, "A Defence of the Conduct of the People of Ireland, in their unanimous refusal of Mr. Wood's Copper Money," "can be drawn from the badness of our former coinages but this, that because we have formerly been cheated by our coiners, we ought to suffer Mr. Wood to cheat us over again? 'If any be brought, it is immediately sent away, the two, or as I am informed, the three pence in the ounce, given by the East India Company, being a temptation not to be resisted; but, the truth is, very little is brought in, for the merchants that carry our commodities to foreign markets, find it more to their advantage to carry directly to London whatever they receive in cash; and **whereas** formerly they used, when they had disposed of their cargo, to load their vessels with such commodities as there was a demand for in Ireland, and bring the rest in cash, they bring now only the commodities, and send the silver to London; and when they have got the twopence in every ounce from the East India Company, the rest serves to answer the returns we are obliged to make to England, for the rents we are obliged to

pay to noblemen and gentlemen who have estates in Ireland and live in England, and for the pensions, and other occasions which are many; by this means they gain likewise the exchange, which is commonly four or five per cent, better to them than if they sent cash.

"It is farther to be observed, that 21 shillings, which is the value of a guinea in England, makes in Ireland 22 shillings and 9 pence, **whereas** a guinea passes for 23 shillings with us, therefore, he who sends silver into England, gains three pence more by it than if he sent guineas; this advantage, though it may seem little, yet in a manner has entirely drained us of our English money which was given in lieu of foreign silver. ([From Footnote 15: "On this subject of the want of small money in Ireland, Monck Mason traverses the Report in the following manner:"]; Letter III, p. 62)

11. [Footnote 20: So ready was the response to this suggestion of Swift's, that it was found necessary for tradesmen to take precautions to have it publicly known that they were in no way connected with Wood and his money, The following is a copy of an advertisement which illustrates this:

"Whereas several persons in this kingdom suspect that John Molyneux of Meath Street, ironmonger, and his brother Daniel Molyneux, of Essex Street, ironmonger, are interested in the patent obtained by William Wood for coining of halfpence and farthings for this kingdom.

"Now we the said John Molyneux and Daniel Molyneux, in order to satisfy the public, do hereby declare, that we are in no way concerned with the said Wood in relation to his said patent; And that we never were possessed of any of the said halfpence or farthings, except one halfpence and one farthing, which I the said John Molyneux received in a post-letter, and which I immediately afterwards delivered to one of the Lords-Justices of Ireland.

"And we do further declare, that we will not directly or indirectly, be anyways concerned with the said Wood's halfpence or farthings; but on the contrary, act to the great advantage and satisfaction of this kingdom, as good, loving and faithful subjects ought to do. And we do further declare, that to the best of our knowledge, the said William Wood is not in this kingdom.

"Given under our hands in Dublin this 22d. day of August 1724.

"JOHN MOLYNEUX

"DAN. MOLYNEUX."

Another ran as follows:

"ADVERTISEMENT.

"**Whereas**, I, Thomas Handy, of Meath Street, Dublin, did receive by the last packet, from a person in London, to whom I am an entire stranger, bills of lading for eleven casks of Wood's halfpence, shipped at Bristol, and consigned to me by the said person on his own proper account, of which I had not the least notice until I received the said bills of lading.

"Now I, the said Thomas Handy, being highly sensible of the duty and regard which every honest man owes to his country and to his *fellow-subjects*, do hereby declare, that I will not be concerned, directly or indirectly, in entering, landing, importing, receiving, or uttering any of the said Wood's halfpence, for that I am fully convinced, as well from the addresses of both Houses of Parliament, as otherwise, that the importing and uttering the said halfpence will be destructive to this nation, and prejudicial to his Majesty's revenue.

"And of this my resolution I gave notice by letter to the person who sent me the bills of lading, the very day I received them, and have sent back the said bills to him.

"THO. HANDY. "Dublin, 29th. August, 1724." [T.S.]] (p. 64-65, footnote 20 to Letter III, my italics)

12. And this gives me an opportunity of explaining, to those who are ignorant, another point, which hath often swelled in my breast. Those who come over hither to us from England, and some weak people among ourselves, whenever in discourse we make mention of liberty and property, shake their heads, and tell us, that Ireland is a "depending kingdom," as if they would seem, by this phrase, to intend that the people of Ireland is in some state of slavery or dependence different from those of England; **Whereas** a "depending kingdom" is a modern term of art, unknown, as I have heard, to all ancient civilians, and writers upon government; and Ireland is on the contrary called in some statutes an "imperial crown," as held only from God; which is as high a style as any kingdom is capable of receiving. (Letter IV, p. 81)

13. The fifth thing to be considered, is, that the members of the grand jury being merchants, and principal shopkeepers, can have no suitable temptation offered them, as a recompense for the mischief they will suffer by letting in this coin, nor can be at any loss or danger by rejecting the bill: They do not expect any employments in the state, to make up in their own private advantage, the destruction of their country. **Whereas** those who go about to advise, entice, or threaten them to find that bill, have great employments, which they have a mind to keep, or to get greater, which was likewise the case of all those who signed to have the author prosecuted. And therefore it is known, that his grace the Lord Archbishop of Dublin,[1] so renowned for his piety, and wisdom, and love of his country, absolutely refused to condemn the book, or the author. (Seasonable Advice, p. 88)

14. I remember some months ago I was at your house upon a commission, where I am one of the governors: But I went thither not so much on account of the commission, as to ask you some questions concerning Mr. Wood's patent to coin halfpence for Ireland; where you very freely told me, in a mixed company, how much you had been always against that wicked project, which raised in me an esteem for you so far, that I went in a few days to make you a visit, after many years' intermission. I am likewise told, that your son wrote two letters from London, (one of which I have seen) empowering those to whom they were directed, to assure his friends, that **whereas** there was a malicious report spread of his engaging himself to Mr. Walpole for forty thousand pounds of Wood's coin, to be received in Ireland, the said report was false and groundless. (Letter V, p. 93)

15. "We found also that thirty and two old half-pence coined for Ireland in the reigns of King Charles 2d., King James 2d., and King William 3d. and Queen Mary, and produced by Mr. Wood, weighed six ounces and eight pennyweight Troy, that is, one hundred and three grains and a half apiece one with another. They were much worn, and if about six or seven grains be allowed to each of them one with another for loss of their weight by wearing, the copper-money coined for England, in the reign of King William being already as much lightened by wearing, they might at first weigh about half a pound avoirdupois; whereas only thirty of those coined by Mr. Wood are to be of that. They were also made of bad copper, two of those coined in the reign of King Charles II. wasted much in the fire, and then spread thin under the hammer, but not so well without cracking as those of Mr. Wood. Two of those coined in the reign of King James II. wasted much more in the fire, and were not malleable when red hot. Two of those coined in the reign of King William and Queen Mary wasted still more in the fire, and turned to an unmalleable substance like a cinder, as your Lordships may see the pieces now laid before you. (p. 140; From APPENDIX II: REPORT OF THE ASSAY ON WOOD'S COINAGE, MADE BY SIR ISAAC NEWTON, EDWARD SOUTHWELL, ESQ., AND THOMAS SCROOPE, ESQ.[1]).
16. The King's interest and honour is more concerned in the protection of the innocent, than in the punishment of the guilty, as in all the immediate actions of his Majesty we find that maxim pursued, a maxim can never run a prince into excesses. We do not only find those princes represented in history under odious characters, who have basely betrayed the innocent, but such as by their spies and informers were too inquisitive after the guilty, **whereas** none was ever blamed for clemency, or for being too gentle interpreters of the law. Though Trajan was an excellent prince, endowed with all heroical virtues; yet the most eloquent writers, and his best friends, found nothing more to be praised in his government, than that in his time, all men might think what they pleased, and every man speak what he thought, this I say, that if any amongst us by violent measures, and a dictatorial behaviour have raised jealousies in the minds of His Majesty's faithful subjects, the blame may lie at their door. (p. 147; From APPENDIX IV: A LETTER FROM A FRIEND TO THE RIGHT HONOURABLE -----[1] Ceteri, quanto quis servitio promptior, opibus et honoribus extollerentur: Invalido legum auxilio, quae vi, ambitu, postremo pecunia turbabantur.-- Tacit. An. To THE RIGHT HONOURABLE -----)
17. I confess I take that to be the meaning of the word counsel, but I am certain that is not all that is meant by it, that is what must be understood when it is called the king's counsel, id est, the counsel or reasons for which the king by his servants, his attorney-general or coroner, has drawn and sent to the grand jury a charge against a subject. But the counsel of a juror is a different thing, it is the evidence, the motives and reasons that induce him or his fellow-jurors to say *billa vera* or *ignoramus*, and the opinion he or they happen to be of when the question is put by the foreman for finding or not finding: This counsel every man is sworn to keep secret, that so their opinion and advice may not be of prejudice to them hereafter, That as they are sworn to act without favour or affection, so may they also act without FEAR. **Whereas**, were it otherwise the spirit of revenge is so universal, there are but few cases wherein a juror could act with safety to himself; either the prosecuted, as where the bill is found, or the prosecutor, where it is returned *ignoramus*, may contrive to defame the jurors who differ from them in opinion: As I am told has happened to some very honest citizens who are represented to be Jacobites since their opinions were known to be against ----. And sometimes revenge or ambition may prompt men to carry it further, as in the case of Mr. Wilmer, who in King Charles 2d's time was very severely handled for being one of an *ignoramus* jury.---- 'Tis not necessary to say whom he disoblged by being so.----But if I remember right his case was this. (From Appendix IV: A SECOND LETTER FROM A FRIEND TO THE RIGHT HONOURABLE ----- p. 150)
18. APPENDIX V
THE PRESENTMENT OF THE GRAND JURY OF THE COUNTY OF THE CITY OF DUBLIN.[1]
Whereas several great quantities of base metal coined, commonly called *Wood's halfpence*, have been brought into the port of Dublin, and lodged in several houses of this city, with an intention to make them pass clandestinely, among His Majesty's subjects of this kingdom; notwithstanding the addresses of both houses of parliament and the privy-council, and the declarations of most of the corporations of this city against the said coin; And **whereas** His Majesty hath been graciously pleased to leave his loyal subjects of this kingdom at liberty to take or refuse the said halfpence. (p. 155)
19. APPENDIX VI
PROCLAMATION AGAINST THE DRAPIER.
"Oct. 27th, 1724.
"A proclamation for discovering ye Author of ye Pamphlet intituled A letter to ye whole people of Ireland, by M.B. Drapier, author of the Letter to the Shop-keepers, etc.
£300 Reward
BY THE LORD-LIEUTENANT AND COUNCIL OF IRELAND.
- A Proclamation.
"CONTENT:
"**Whereas** a wicked and malicious pamphlet, intituled A Letter to the whole people of Ireland, by M.B. Drapier, author of the Letter to the Shop-keepers, etc., printed by John Harding, in Molesworth's Court, in Fishamble Street, Dublin, in which are contained several seditious and scandalous paragraphs highly reflecting upon his Majesty and his Ministers, tending to alienate the affections of his good subjects of England and Ireland from each other, and to promote sedition among the people, hath been lately printed and published in this kingdom: We, the Lord-Lieutenant and Council do hereby publish and declare that, in order to discover the author of the said seditious pamphlet, we will give the necessary orders for the payment of three hundred pounds sterling, to such person or persons as shall within the specified six months from this date hereof, discover the author of the said pamphlet, so as he be apprehended and convicted thereby.

"Given at the council chamber in Dublin, this twenty-seventh day of October, one thousand seven hundred and twenty-four.

"(Signed) Middleton _Cancer_. Shannon; Donnerail; G. Forbes; H. Meath; Santry; Tyrawly; Ferrars; William Conolly; Ralph Gore; William Whitshed; B. Hale; Gust. Hume; Ben Parry; James Tynte; R. Tighe; T. Clutterbuck. (p. 156)

20. IRELAND'S CASE HUMBLY PRESENTED TO THE HONOURABLE THE KNIGHTS, CITIZENS, AND BURGESSES IN PARLIAMENT ASSEMBLED

MOST HUMBLY SHEWETH,

Whereas your Honours finding the late Grant or Letters Patents obtained by Mr. William Wood, for making Three Hundred and Sixty Tun weight of copper half-pence for the Kingdom of Ireland, were to be manufactured in London &c. which money is now coining in Bristol, and that the said money was to weigh two shillings and sixpence in each pound weight, and that change was to be uttered or passed for all such as were pleased to take the same in this Kingdom. (From APPENDIX VIII, p. 160)



THEMATIC SELECTION AND PROGRESSION PATTERNS IN L2 THESES ABSTRACTS FROM HUMANITIES AND SCIENCE

Abstract: *This paper discusses the internal logico-relations of the theses abstracts from humanities and science, written in English as a second language (ESL). A research abstract is an academic text designed to attract and get the readers to read the research study which it summarises; thus, the coherence of ideas presented in it presumably affects the possible evaluations from the readers. Previous studies have examined the Theme/Rheme constructs as important cohesive elements at the level of discourse, with less attention to the sentential analysis of the thematic selection and the progression patterns in second language (L2) theses abstracts. Therefore, this paper aims at investigating and comparing the thematic markedness and its progression patterns as sources of the cohesive information in L2 humanities and science theses abstracts. In this paper, 60 PhD theses abstracts from the Premier University, Nigeria, are analysed. Quantitative and qualitative methods of analysis are applied. The abstracts from humanities and sciences (30 abstracts each) were purposefully selected and syntactically analysed, in terms of the Systemic Functional Linguistics' model of textual metafunction. The findings show that the theme unmarkedness, as well as the constant theme progression pattern, prevail in the two disciplines, although they feature varying frequencies.*

Key words: *academic writing, theses abstracts, theme markedness, theme/rheme, progression pattern*

1. Introduction

Academic writing is an art recognized as difficult for second language speakers of the English language. Although academic discourse is considered to be objective and unbiased, the social involvement and the relationship between the writer and the readers and, in particular, second language writers across disciplines, deserve extensive examination. In formal writing, particularly that of scholars, it is generally required that a text must pass the test of cohesion and coherence, which Halliday and Hassan called the relation of meaning within a text (1976: 4). Systemic Functional Grammar is concerned with the *textual metafunction*, one of the three metafunctions of language, which specifically focuses on the organization of text. A sentential analysis of the thematic structure was used to identify and classify the thematic selection (in terms of the markedness and unmarkedness choices) in the selected abstracts, while a discourse analysis was employed to examine the thematic progression in the abstracts, focusing on the features of themes and their employment in the entire discourse.

In this paper, we are interested in analyzing the cohesive devices, particularly the thematic selection and patterning of the selected L2 humanities and science theses abstracts from Nigeria. The comparison between the two fields spells out the organizational peculiarities in terms of the thematic markedness and unmarkedness, on one hand, as well as the progression patterning of themes and rhemes, on the other hand. Apart from discovering the organizational patterns and

¹ Lecturer at the University of Ibadan (Nigeria).

features of the theses abstracts from humanities and science in the ESL context, this paper provides an insight into how abstracts are informationally developed, as well as into the writer's way of thinking.

2. Theory and method

This paper applies both quantitative and qualitative research methods. Both methods are in line with the stated objectives, which include the identification, analysis and comparison of the thematic choices and progression patterns of the theses abstracts from the two broad fields. The data include 60 abstracts from 30 science PhD theses and 30 humanities PhD theses, defended at the Premiere University, Nigeria. The abstracts come from the period 2009-2012 and were purposefully selected for the study. Each of these abstracts contains four paragraphs: the introduction, the methodology, the findings and the conclusion, and the analysis is based on this structure.

The theoretical background is based on the Halliday's Systemic Functional linguistics (2004), Dane (1994), Bloor and Bloor (2001), Eggin (1994) and Zhu (1995). The thematic selection was analysed through the principles of markedness and unmarkedness of clauses at the sentential level of analysis, while the progression patterning was analysed using the following categories: Constant Theme (CT), Constant Rheme (CR), Simple Linear Pattern (SLP), Crossed Pattern (CP), Derived Theme (DT), Derived rheme (DR), Split Theme (ST) and Ruptured Theme (RT).

2.1. Literature

Systemic Functional Linguistics, a social semiotic approach to text, provides a three-dynamic set of language choices available to speakers in different contexts. First, the interpersonal resources of language enact social roles in the form of the power relations or the power play, which are manifested in the systems of Mood and Modality. Second is the ideational meaning, which construes various experiences of the world (Eggins, 1994); while the third refers to the textual meaning, which subsumes the system of Theme and Rheme. The textual meaning, which is the primary concern of this paper, examines the semantic and the discursive meanings of texts in terms of the theme's markedness and progression.

Earlier, linguists investigated the structure of message in a clause. The foremost scholar, Mathesius (1939) defines Theme as the first part of the sentence, and Rheme as the remaining part of the sentence. In several instances, theme is considered as the structural category realized in the clause-initial position in English (Halliday, 1970). Halliday further adds as follows:

"In English, as in many other languages, the clause is organized as a message by having a special status assigned to one part of it. One element in the clause is enunciated as the *theme*; then combined with the remainder so that the two parts together constitute a *message*" (Halliday, 2000: 37-38).

Theme, thus, accounts for the coherence and the internal organization of discourse, through organizing the initiation of the clause and/or by directing the attention of

the receiver of the message to the parts the sender wishes to emphasize (Dejica, 2005; 2009). This suggests that the thematic choice of the writer guides the message of the clause. Theme serves as the point of departure of the message (Halliday, 1985: 38). In other words, the initial point of an utterance is of an enormous importance to the clause and also to the text as it influences the hearer/reader's interpretation and understanding of everything that follows. Vasconcellos (1992: 149) says that the theme "signals the relationship between a thought in the speaker's mind and its expression in the discourse".

Rheme, on the other hand, refers to the other information in the clause, i.e. those found outside the theme. It is the remainder of the clause and thus it comes after theme. Rheme has been presented as unfamiliar or new information (Halliday, 1994: 59), but contextual analyses have proven that that may not always be the case, as writers may change the focus for particular reasons (Lombardi Vallauri, 195: 359).

Furthermore, the elements in a thematic structure can be classified into *simple*, those expressing only one experiential element; or *multiple*, those expressing more than just an experiential element. Overall, the use of these largely depends on the writer's deliberative choice of a declarative clause or the mood type.

2.1.1. Theme markedness

Theme can be either *marked* or *unmarked*. The former is used in a declarative clause with a subject in the initial position, while the latter is associated with the unusual choices which have an adjunct as the theme. Unmarked themes usually provide a lower degree of new information than marked themes, which tend to bring in new information, which is why marked themes rely on the context for their meanings (Westergaard, 1986 cited in Manoliu-Manea, 1994: 230). An unmarked theme may thus be the subject of the sentence, while the marked theme may be the non-subject component situated in the initial part of a sentence.

2.1.2. Thematic progression

Thematic Progression (TP) was first used by Danes (1974) to refer to the arrangement and the patterning of the theme in texts. It is a clear direction provided by the author to guide the readers through the ideas and areas of the focus in a text. Eggins (1994) further refers to TP as the exchange of information between the Theme and Rheme pairing in a text. He states that the Thematic Progression contributes to the cohesive development of a text, which can strengthen the text's coherence and cohesion. The emphasis here is on the relationship between the theme of a clause, and the themes and the rhemes in the subsequent clauses. The approach to the thematic progression patterning is discourse-oriented, which Danes (1974) refers to as the text's *thematic progression*. He (1974) defines it as:

"the choice and ordering of utterance Theme, their mutual concatenation and hierarchy as well as their relationship to the hyperthemes of the superior text units (such as paragraph, chapter...) to the whole of text, and to the situation".

Danes (1974) also proposes TP patterns, which include four categories: Simple Linear patterns (T2=R1), i.e. a new theme (T2) which is the outcome of the

immediate past Rheme (R1); Constant theme (T2=T1); Derived theme (T=T1+T2) and split Rheme (R=R1+R2). However, several scholars have proposed some other relevant patterns for the interpretation of themes in texts (Zhu, 1995; Bloor and Bloor, 2001; Sujatna, 2012, among others). Considering the contributions of each of the scholars above, as well as the peculiarities of the classifications suggested by each, this paper adopts seven categories for the interpretation of the progression patterning in the L2 theses abstracts. They are:

- *Constant Theme (CT)*: the items in the theme of the first clause are employed as the theme of the following clause.
- *Constant Rheme (CR)*: this is the continuous use of the Rheme in sentence 1 as the Rheme in the subsequent sentence(s).
- *Simple Linear Pattern (SLP)*: an item from the Rheme in sentence 1 becomes a Theme in a subsequent clause.
- *Crossed Pattern (CP)*: this is a pattern in which the Rheme of the latter sentence is the Theme of the former sentence.
- *Derived Theme (DT)*: this describes the expression in a theme position, and is cohesively linked to the topic, such that the subsequent themes serve as a sub-theme for the main hypertheme.
- *Split Theme (ST)*: the theme of the first clause is split into several items, each being a theme element in the subsequent clause.
- *Ruptured Theme (RT)*: this is a pattern where the sources of the theme could not directly point to the text before or after it. It is usually adopted by the writer to create a stylistic effect.

In determining the Thematic Progression in the selected disciplines, the occurrences of each these choices was counted in order to reveal the predominantly used pattern(s) at the sentential and the discourse levels.

3. Data analysis

This section examines the thematic selection in the selected theses abstracts. The analysis is done at the sentential level, in terms of the theme's markedness and unmarkedness.

3.1. Marked and unmarked themes in L2 humanity-based and science-based theses abstracts

Table 1 represents the number of sentences contained in the two parts of the corpus respectively. The results for the four paragraphs of the theses abstracts are given individually.

Paragraphs	HUMANITIES		SCIENCE	
	MARKED	UNMARKED	MARKED	UNMARKED
1	31	97	20	92
2	7	150	14	200
3	40	178	30	213
4	14	81	4	52
TOTAL	92	506	68	557
SUM TOTAL	598 CLAUSES		625 CLAUSES	

Table 1. Distribution of clauses in the abstracts

Table 1 above shows that a total number of 598 clauses are used in the humanities theses abstracts, while 625 clauses are used in the science theses abstracts. A slightly larger number of sentences used in the latter may be attributed to the demand for more sentences in the methodology and the findings sections of the science abstracts.

Tables 2 and 3 show the distribution of marked and unmarked themes in the selected abstracts, respectively. The results for the four paragraphs of the abstracts are given individually.

Paragraph	HUMANITIES		SCIENCE		TOTAL
	FREQUENCY	%	FREQUENCY	%	
1	97	51.3	92	48.7	189
2	150	42.9	200	57.1	350
3	178	45.5	213	54.5	391
4	81	60.9	52	39.1	133

Table 2. Distribution of unmarked themes in the two fields

Paragraph	HUMANITIES		SCIENCE		TOTAL
	FREQUENCY	%	FREQUENCY	%	
1	31	60.8	20	39.2	51
2	7	33.3	14	66.7	21
3	40	57.1	30	42.9	70
4	14	77.8	4	22.2	18

Table 3. Distribution of marked themes in the two fields

In Tables 2 and 3 above we can see that, in both the categories analyzed, unmarked themes are most often used for conveying specific information and for proving arguments to the readers. Unmarked themes aid the readers' interpretation of the message through a subject plus verb declarative clause. Some examples are given below:

Datum 7a(3) science

- a. *Five LAB (Lactic Acid Bacteria) species* were identified, while seven species of bacterial uropathogens with resistance to at least one antibiotic were identified.
- b. *The entire LAB* produced acetaldehyde, acetone ethyl-acetate, 2-butanone and ethanol but, *weissella confura* strains produced the largest quantities of ethanol.

In Paragraph 3 of the datum 7 above, the two italicized unmarked themes in the paragraph ('Five LAB (Lactic Acid Bacteria) species' and 'The entire LAB') describe the uropathogens isolated in Dairy foods.

Datum 4b(2) humanities

- c. *All the texts* are an expression of disenchantment with postcolonial Morocco and its neo-colonialist leaders.... *The author* portrays ...emigration to Italy. The text depict characters ... and deconstructing geographies.

The unmarked theme above are given in subject-oriented declarative clauses describing the global geography in the analysis of emigration and a definition of a contemporary piece of travel writing that incorporates facts and fiction.

Data 7 and 4 presented above are instances of the nominal-headed subjects of the declarative clause. However, there are a few instances in the abstracts in which pronominals were used as themes, locating their references from the antecedents. Examples include the following:

Datum 14b(3) humanities

- d. *The Nigerian military* has contributed immensely towards the sustenance of stable peace in Liberia. *It* contributed all the ...in Liberia. *It* has also provided electricity....

The referents in the thematic choices of the second and the third sentence above would be vague without the nominal referent in the first clause. In other words, the thematic choice of the last two pronominals suggests a progression pattern with the subject-theme in the first clause. The distribution of unmarked themes in the four paragraphs of the selected abstracts differs significantly. The analysis reveals that unmarked themes prevail (usually in declarative clauses) in paragraphs three and two of the abstracts. The analysis suggests that these two paragraphs provide both new and given information unlike the other paragraphs in the abstracts. It is within these paragraphs that the authors, using the declarative themes, provide the synopsis of their research findings or the results, as well as the methods of the data analysis.

Unmarked themes in scientific disciplines are more frequent than in humanities. One reason is the scientific reliance on the description of various experiments, treatments and instruments used in the research. Furthermore, in certain contexts, unmarked themes are realized through the existential 'there'. This theme is non-referential. In this case, the theme occupies the subject position but does not have a referent or an antecedent in the present discourse. Systemic grammar is of the opinion that the systemic choice of 'there' as the theme in a clause is a deliberate attempt to realize an ideational meaning and, thus, a topical theme. Examples of existential themes include the following:

Datum 14a(4) humanities

- e. *There* is the conviction that ‘bata’ changes mood , promotes the scope and popularized performance.

Datum 4a(3) science

- f. *There* were significant differences... among the progenies for FRY, FSW,NTR and HI...

The analysis above presents the theme and the subject as the same item, which aids to the continuity of the topic of the thesis. It also helps the authors to convey their main arguments, thereby assisting the readers in understanding the information.

Table 3 also shows the thematic distribution of a group of clauses other than the subject in a declarative clause. These clauses are realized as marked themes. The clauses in this category include the adverbial group and the prepositional phrases functioning as adjuncts in the clause. The presence of a marked theme in the clause signals “some kind of specific contextual pressure at work, often associated with a change of textual frame, rather than the continuity of topic of discourse or text” (Chapman and Routledge, 2009: 230). In the selected abstracts, both adverb-headed and preposition-headed adjuncts are present. Let us consider the following:

Datum1b(1) science

- g. *However*, the increasing level of poverty could impact negatively on agriculture, especially fish farming. *Though*, there is prevalence of information on poverty.

Datum 5(3) science

- h. *Moreover*, different phonological processes, such as nasalization... *Conversely*, contact with other languages, especially Yoruba and Edo... *By Contrast*, the Owon varieties are 81.0% cognate... *Therefore*, they are classified together as dialects...

In the examples above, the authors deliberately use unusual constructions to emphasize the meaning. They are used to accentuate particular information that has previously been stated or mentioned by the writer. The writer of Datum 1b(1), for instance, uses ‘however’, an adversative, to express a semantic relationship between the discourse stretches on the poverty status in Nigeria. Likewise, ‘moreover’ in datum 5 above serves as the additive to the former argument; ‘conversely’, ‘by contrast’ and ‘therefore’ are used to mark a reversal from the earlier arguments, as well as the comparison and the connection of ideas, respectively. Green et al. (2000: 105) emphasize that these connectors introduce a new topical referent or recall a referent with a relatively remote antecedent. Apart from the adverb-headed themes, there are also occurrences of a preposition-headed theme in the abstracts. Let us consider the following examples from the data:

Datum a(3) science

- i. *After antioxidant supplement in hypertensives, mean body weight ...were significantly lower than the corresponding baseline levels.... In rabbits, mean TC, LDL-C, HDL-C and TG increased in group 3*

Datum 14a (3) humanities

- j. *In a developed country, break dance is indeed an extension of ‘bata’ forms in performance. Before now, ‘bata’ operated only in union....*

The examples above illustrate the use of the two main categories of prepositions – the prepositions of place, answering the question ‘where’, and the prepositions of time, answering the question ‘when’. Here, the former indicate the position or the location of a finding, and the latter refer to the description of the time settings. The examples above include the prepositional phrases ‘in Rabbit’ and ‘in a developed country’, as well as ‘after antioxidant supplement in hypertensives,’ and ‘before time’.

All these categories of marked themes are used for emphasis. As can be seen from Table 3 above, marked themes are more frequent in humanities than in science abstracts. Meticulous attention is paid to Paragraph 3 (the research findings), as well as Paragraph 1 (the introductory paragraph), where there is a dominant use of marked themes. Humanities abstracts pay substantial attention to circumstantial elements, unlike science abstracts, which accounts for a remarkably larger presence of the adjunct-based themes in their research findings, conclusion and introductory paragraphs, respectively. Marked themes, however, are slightly more present in Paragraph 2 of the science abstracts. This difference is a result of the ‘other’ information required to support the claims in the methodology paragraph.

3.2. Thematic progression in Humanity and Science-based disciplines

The results below reveal seven progression patterns of themes in the data.

	CT	%	CR	%	SLP	%	CP	%	DT	%	ST	%	RT	%	TOTAL
HUMANITIES	97	58.1	2	1.2	32	19.2	2	1.2	10	6.0	1	0.6	22	13.2	167
SCIENCE	53	40.2	8	6.1	24	18.2	8	6.1	17	12.9	1	0.8	21	15.9	132

Table 4. Distribution of the seven patterns of thematic progressions in the abstracts

Thematic progression	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	Total
CT	7	4	3	11	4	10	7	6	9	5	6	12	3	9	4	96
CR	0	0	00	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1
SLP	3	0	5	2	4	1	2	1	2	3	1	1	2	1	3	31
CP	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
DT	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	4
ST	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
RT	0	1	1	1	7	0	5	1	5	2	1	0	2	2	1	29

Table 5a. Distribution of the seven patterns of thematic progressions in the humanities abstracts

Thematic progression	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	total
CT	4	6	6	2	2	3	2	3	4	4	1	2	10	1	3	52
CR	0	1	0	0	0	1	1	2	1	1	0	1	0	0	0	8
SLP	4	1	2	2	1	1	2	2	4	2	0	2	0	0	1	24
CP	1	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	1	0	2	1	0	0	8
DT	2	0	2	6	2	0	0	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	15
ST	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
RT	0	1	0	3	2	5	0	0	0	0	3	1	0	0	1	16

Table 5b. Distribution of the seven patterns of thematic progressions in the science abstracts

Constant theme: Based on the results presented above, it is clear that seven thematic progression patterns are used in the data. Among these patterns, a constant theme pattern is the most used progression in both the categories. It is frequently used in cases when many clauses share the same theme, and also to closely connect the previously used theme with the preceding arguments in the abstracts. It is used more often in the humanities abstracts (58.1%) than in the science abstracts (40.2%). Below are examples from the data.

Datum 4b(2) humanities

- a. *These texts* are selected because they portray legal and illegal movement of people... *The texts* are content analysed... *All the texts* are an expression of disenchantment with postcolonial Morocco and its neo-colonialist leaders.

Datum 15a(1) science

- b. *Millet and Castor* are two important tropical crops with numerous nutritional and industrial uses. *These crops* are presently dried using the traditional sun drying method.

Datum 7a(2) humanities

- c. *Iwa* is fundamental to human existence and social relations. It has profound value, as evident in the saying...

The three examples above point to a consistency in thematic representation. A common characteristic of such a consistency is that it helps the readers to get the main theme quickly, which enables easier understanding of the subsequent arguments in the clause. Also, if the main idea lurks in the theme, it definitely helps the readers grasp the idea around the topic. In the examples above, there are 3 categories of CT. The first example (datum 4b2) is an instance of the use of varied modifiers: 'these', 'the' and 'all the', respectively. They modify a single headword – 'text', in the three clauses. The second example has two synonymous CT, that is, 'Millet and Castor', which are both crops – hence the use of 'these crops'. This synonymous pattern is a stylistic choice used to avoid unnecessary repetitions of the lexical words. From the third example above, it is clear that 'Iwa', a nominal entity, is later realized as 'it', a pronoun in the subsequent clause. From all the examples and

their analyses, we may conclude that the Constant theme is an efficient thematic patterning which was mostly used by the second language theses writers in projecting the main arguments in the body of the abstracts. Table 5 above reveals that CT is widely used in Paragraph 3 (the findings/result paragraph) and 2 (the methodology paragraph) of the abstracts, respectively, although it is slightly more present in the humanities abstracts than in the science ones. The few occurrences of this pattern in Paragraphs 1 and 4 are used to emphasize the central ideas in the introductory (Paragraph 1) and the concluding (Paragraph 4) paragraphs of the selected abstracts.

Simple Linear Progression (SLP): this is the second most frequent progression pattern in the abstracts. It refers to the pattern in which the rheme of a previous clause becomes the theme of the subsequent clause. SLP is used in 32 humanities abstracts and 24 science abstracts. A few examples are given below:

Datum 5a(3) humanities

- a. Akokoid speech forms have undergone *systematic changes over time*. *These changes* have occasional phonological and lexical variations within the group.

Datum 4(2) humanities

- b. The study adopts *travels, postcolonial theory and psychoanalysis* in examining the selected works. *These themes* permit a wide perspective in the analysis of...
- c. The study uses the tents of ...as methodology in the interpretation of '*Les Yeux baisses, Labyrinthe des sentiments and Au plays*'. *These texts* are selected because they portray...

Datum 4 a(2) science

- d. Bulked Segregant Analysis was used to investigate the *SSR markers* associated with *The identified SSR markers* were used to select EB-HY genotypes....

Datum 8a(2) science

- e. The separation was carried out by the participants for a period of 3 months after which a post-intervention questionnaire was administered to access the impact of mobilization in *their practices*. *Practices scores* were computed based on....
- f. They were mobilized in a week-training to *separate their household solid waste*.... *The separation* was carried out by the participants for a period of 3 months.

In the excerpts, the rhemes of the first clause above, 'Les Yeux Baisse, the SSR markers, practices and separate their household waste', become the themes in the subsequent clauses. Looking through several examples identified above, it is clear that SLP provides a background for the build-up of information. The analysis reveals that SLP is mostly used in the methodology and the findings paragraphs. Generally,

SLP represents a sequence of a items, a process and an event which aids the organization of a text. Such an organization, derived from both the thematic and the rhematic arrangements, characterizes L2 writing as successful in terms of coherence (Bloor and Bloor, 1992; Wei, 2014). The thought flow process, as exemplified in the data above, also helps the readers understand the purpose of the text. Wang (2007: 167) argues that when a text is not coherent “there is a clear signpost directing the reader, who therefore cannot easily follow the progression of an idea or argument”. SLP points to consistency and exerts an impact on the development of information in the argumentation, where the arguments are arranged in a meaningful way to achieve their purpose (Nwogu and Bloor, 1991). The fact that the examples above draw from the rheme of a previous clause for the theme of the following clause, suggests an embedded logical and elaborate argument of detailed messages.

The analyzed humanities abstracts allow for some flexibility in style and voice, characteristic of interpretive writing, which is backed up with specific arguments and examples from the data. Through this, writers project their ideas or arguments into their writing. On the other hand, science abstracts have a distinctive style of presenting and recording data in a precise manner, hence avoiding a certain flowery language patterning, specific language rhetoric and metaphors which are usually found in the humanities’ writings.

Ruptured theme (RT): this is the third most occurring pattern in the abstracts. It occurs where a syntactic element in the thematic position failed to create a texture. RT usually appears in a form of the anticipatory subject ‘it’ or the existential subject ‘there’. However, from the analysis, the most occurring RT among the identified forms is the existential subject ‘there’. Let’s look at the following examples:

Datum 4b(3) science

- a. *There* were significant differences in the deffured 2261.7(G1)-2805.7(G8)....
- b. *There* were no significant differences in packed cell (%) 35.7(Gi-36.9)....

Datum 15a(1) science

- c. *There* is dearth of information on the drying behavior of castor , while that of millet is limited to sorption of a new varieties.

Datum 2b(1) humanities

- d. *There* have been efforts at research into biblical literature , particularly from the socio-historical and doctrinal perspective.

Datum 7a(4) humanities

- e. *There* is need for moral re-orientation in contemporary Yoruba society, which premised on the virtue of ‘iwa’ as it pivotal in traditional Yoruba religious philosophy.

The above samples taken from the abstracts feature the existential ‘there’. However, the use of ‘there’ above is different from its usage as a place adverb. Here,

it has no locative meaning and carries no emphasis (Rediscover grammar, 2003). The existential 'there' above functions as a dummy subject, in this case – a dummy theme fulfilling a mere grammatical function of the subject, but not playing a semantic role. The analysis reveals that both the categories of the abstracts make use of the existential theme 'there' to mark a representation element (Downing and Locke, 2006). A further analysis of the data shows an equal occurrence of RT in the humanities and the science abstracts. Its presence is significant in Paragraph 1, where it is used to promote background information on the subject matter, as well as in Paragraph 3, where it is used to mark a statistical hypothesis of certain concepts.

Derived Theme (DT): this is the fourth pattern of thematic progression in the abstracts. The Table above reveals that this type of progression is mostly used in the science abstracts. It is a pattern that provides a high degree of coherence and a smooth flow of information on the subject matter, which is usually the hypertheme. Some examples are given below.

Datum 3b(3) humanities

- a. *These three structures* were arranged in a manner that got the blog readers into believing that they had made appropriate choices of responses....
- b. *The surface structure* contained nationalist ideologies. *The dialogical structure* engaged the blog readers in imagined conversation. *The schematic structure* defined the canonical order of the discourse.

Datum 5a(3) science

- c. *Lead* was most predominant with significantly higher concentration at the study site.... *Post -cropping soil lea concentration* were reduced significantly by 39.2 and 38.0% in soil....

Datum 4b(2) science

- d. *Three experiments* were conducted using a complete randomized design. *In experiment 1*, 32GG aged 24 weeks...were randomly allocated.... *In experiment 2*, 36 GG aged 12 weeks...were randomly allocated. *In experiment 3*, 12 pelleted diets containing four different CP and their energy level were fed.

In DT, the first theme is regarded as the 'hypertheme', while the subsequent themes in the following sentences are derived from that hypertheme. The hypothesis in the examples above is realized through the forms 'these three structures', 'lead', and 'three experiments', respectively. For instance, the derived themes for the first hypertheme above are 'the surface structure', 'the dialogic structure' and 'the schematic structure'. The three examples above show that the DT progression is a simple test of consistency of an argument regarding the specific subject matters.

Cross-pattern progression (CP): this is another progression pattern in academic writing, but it is rarely used in the L2 academic abstracts. However, a few

of its occurrences suggest that it is more present in the science abstracts. Some examples are given below.

Datum 9a(1) science

- a. *The role of pair education in promoting nutrition education among adolescent* has been fully investigated in Nigeria. The study therefore assessed *the effects of pair education on nutrition and reproductive health....*

Datum 12a(1) humanities

- b. *This study* was anchored on the uses and gratification theory and cultivation theory. The survey research method was adopted *for the study.*

It is clear from the above examples that CP in the initial example was used in-between the 'gap' observed in previous research and the objective of the present study. This implies that, if there had not been a gap in the research, there would not have been a need for the present research. The second example, on the other hand, shows the relationship between the former theme in Clause 1 and the rheme in Clause 2, thereby aiding the coherence of the entire text. In sum, CP occurs only between Paragraphs 1 and 2 of the abstract and, by implication, it links the gap, the objectives and the theoretical framework of the selected theses.

In addition to the previously discussed thematic progression patterns in the selected theses, the analyzed texts reveal that other patterns are scarcely present. These include the Constant Rheme (CR), Split Theme (ST), and Derived Rheme (DR). Constant Rheme pattern makes the rheme of a clause continuous in the subsequent clauses. This suggests that an idea, concept or information in the abstract lurks in the rheme rather than in the theme of a clause. Unfortunately, the abstracts explored in this study do not favour CR compared to CT. The implication of this is that the readers will not have to struggle to get the main ideas from the clause. Let us examine three CR patterns found in the data:

Datum 2a(3) science

- a. Furthermore, 61.7% urban and 67.0% rural respondents indicated *community agitation as a major* case of establishment of community project.

Datum 2b(2) science

- b. The experimental group (EG) comprised of *312 Nurses in University of Calabar teaching Hospitals and General Hospitals, Calabar, while the control group (CG) consisted of 310 Nurses in University of Uyo teaching hospital and Saint Luke's hospital Uyo.*
- c. Stratified random sampling technique was employed in selecting *Nurses from the five nursing cadres, in each group.*

The analysis reveals more uses of CR in the science than in the humanities abstracts.

Another scantily present pattern in the data is the split theme. The primary aim of this type of progression is to organize information into subordinate parts, thus, scaffolding the content of the longer stretches of texts. Examples follow:

Datum 5a(3) science

- a. *The CPW and MSW at 40 t/ha increased DMA of maize by 95.4%....*
- b. *The MSW at 40t/ha significantly reduce soil lead concentrations in the screen-house....*

Datum 8b(3) humanities

- c. *Parents' education...; parents' occupation...; parents' income... and parents' involvement...made significant relative contribution to academic achievement in English language. Parental involvement...made significant relative contribution to academic achievement in mathematics.*

In the extracts above, the split theme in the second clause is the main theme of the first clause. This form of pattern is rarely used in the L2 abstracts because there is more than one subject matter or idea to be developed.

Apart from the seven thematic progression patterns identified and exemplified above, there are some other 'unpatterned themes' in the theses abstracts analyzed which do not directly relate to any of the above-mentioned models.

In summary, the thematic selection and progression pattern analyzed above have revealed the coherence status achieved through a thematic organization in both the humanities and the science L2 abstracts. The initial analysis of the thematic selection present unmarked themes as the most preferable in both types of abstracts, though it is more frequently used in the science abstracts than in the humanities abstracts. This suggests that the abstract writers deliberately foreground the information in the unmarked position of the clause. On the other hand, the subsequent analysis of the progression pattern presents the flow of a message and a close connection of information in the data.

The constant theme was the dominant thematic progression type, followed by the simple linear progression, the ruptured theme, the derived theme, the cross-pattern theme, the constant rheme and the split theme, respectively.

Conclusion

For the purpose of this study, we built a small corpus of the theses abstracts from humanities and science. The objectives were to analyze theme markedness and also to reveal the thematic progression patterns in both the fieldw. The foregrounding of unmarked themes, as well as the predominant choice of the constant theme and the simple linear progression in both the categories, confirm Thompson's assertion (2004: 165) that themes need to signal what the speaker (the writer) thinks is a suitable starting point, and also signals the maintenance or progression of what the text is about.

The analysis and the results presented here can enhance the understanding of text organizations in L2 science and humanities academic writing.

References

- Bloor, T. and Bloor, M. *The functional analysis of English. A Hallidayan approach*. Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press and Edward Arnold (Publishers) Limited, 2001.
- Danes, F. "Functional sentence perspective and the organization of the text". *Papers on functional sentence perspective*. Ed. F. Danes. The Hague: Mouton, 1974.
- Dejica, D. "Identifying and analyzing three-rheme relations for discourse production and translation". *Romanian Journal of English Studies*. Timisoara: Editura Universitatii de vest. 6. (2009): 128-136.
- Dejica, D. "Towards a new model for the identification of Thematic information in discourse". *Comunicare Profesional ta si traductologies*. Eds. R. Superceanu and D. Dejica. Timisoara: Universitatea Politehnica. 2005. 103-111.
- Eggs, S. *An introduction to functional Linguistics*. London: Printer Publishers, 1994.
- Green, Christopher F., Elsie R. Christopher, Jaquenlin Lam and Kam Mei. "Thematic Progression in professional and popular medical texts". *Functional and systemic linguistics: Approaches and uses*. Ed. E. Ventola. Berlin Mouton de Gruyter, 1991. 369-384.
- Halliday, M.A.K. *Halliday's introduction to functional grammar* (4th ed). Revised by C.M.I.M. Matthiessen. New York: Routledge, 2014.
- Halliday, M.A.K. "On the transition from child tongue to Mother tongue". *Australian Journal of Linguistics*, 3 (1983): 201-216.
- Halliday, M.A.K. "Language Structure and Language Function". *New Horizon in Linguistics*. Ed. J. Lyons. Pergiu Harondsworth (1970): 140-165.
- Halliday, Michael and Hassan Ruqaiya. *Cohesion in English*. London: Longman Publishing, 1976.
- Lombardi Vallauri E. "Linguistic Features of persuasion in advertising". *Lingua Nostra*. 2.3 (1995): 41-51.
- Manoliu-manea, M. *Discourse and Pragmatic constraints on Grammatical choices: A grammar of Surprises*. Amsterdam: Elsevier, 1994.
- Mathesius, Vilem. "On so-called functional sentence perspective". *Slovo a Slovinnost* 7 (1939): 169-180.
- Sujatna, Eva. "Applying Systemic functional Linguistics to Bahasa Indonesia Clauses". *International Journal of Linguistics*. 4.2 (2012).
- Thompson, G. *Introducing Functional Grammar (3rd Ed.)*. Abingdon: Routledge, 2014.
- Vasconcellos, J. "The theme as message onset: Its structure and characteristics". *Linguistics*, 30.1 (1992): 147-143.
- Wang, Lixia. "Theme and Rheme in the thematic organization of text: Implication for teaching academic writing". *Asia EFL Journal*. 9.9 (2007): 88-101.
- Wei, J. "Theme and thematic progression in Learner English: A literature review". *Colombian Applied Linguistics Journal*. 16.1(2014): 67-80.
- Xu, S. H. "Theme and Rheme". *Foreign Language Teaching and Researching*. 1 (1982): 1-9.
- Zhu, Y.S. "The pattern of thematic progression analysis and discourse". *Foreign Language Teaching and Researching*. 3 (1995): 6-12.



FRANZ KAFKAS „EIN LANDARZT“ ALS KOMPLEXES DEUTUNGSBEISPIEL DER MODERNEN PARABEL – EIN GATTUNGSGESCHICHTLICHER ABRISS

Zusammenfassung: *Seit der Antike gilt die Parabel als eine der beliebtesten literarischen Formen. Jedoch hat sich ihre Funktion und Wirkung durch die verschiedenen Epochen geändert. In der griechischen Antike diente sie als rhetorische Figur schlechthin. Später erscheint sie als Illustration in der religiösen Literatur. In der Aufklärung kommt es zur Wiederbelebung der Parabel. Es ist der Verdienst der Aufklärer, dass die Parabel aus dem religiösen Kontext losgelöst und zum Ziel der „Belehrung“ verwendet wurde. In der modernen Literatur des 20. Jahrhunderts dient sie als hermeneutische, rätselhafte Figur und hat eine erkenntniskritische Wirkungsabsicht. Diese Arbeit versucht einen Überblick über die Komplexität der Gattung zu verschaffen sowie deren geschichtliche Entwicklung und Wandlung. Weiters wird anhand von Franz Kafkas Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“ versucht, die Deutungsproblematik der modernen Parabel darzustellen. Die Frage, die diese Arbeit zu beantworten versucht, lautet: Inwiefern kann man Kafkas Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“ als „moderne Parabel“ klassifizieren? Obwohl sie keine Grundmerkmale der klassischen Parabel in sich trägt, lassen sich Züge der modernen Parabel erkennen. Der rätselhafte Charakter der Erzählung veranlasst dazu, sie als Beispiel der Komplexität der Deutung der modernen Parabel heranzuziehen.*

Schlüsselwörter: *Gattung Parabel, Funktion der Parabel, klassische Parabel, moderne Parabel, Franz Kafkas „Ein Landarzt“*

Einleitung

Ziel der vorliegenden Arbeit ist es, die Komplexität der Gattung Parabel darzustellen. Das Vielfältige und Vieldeutige einer durchaus komplexen Gattung – worüber sich viele Theoretiker und Schriftsteller Gedanken gemacht haben – soll hier in Erscheinung treten.

Zu Beginn werden theoretische Aspekte behandelt, wobei der Begriff „parabolé“ erläutert wird sowie dessen geschichtliche Entwicklung. Weiters wird die Funktion der Parabel von der griechischen Antike bis hin zur Aufklärung erklärt. Anschließend wird die „moderne Parabel“ bzw. die moderne Version dieser Gattung vorgestellt.

Darauf folgt ein praktischer Teil, in dem versucht wird, anhand Franz Kafkas „Ein Landarzt“ die „Verwandlung“ der Gattung Parabel darzustellen und zu zeigen, inwieweit Kafkas Erzählung das Attribut „moderne Parabel“ zugeschrieben werden kann.

Zur Wort- und Begriffsgeschichte der Parabel

Das Wort Parabel ist auf das griechische Substantiv παραβολή (parabole) zurückzuführen. Das vom Verb παραβάλλειν (paraballein: nebeneinanderstellen, vergleichen) hergeleitete Substantiv hat dem Duden nach mehrfache Bedeutungen,

¹ Lecturer at the University of Montenegro.

wie das „Nebeneinanderhalten, das Vergleichen, das Zusammentreffen“ (Duden, „Etymologie“, 1989: 508-09).

Durch die explizite oder implizite Übertragung von Signalen fordert die Parabel zur Aktivierung der „Übertragungsleistung“ des Rezipienten auf, indem sie nicht auf die wörtliche, sondern auf die „übertragene Bedeutung“ abzielt, deren „Richtungsänderung der Bedeutung“ entweder gelenkt werden oder offen bleiben kann (Lahn and Meister, 2013: 55). Obwohl es oft zu einer Gleichstellung von Parabel und Gleichniserzählung kommt, gibt es doch eine klare Trennlinie zwischen den beiden Formen, und zwar lässt sich der Schluss durch Analogie erläutern, die Parabel hingegen ist auf eine Auslegung angewiesen (2013: 55).

Interessant ist auch die Parabelbestimmung von Mark Turner. Für ihn stellt sie eine besondere Form der Literatur dar: „One special kind of literature, parable, conveniently combines story and projection. Parable serves as a laboratory where great things are condensed in a small space. To understand parable is to understand root capacities of the everyday mind, and conversely“ (Turner, 1996: 5). Turner ist der Meinung, dass auch Sprichwörter die gleiche Funktion haben können wie die Parabel: Es wird etwas gesagt, mit der Intention, es anders zu interpretieren.

Der Begriff Parabel stammt aus dem Hellenismus, beliebte Figur der antiken Rhetorik, deren Wurzeln in den Schriften des Alten und Neuen Testaments zu finden sind. In Aristoteles' „*Techne rhetorike*“ und Quintilians „*Institutio oratoria*“ erweist sich die Parabel „als eine rhetorische Funktion, die als Ausdruck dialektischen Denkens und Argumentationshilfe diente“ (Killy, *Literaturlexikon*, 1993: 192). Sie dient als eine Art Strategie der „*persuasio*“, des Überzeugens oder Überredens, die den Hörer durch Analogie und überraschende Wendung in der Handlung auf die Seite des Redners einlädt (1993: 192). Das bedeutet, dass die Erwartung des Empfängers im traditionellen Erzählprozess nicht erfüllt wird, „sondern auf eine andere inhaltliche Ebene gelenkt und dieser somit zu einer neuen Sicht des Zusammenhanges geführt wird“ (1993: 192).

Wer in der Antike als erfolgreicher Rhetoriker angesehen werden wollte, sollte in der Lage sein, komplexe Themen anhand von Beispielen, Bildern oder Geschichten zu vermitteln. Somit wurde „*parabolé*“ Teil der antiken Rhetorik und diente als „eine Weise des Sprechens, die nicht im wörtlichen Sinne verstanden werden sollte, sondern in der Weise der Übertragung“ (Brettschneider, 1971: 10). Trotzdem aber blieb dieser Begriff noch sehr umfassend und allgemein und bezog sich auch auf rhetorische Figuren, wie Bild, Metapher, Katachrese, Vergleich, Gleichnis und Allegorie (1971: 10).

Am häufigsten diente die Parabelform als literarische Illustration in der buddhistischen und hebräischen Literatur. Bei der Übersetzung des Alten Testaments ins Griechische wurde zum Beispiel das hebräische Wort „*maschal*“ durch „*parabolé*“ ersetzt (1971: 11). Der *Maschal* oder der Weisheitsspruch ist eine der ältesten und einfachsten Formen der Weisheitsliteratur. Am Anfang bedeutete „*Maschal*“ nichts anders als Wort oder Erzählung. Erst im Lauf der Zeit hat sich die Bedeutung des Wortes nur auf „gleichnishafte Erzählungen der verschiedensten Art“ beschränkt (The Jewish Encyclopedia: 512-13, qtd. in Brettschneider, 1971:10).

Das Alte und das Neue Testament mit den Gleichnissen Jesu gehören zu den Paradebeispielen der Parabeltradition. Bis zum Ende des Mittelalters verstand man

die Parabel als eine hermeneutische Form, die immer in theologischer und moralischer Verbindung stand und erst später wurde daraus eine literarische Form (Brettschneider, 1971:11).

Die Parabel als eine aufklärerische Gattung

Mit dem Niedergang der öffentlichen Rhetorik und den Fortschritten in der Drucktechnik im 18. Jahrhundert tritt die Parabel als ein „literarisch-ästhetisches Zeugnis“ in Erscheinung (Killy, Literaturlexikon, 1993: 192). Für die deutsche Literatur des späten 18. Jahrhunderts nimmt die Parabel die Stellung einer „genuin aufklärerischen Gattung“ als sogenannter „Hebel der Erkenntnis“ ein und während der ersten Hälfte des 20. Jahrhunderts wandelt sich diese Form und dient „als Mittel der Erkenntniskritik“ (1993: 192).

Es ist der Verdienst der Dichter und Denker des 17. und 18. Jahrhunderts, vor allem Johann Gottfried Herders, Gotthold Ephraim Lessings sowie Johann Wolfgang von Goethes, die dazu beigetragen haben, dass sich die Parabel langsam aus dem eingeschränkten religiösen Kontext befreite. Einer der ersten, der versucht hat, sich näher mit dem Begriff Parabel theoretisch auseinanderzusetzen, war Francis Bacon. Er versuchte den inneren Kern der Gattung zu enthüllen, indem er einen Vergleich zog, wie „die Hieroglyphen vor den Buchstaben gestanden hätten“, so stehe, „die Parabel vor rationalen und abstrahierenden Gedankengängen“ (Francis Bacon, Chapter 13: qtd. in Brettschneider, 1971: 11). Im deutschsprachigen Raum war es Harsdörffer, der bald darauf versuchte, die Parabel theoretisch zu erfassen und sie von der Fabel zu unterscheiden:

„Das Lehrgedicht (parabola) erzelet eine kurze Geschichte, welche ihre Deutung hat, und zuweilen auch geschehen könnte. Die Fabel aber erzelet vielmals was nicht geschehen kann, und macht nicht nur die Thiere, sondern auch die Steine reden. Diese lassen wir den alten Weibern und Kindern, welche der Lehre wenig achten, jene aber wird verständigeren Leuten billig beigemessen“ (G. Ph. Harsdörffer: 1650-51, qtd. in Brettschneider, 1971: 11).

Der bedeutendste deutsche Aufklärer G. E. Lessing hat sich auch um eine Theorie über die Fabel bemüht und lieferte eine Abhandlung, in der er auch zwischen Fabel und Parabel unterscheidet. Er definiert diesen folgendermaßen: „Der einzelne Fall, aus welchem die Fabel besteht, muss also wirklich vorgestellt werden. Begnüge ich mich mit der Möglichkeit desselben, so ist es ein Beispiel eine Parabel“ (G.E. Lessing: qtd. in Brettschneider, 1971: 11). Lessings Forderung nach habe die Fabel im Präteritum und die Parabel im Präsens zu stehen (Brettschneider, 1971: 12). Seine berühmte „Ringparabel“ aus dem Drama „Nathan der Weise“, die von Boccaccios „Dekameron“ entnommen wurde, gilt als Markstein der aufklärerischen Parabel.

Herder sieht die Parabel einer Gleichnisrede ähnlich, die mehr der Verhüllung statt der Enthüllung einer Lehre dient und etwas Emblematisches in sich trage (Hegel, in: Poser, 1978: 52). Er fügt noch hinzu, dass die Parabel eine Art

„Gattung Gedichte“, eine Mischung aus der Fabel, dem Emblem, der Allegorie und der Personifikation sei (1978: 52).

Hegel war der Meinung, dass die Parabel eine „allgemeine Verwandtschaft“ mit der Fabel aufweist, jedoch unterscheidet sie sich von der Fabel, indem sie die „Vorfallseinheiten nicht in der Natur und Tierwelt, sondern in dem menschlichen Tun und Treiben“ aufsucht und diese „zu einem allgemeineren Interesse durch Hindeutung auf eine höhere Bedeutung geweitert“ (1978:53).

Goethe hat in „Wilhelm Meisters Wanderjahre“ die Bedeutung von Wundern und Gleichnissen poetisch aufgefasst. Er meinte, dass sich dadurch neue Welten auftäten und unterscheidet zwischen Wunder und Gleichnis wie folgt:

„Daher entsteht das Wunderbare des Wunders, daß das Gewöhnliche und das Außerordentliche, das Mögliche und das Unmögliche eins werden. Bei dem Gleichnisse, bei der Parabel, ist das Umgekehrte: hier ist der Sinn, die Einsicht, der Begriff das Hohe, das Außerordentliche, das Unerreichbare. Wenn dieser sich in einem gemeinen, gewöhnlichen, faßlichen Bilde verkörpert, so daß er uns als lebendig, gegenwärtig, wirklich entgegentritt, daß wir ihn uns zueignen, ergreifen, festhalten, mit ihm wie mit unsersgleichen umgehen können, das ist auch eine zweite Art von Wunder und wird billiger zu jenen ersten gesellt, ja vielleicht ihnen noch vorgezogen. Hier ist die lebendige Lehre ausgesprochen, die Lehre, die keinen Streit erregt; es ist keine Meinung über das, was Recht oder Unrecht ist; es ist das Rechte oder Unrechte unwidersprechlich selbst“ (Goethe, 2016: 136).

Eta Linnemann unterscheidet zwischen Gleichnis und Parabel und ist der Meinung, dass im weiteren Sinne das Gleichnis die Parabel miteinschliesse und im engeren Sinne stelle man es der Parabel gegenüber (Linnemann, in: Poser, 1978: 53).

Der Platz der Parabel in der modernen Literatur des 20. Jahrhunderts

Brettschneider hat sich im zwanzigsten Jahrhundert Andre Jolles morphologisch mit den Formen der parabolischen Dichtung auseinandergesetzt. Er geht von einer „bestimmten Sprachgebärde aus, welche die Sprachform nach sich zieht“ (Brettschneider, 1971: 13) und ihm zufolge ist der Charakter der Offenheit ein Hauptmerkmal dieser Gattung.

Nach Klaus-Peter Philippi handelt es sich bei der Parabel ebenso sehr um eine Form des Denkens wie um eine des Erzählens. Ihm zufolge hat die Parabel ein Ziel und will es erkennbar machen, „Sie lehrt nicht wie im Falle der Fabel, sondern fordert zum Vollzug auf“ (Philippi, in: Poser, 1978:57).

Brettschneider hat die Merkmale der Parabel herausgearbeitet und schränkt sie auf drei wesentliche Grundmerkmale ein, wobei er sie von der verwandten Form der Allegorie abgrenzt:

„Das erste Grundmerkmal ist das uneigentliche, gleichnishafte Sagen: das Gesagte ist nicht bereits das Gemeinte, sondern es ist die Darbietung des

Gemeinten durch Konkretisierung und Hinweis auf das Gemeinte. Daraus ergibt sich das zweite Merkmal: die Konkretisierung geschieht in der Sprachform des Erzählens. Es wird ein Ereignis erzählt, wie eng eingegrenzt es auch ein mag und in welcher Kürze auch immer es erzählt werden mag. Das unterscheidet die Parabel u. a. von der Allegorie. Das dritte Merkmal ist die Notwendigkeit, das Erzählte als Beispiel aufzunehmen und aus ihm das Gemeinte herzuleiten, wobei dieser Prozeß der Übertragung vom Autor selbst durchgeführt, nur eingedeutet oder ganz und gar dem Leser überlassen werden kann“ (Brettschneider, 1971: 9).

Grete Schneider hat die Merkmale der „reinen“ Parabel herausgearbeitet und stellt dabei fest, dass bei der modernen Parabel die Partikel „wie“ fehle und das Erzähltempus das Präteritum sei (Schneider, in: Poser, 1978: 55).

In der moderne Dichtung des 20. Jahrhunderts nimmt die Parabel die Stelle einer „Grundfigur“ ein (Elm, 1991: 7). Laut Elm läßt sich „der Pauschalbegriff moderne Parabel““ als eine Antithese zur aufklärerischen Parabel des 18. Jahrhunderts“ verstehen, jedoch bestehe eine „dialektische Beziehung“ zwischen der traditionellen Parabel der Aufklärungszeit und ihrer modernen Variante im 20. Jahrhundert. „Gemeinsames und trennendes Moment der beiden Parabelperioden ist der Wille zur Aufklärung des Bewusstseins, den die Parabel nicht nur reflektiert, sondern auch appellativ propagiert“, so Elm (1991:27).

Nach ihm lassen sich fünf Darstellungsformen der modernen Parabel unterscheiden, denen jeweils wiederum bestimmte Autoren zugeordnet werden können:

1. Sozialkritische Moralparabel: Brecht, Baiertl, Frisch, Johnson, Bloch, Kunert – Böll, Camus, Hildesheimer, Jens, schnurre, M. Walser
2. Existentialistische Entscheidungsparabel: Sartre, Camus, Dürrenmatt, M. Walser, Lenz, v. Hoerschelmann
3. Erkenntniskritisch-metaphysische Parabel: v. Hofmannsthal, Rilke, Döblin, Broch, Musil, (R. Walser), Kafka, (Kafka-Nachfolge: Aichinger, Buzatti, Dürrenmatt, Kasack, Lattau, Meckel, Nossack)
4. Politisch-utopische Parabel: Morris – Bloch – Orwell, Huxley, Jens
5. Rituale Existenzparabel: Beckett, (das „absurde“ Theater: Ionesco, Genet, Pinget, Hildesheimer u. a.) - Mischaux (Elm, 1991: 22)

Man kann festhalten, dass es zur einer klaren Funktionswandlung der Gattung Parabel über die Epochen hinweg gekommen ist. Ihre primäre Funktion der rhetorischen Figur in der griechischen Antike verblasst mit der Drucktechnikwandelung im 18. Jahrhundert. In der Aufklärungsliteratur wird sie von den Aufklärern wiederbelebt und zum Ziel der „Belehrung“ verwendet. In der modernen Literatur des 20. Jahrhunderts dient sie als hermeneutische, rätselhafte „Grundfigur“, aus der sich ein „Horizont offener Möglichkeiten“, „Fragen statt Antworten“ (1991: 9) ergibt. Daraus lässt sich feststellen, dass die Parabel an ihrer Wirkungsfunktion nichts verloren hat, im Gegenteil hat sich ihr erkenntniskritische Wirkungsabsicht deutlich verstärkt.

Zu Inhalt und Form von Franz Kafkas „Ein Landarzt“

Der Erstdruck der Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“ erschien 1918 in Leipzig. Die Handlung spielt in einem Dorf, in einem „eisigen“ Winter, und handelt von einem Arzt, der seiner beruflichen Pflichten nachgeht.

Der Ich-Erzähler, ein älterer Landarzt, ist mit einem medizinischen Notfall konfrontiert, ein schwerkranker Patient wartet auf ihn in einem zehn Meilen entfernten Dorf. Mit seiner Instrumententasche in der Hand macht er sich für die Reise bereit, jedoch muss er am Hofe feststellen, dass er ein Pferd braucht, um zu den Patienten zu kommen, da sein Pferd in der Nacht zuvor „infolge der Überanstrengung in diesem eisigen Winter verendet“ (Kafka, 1994: 200) war. Er schickt sein „Dienstmädchen“ Rosa ins Dorf, um sich ein Pferd auszuleihen, aber ohne Erfolg. Danach betreten die beiden den Schweinestall, der schon seit Jahren nicht benützt wird, und wo sie einen unbekanntenen Pferdeknecht bemerken sowie zwei „mächtige flankenstarke“ (1994: 201) Pferde. Der Pferdeknecht spannt die Tiere vor den Wagen. Erfreut, dass er endlich losfahren kann, steigt der Landarzt in den Wagen ein. Kaum abgefahren, wird er Zeuge davon, wie der Knecht dem sich wehrenden Dienstmädchen Rosa ins Haus nachläuft, das er anscheinend als „Kaufpreis“ (1994: 201) für die Fahrt sieht.

Als der Landarzt den Hof des Kranken erreicht, findet er dessen Eltern und die Schwester vor. Im Bett liegt der kranke Junge, der den Arzt verzweifelt darum bittet, ihn sterben zu lassen. Während der Landarzt den Jungen untersucht, kreisen seine Gedanken um Rosa und er denkt darüber nach, wie er sie vor dem Knecht retten könne. In diesen Moment stoßen die Pferde das Fenster ein und stecken die Köpfe ins Zimmer des Kranken. Die Untersuchung des Arztes ergibt, dass der Junge eigentlich gesund ist, „ein wenig schlecht durchblutet von der sorgenden Mutter mit Kaffee durchtränkt, aber gesund und am besten mit einem Stoß aus dem Bett zu treiben“ (1994: 203).

Als er seinen Krankenbesuch beendet und die Handtasche schließt, gibt der Landarzt zu, dass der Junge vielleicht doch krank sei. Es wird ihm bewusst, dass die Krankheit, die er hier heilen soll, offenbar nicht mit Rezepten geheilt werden kann. Auf der rechten Seite der Hüftengegend des Jungen bemerkt er, dass sich „eine handtellergröße Wunde aufgetan“ (1994: 204) hat:

„Rosa, in vielen Schattierungen, dunkel in der Tiefe, hellwerdend zu den Rändern, zartkörnig, mit ungleichmäßig sich aufsammelndem Blut, offen wie ein Bergwerk obertags“ [...] Würmer, an Stärke und Länge meinem kleinen Finger gleich, rosig aus eigenem und außerdem blutbespritzt, winden sich, im Innern der Wundefestgehalten, mit weißen Köpfchen, mit vielen Beinchen ans Licht“ (1994: 204).

Der Landarzt sagt, dass dem Jungen nicht zu helfen sei und dass er an „dieser Blume in seiner Seite“ (1994: 204) zugrunde gehen wird. Plötzlich flüstert der Kranke dem Landarzt ins Ohr, ob er ihn retten würde. Der Landarzt antwortet darauf, dass die Leute von seiner Gegend so seien und den Arzt nach dem Unmöglichen fragen. Die Menschen hätten den alten Glauben verloren; „der Pfarrer

sitzt zu Hause und zerzupft die Meßgewänder, eines nach dem andern; aber der Arzt soll alles leisten mit seiner zarten chirurgischen Hand“ (1994: 204-05).

Während die Familie des Kranken und die Dorfältesten den Arzt entkleiden, ihn beim Kopf und bei den Füßen nehmen und ihn ins Bett zu dem kranken Jungen genau an die Seite der Wunde legen, begleitet sie vor dem Haus der Gesang eines Schulchors mit dem Lehrer, die folgendes singen: „Entkleide ihn, dann wird er heilen,/Und heilt er nicht, so tötet ihn!/,^Sist nur ein Arzt, `sist nur ein Arzt“ (1994: 205). Der Kranke sagt zu dem Arzt, dass sein Vertrauen zu ihm sehr gering sei und dass er, anstatt ihm zu helfen, das Sterbebett einenge und er ihm am liebsten die Augen auskratzen würde. Weiters fügt er noch hinzu, dass er mit einer schönen Wunde auf die Welt kam und sie seine ganze Ausstattung gewesen sei. Darauf sagt der Landarzt, die Wunde sei nicht so schlimm und denkt an seine eigene Rettung. Er hebt seine Kleidung und Instrumententasche, besteigt den Pferdewagen und macht sich auf den Weg nach Hause.

Auf der Rückfahrt ziehen die Pferde „langsam wie alte Männer durch die Schneewüste“ (1994: 206), begleitet von dem „irrtümlichen Gesang“ (1994: 206) des Schulchors: „Freuet Euch, Ihr Patienten,/Der Arzt ist Euch ins Bett gelegt!“ (1994: 206). Die Erzählung endet im monologischen Klagen: „Niemals komme ich so nach Hause“ [...] „Nackt, dem Froste dieses unglücklichsten Zeitalters ausgesetzt, mit irdischem Wagen, unirdischen Pferden treibe ich mich alter Mann umher“ (1994: 206). Er fühlt sich als ein Versager, alleingelassen und betrogen: „Betrogen! Betrogen! Einmal dem Fehlläuten der Nachtglocke gefolgt –es ist niemals gutzumachen“ (1994: 207).

Der Text ist in Prosaform geschrieben. Die Zeitform, die im Text verwendet wird, schwankt; er beginnt im Präteritum und endet im Präsens. Über den Charakter der Figuren ist wenig zu erfahren. Von dem Gang der Erzählung kann man nur erschließen, dass der Hauptprotagonist, der Arzt, einen sehr pflichtbewussten Menschen verkörpert. Die anderen Figuren sind eher „statisch“ dargestellt; Rosa, das Dienstmädchen, scheint eine fürsorgliche Figur zu sein, sucht nach einem Pferd für ihren Herren wird dabei zum Opfer von Gewalt. Der Knecht zeigt hinterlistige und gewalttätige Züge. Der kranke Junge und die Dorfbewohner werden als zurückhaltend und misstrauisch dargestellt. Die Figuren in der Erzählung scheinen ein distanziertes, professionelles Verhältnis zu pflegen, wobei sich das bei dem Landarzt allmählich ändert, als der Knecht sich dem Dienstmädchen Rosa physisch nähert, treten bei ihm verdrängte Gefühle auf.

Kafkas Parabel „Ein Landarzt“ im Strudel der Interpretationen – Abriss der Deutungsansätze

Die Literaturwissenschaft hat sich intensiv mit Kafkas „Ein Landarzt“ auseinandergesetzt, da sie „als der schwierigste und dunkelste aller Kafka-Texte“ (Schärf, 2000: 153) gilt. Laut Schärf ist gerade „das Phänomen der Undeutbarkeit“, dass am meisten zu beunruhigen scheint (2000: 153).

Der Grazer Professor Hans Helmut Hiebel schlug 1984 die wahrscheinlich bisher ausführlichste Interpretation des Textes vor. Hiebel verwendete die S/Z Methode von Roland Barthes, die auf fünf narrativen Codes basiert, um eine

Strukturanalyse durchzuführen, das heißt, eine Satz-für-Satz-Interpretation, bei der der Text in die kleinsten Deutungstücken zerlegt und analysiert wird. Nach Hiebel handelt diese Erzählung „von der Macht und Ohnmacht des Arztes, vom nackten Körper und dem Begehren, der symbolischen Kastration und dem Tod“ (Hiebel, 1984: 34). Von dem psychoanalytischen Ansatz ausgehend deutet er die Erzählung wie folgt:

„Aus dem Neutrum („es“) wird das Femininum („sie“), aus dem Ne-uter, dem Geschlechtslosen, wird die Utra, die Andersgeschlechtliche, welche erst das Zirkulieren des Begehrens möglich macht. Die Analogien und Oppositionen verdichten sich: es/sie, Mann/Frau, Herr/Knecht, Erwachsener/Kind, aktiv/passiv, bekleidet/nackt. Im Maße wie sich „es“ zu „sie“ transformiert, verwandelt sich der Bekleidete in den Nackten, der Aktive in den Passiven, der Herr in den Knecht, der Angstfreie in den Geängstigten. Die rosa Wunde der Kastration bzw. des Todes erweist sich als ansteckend“ (1984: 34-5).

Wiebrecht Ries interpretiert die Erzählung als „einzig[e] phantastische[r]n Angsttraum“, der mit ganz neuartigen Traumtechniken erzählt wird (Ries, 1993: 80). Er bezeichnet Kafka als einen „Paraboliker der Undurchdringlichkeit“ und sieht eine klare „geistige“ Verbindung zwischen ihm und dem „Erforscher des Unbewussten, Freud“. Nach Ries lassen sich mehrere Passagen als „traumhafte Wiederkehr des Verdrängten“ lesen (1993: 80).

In einem Aufsatz von 1999 schreibt Hiebel, wiederum an Barthes Theorie angelehnt, dass es sich beim Landarzt um einen „reversiblen“ Text handelt, was im Grunde ein Merkmal des „prototypischen modernen Texts“ bildet (Hiebel, 1999: 165). Er ist der Meinung, dass sich Kafkas Text nach den Gesetzen der „Traumdeutung“ von Freud vervollständigt (1999: 170). Doch was bei Kafka anders ist als bei Freud, ist die Tatsache, dass das „Es“ über das „Ich“ siegt (1999: 171). Weiterhin meint er, dass Kafka ganz bewusst die psychoanalytischen Theorien nachahme, jeweils mit ihnen konkurriere (1999: 173).

Walter Busch versuchte in einem Aufsatz von 2004 Kafkas „Schreibbewegung“ nachzufolgen. Laut Busch lässt sich der Text als „ein Strömen“, eine Reihe von „Schlüsselmetaphern“ (Busch, 2004: 25) lesen und fasst seine Auffassung wie folgt zusammen:

„Im Vergleich zur Poetik der Parabel und zur gestischen Sprache, die andere Texte der Sammlung charakterisieren, tritt Kafka in unserem Text einen Schritt zurück und artikuliert die Konfigurationen der Metapher und des Körpers, sofern sie in den künstlerischen Diskursen seiner Epoche virulent und Teil der eigenen Schreibbewegung waren“ (2004: 24).

Er stellt fest, dass diese Erzählung den Grundstein der „Problematik des Gesamtbandes“ darstellt, und zwar handelt es sich hier um „die Legitimation des Schreibens und der schriftstellerischen Existenz“ (2004: 25). Weiters deckt Busch die verschiedenen Textsignale auf eine einzige Kombination aus expressionistischen und surrealistischen Impulsen im Text auf. Er schreibt, „Der Surrealist imaginiert als

real, was nur als Traum und Obsession Realität hat“ (2004:28) und verweist auf eine Reihe von surrealistischen Signalen im Text. Nach Busch seien mehrere Szenen im Text surreal, wie die Ankunft des Arztes im Dorf, die Bettszene mit dem Jungen, die Wunde des Patienten und der Aufbruch aus dem Schweinestall (2004: 28). Um einer Interpretation des Textes gerecht zu werden, ruft Busch Kafkas Tagebücher zur Hilfe, die laut ihm „eine Allegorie der Lektüre“ bieten und stellt fest: „Kafka bezeichnet in der Schreibbewegung das Gewaltmoment, das ihr unauslöschlich zugehört“ (2004: 40).

Nach Christian Schärf erfüllt „Der Landarzt“ Kafkas hohe „ästhetische Ansprüche an einen Text“ (Schärf, 2000: 153). Im Gegensatz zu den obengenannten Interpreten äußert sich Schärf kritisch über die sexualneurotischen Interpretationen und empfindet sie als rein spekulativ. Weiters wundert er sich, wie niemand auf die Idee gekommen ist, dass der Text an sich eher etwas Humorvolles enthalte. Er fügt noch hinzu, dass nirgends in der neueren Literatur so gelacht werden könnte wie bei dieser Erzählung und dass „nirgends soviel pathologisches Untergangsgefühl gesehen wurde, wie es hier der Fall ist“ (2000: 157).

„An die Stelle eines Sinnzusammenhangs tritt das Grotteske unwahrscheinlicher Fügungen und, vermittelt darüber, der Humor. Die Tatsache, daß kaum einmal der Humor beim Landarzt auch nur erwähnt worden ist und sich die Interpreten statt dessen auf die sexualneurotische Befindlichkeit des Autors zu stürzen, als wollten sie ihn vor sich selbst retten und als habe er den Text nur deshalb geschrieben, um von der Forschung vor sich selbst gerettet zu werden, ist an sich schon unbegreiflich“ (2000: 156).

Ihm zufolge ist dieser Text nichts weniger als eine geniale „Selbstzeugung“. In jedem Satz von Kafka, schreibt Schärf, „verbirgt sich vor allem in ihrer Abfolge eine ganze Existenz, eine komplexe Weltsicht, ein von sich selbst humoristisch überrolltes Denken, das keine Grenzen kennt und keine anerkennt“ (2000: 157). Interessant ist auch die Aussage Schärfs, dass sich Kafka in diesem Text nicht mit Freud interpretieren lässt, sondern gegen ihn (2000: 157). Er zieht den Schluss, dass in diesem Text deutlich gezeigt wird, wie der moderne Mensch den Verlust der Religion erlebt und in welcher Weise das Verlorene wiederherzustellen wäre, und zwar „im Verzicht auf den Akt der Interpretation“ (2000: 165).

Wir haben gesehen, dass es eine Vielfalt widersprechender Deutungsansätzen im Bezug auf die Erzählung „Der Landarzt“ gibt: von Hiebels Strukturanalyse über den sozialkritischen Ansatz von Schärf, die phantastische Angsttraum-Struktur von Ries bis hin zu den Metapherfeldern von Busch.

Am plausibelsten erscheint der sozialkritische Ansatz von Schärf, aber auch der von Busch. Der Text „Ein Landarzt“ könnte als eine Kritik an den Berufsmenschen der modernen Zeit gelten. Für den Arzt „gibt es nur Dienst- und Pflichtverhältnisse“ (Busch, 2004: 25), was implizit den modernen Menschen darstellt. Der Arzt lässt Rosa im Stich, obwohl sie ihn braucht, um seine Pflicht zu erfüllen. Dann stellt es sich heraus, dass er seiner Pflicht nicht nachkommen kann, weil er das Private, Rosa, nicht aus dem Kopf bringt, und als er sich entscheidet, zurückzukehren, um ihr zu helfen, ist es leider zu spät. Der Landarzt ist im Grunde

ein desorientierter gespaltener „moderner“ Mensch. Er kann dem Jungen nicht helfen, der an einer Wunde erkrankt ist, und sich selbst kann er von der innerlichen Wunde (dem Dienstmädchen Rosa) auch nicht wegbringen. So scheitert er privat wie auch beruflich. Insofern erscheint Schärfs Humor-Ansatz nachvollziehbar, denn es wird der moderne Mensch ausgelacht, der in den Vordergrund die berufliche Pflicht stellt, aber die Vernachlässigung der Privatbedürfnisse provoziert schlussendlich auch Berufsprobleme, die zur Selbstzerstörung führen könnten.

Kafkas „Ein Landarzt“: eine moderne Parabel oder literarische Rätselgrube?

Von den obigen Interpretationsansätzen haben wir gesehen, dass die Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“ schwer zu deuten ist. Aber für diesen Aufsatz ist es von Interesse herauszufinden, inwieweit dieser Text von Kafka als eine Parabel gilt und das Attribut „moderne Parabel“ zugeschrieben werden kann.

Hiebel meint, dass die Offenheit ein besonderes Merkmal des modernen Textes sei. Anlehnend an Barthes ruft er den Leser zur „produktiven Mitarbeit“ bzw. zum „Neu-Schreiben des Textes“ (Hiebel, 1999:180) auf. Für Busch ist sie eine „Parabel, die die dichterische Inspiration auf ihrem Weg durch die Welt der Körper beschreibt“ (Busch, 2004: 38). Schärf geht der Analyse der Textsorte nach und zieht einen Vergleich zwischen Legende, Märchen und Sage. Da hier das glückliche Ende fehlt, schließt er das Märchen aus. Die Sage, genauer gesagt die Armen-Seelen-Sage, bezeichnet Schärf als eine „Untergangserzählung“ (Schärf, 2000: 158). Er schließt daraus, dass die von dieser Struktur erzeugte Textsorte weder eine Legende noch eine Sage oder ein Märchen sei, „sondern als Aufhebung aller drei Textsorten an- und durcheinander sich selbst als neuen Mythos installiert“ (2000: 160). Daraus entsteht laut ihm eine neue „mythologische Dimension“, die er „Körper der Schrift“ nennt (2000: 160). Die Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“ kann auch als eine Reihe von Fragmenten gesehen werden. Heinz Politzer zufolge sind Fragmente die einzige Form, in der sich Kafkas Stil vollende (Politzer, 1965: 28). Er meint, dass Kafka ein „Meister der offenen Form“ sei. (1965: 29) und ist der Ansicht, dass die Gleichnisse von Kafka genauso vielschichtig seien wie die biblischen Parabeln. Im Gegensatz zu den Parabeln der Bibel seien Kafkas Gleichnisse mehrdeutig und fänden so viele Deutungen wie Leser. Laut Politzer ist es die Offenheit der Form, die dem Leser eine „totale Projektion seines eigenen Dilemmas auf Seiten Franz Kafkas“ (1965: 42-3) ermöglicht. „Diese Parabeln sind ‚Rohrschachtests‘ der Literatur und ihre Deutung sagt mehr über den Charakter ihrer Deuter als über das Wesen ihres Schöpfers“, so Politzer (1965: 42-3). Für Henriette Herwig erinnert die Art und Weise, wie der Arzt mit dem kranken Jungen spricht, an die heilige Schrift bzw. „an den Vers in Jesu Gleichnis vom königlichen Hochzeitsmahl“ [...] „Mit ihr nimmt der Arzt als falscher Messias eine symbolische Aufwertung der Wunde zur Auszeichnung vor“ (Herwig, 2017: 512).

Wenn wir bedenken, dass die klassische Version der „parabolé“, die eine rhetorische Funktion hatte und als Strategie der „persuasio“, der Überzeugung, diente und ein Analogieangebot bot, scheint dies alles in der Erzählung vom Landarzt zu fehlen. Während die aufklärerische Parabel in sich eine Entkleidung und Verhüllung einer Lehre trug und zum Vollzug aufforderte, scheint die Erzählung auch das wieder nicht zu haben. Wenn so vieles dagegen spricht, stellt sich die

Frage, ob ein derartiger Text wie Kafkas Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“, der als „dunkel“ und „undeutbar“ bezeichnet wird, überhaupt der Gattung Parabel zugeordnet bzw. klassifiziert werden kann.

Die klassische Parabel ist sehr kurz, prägnant und sagt etwas voraus. Im Gegensatz dazu umfasst die Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“ ungefähr sieben Seiten, was sehr lang ist, also eine größere Form. Daher ist zu schließen, dass sie als eine parabelhafte Dichtung und eher als ausgeweitete moderne Parabel gelten könnte.

Die Erzählung trägt aber auch Merkmale, die einer modernen Parabel zugeschrieben werden. Sie ist kryptisch, bleibt offen und sagt nichts voraus. Statt Antworten zu geben, lässt sie offene Fragen, daraus ergibt sich ein „Horizont offener Möglichkeiten“ (Elm, 1991: 9). Dem Leser bleibt vieles unklar und undeutbar: Was passiert mit Rosa? Stirbt der junge Mann oder stirbt er nicht? Was passiert eigentlich mit dem Hauptdarsteller, dem Landarzt? Kommt er zurück? Und wenn ja, kann er Rosa helfen? Eine klare Lehre kann man aus dem Text nicht ziehen. Mehr als eine Parabel scheint „Der Landarzt“ ein literarisches Rätsel zu sein. Der Arzt ist: „Nackt, dem Froste[...] ausgesetzt“ (Kafka, 1994: 206), ebenso ist der Leser nackt dem Rätselentschlüsselung ausgeliefert.

Wenn wir uns die Aussage von Turner in Erinnerung zurückrufen; „Parabel is the root of the human mind- of thinking, knowing, acting, creating, and plausibly even of speaking“ (Turner, 1996: o.S.), könnte man in diesem Sinne den Schluss ziehen, dass die „kafkasche Parabel“ ein eigenartiges literarisches Gebilde darstellt, dem Literaturdiskurs eine unerschöpfbare Herausforderung in Deutung und Wirkung.

Fazit

In diesem Aufsatz wurde der Versuch unternommen, einen gattungsgeschichtlichen Abriss der Parabel sowie deren Weiterentwicklung von der griechischen Antike bis hin zur modernen Form des 20. Jahrhunderts darzustellen. Als Beispiel für die „Verwandlung“ dieser Gattung wurde Franz Kafkas Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“ vorgestellt. Es wurde versucht darzustellen, inwieweit diese Erzählung als eine „moderne Parabel“ bezeichnet werden kann. Die zahlreichen Interpretationsansätze weisen darauf hin, dass diese Erzählung im traditionellen Sinne keine typischen Merkmale der klassischen Parabel trägt, jedoch lassen sich Elemente der „modernen Parabel“ finden.

Literatur

- Brettschneider, Werner. Die moderne deutsche Parabel. Entwicklung und Bedeutung. Berlin: Schmidt, 1971.
- Busch, Walter. Die Krankheit der Metaphern. Über die Wunde in Kafkas „Ein Landarzt“. In: Franz Kafka „Ein Landarzt“ Interpretationen. Hrsg. v. Elmar Locher und Isolde Schiffermüller, Bozen: Edition Sturzflüge, 2004: 23-40.
- Duden „Etymologie“. Herkunftswörterbuch der deutschen Sprache. 2., völlig neu bearb. u. erw. Aufl. v. Günther Drosdowski. (Bd.7) Mannheim: Dudenverl., 1989.

- Elm, Theo. Die moderne Parabel. Parabel und Parabolik in Theorie und Geschichte. 2., überarb. Aufl. München: Fink, 1991.
- Herwig, Henriette. Der Hausarzt als ohnmächtiger Heiland in Franz Kafkas Erzählung „Ein Landarzt“, ZFA. Ausgabe 12/2017. Web. 2nd August 2020 <https://www.online-zfa.de/fileadmin/user_upload/Heftarchiv/ZFA/article/2017/12/FA712152-808C-4CF8-A7F6-918DC8F09074/FA712152808C4CF8A7F6918DC8F09074_herwig_kafka_1_original.pdf>.
- Hiebel, Hans Helmut. Der reversible Text und die zirkuläre „Différance“: „Ein Landarzt“ In: Franz Kafka: Form und Bedeutung: Formanalysen und Interpretationen von Vor dem Gesetz, Das Urteil, Bericht für eine Akademie, Ein Landarzt, Der Bau, Der Steuermann, Prometheus, Der Verschollene, Der Proceß und ausgewählten Aphorismen. Würzburg: Königshausen und Neumann, 1999: 164-180.
- Hiebel, Hans Helmut. Franz Kafka: „Ein Landarzt“. München: Fink, 1984.
- Kafka, Franz. Ein Landarzt und andere Drucke zu Lebzeiten. Frankfurt/Main: Fischer, 1994.
- Killy, Walter (Hg.): Literaturlexikon. Begriffe, Realien, Methoden. München: Bertelsmann, 1993.
- Lahn, Silke und Jan Christoph Meister. Einführung in die Erzähltextanalyse, 2., aktual. Aufl., Stuttgart/Weimar: Springer-Verlag, 2013.
- Politzer, Heinz. Franz Kafka, der Künstler. Frankfurt/Main, 1965.
- Poser, Therese (Hg.) Arbeitstexte für den Unterricht. Parabeln. Für die Sekundarstufe. Stuttgart: Reclam, 1978.
- Ries, Wiebrecht. Die symbolischen Wunden. Ein Landarzt. In: Kafka zur Einführung. Hamburg: Junius, 1993: 79-91.
- Schärf, Christian. Franz Kafka. Poetischer Text und Heilige Schrift. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht, 2000.
- Turner, Mark. The Literary Mind. The Origins of Thought and Language. Oxford/ New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- von Goethe, Johann Wolfgang: Wilhelm Mesiters Wanderjahre oder die Entsagenden. Erstdruck: Stuttgart und Tübingen (Cotta) 1821, in erweiterter Form in: Werke, Ausgabe letzter Hand, Stuttgart (Cotta) 1829. Vollständige Neuausgabe mit einer Biographie des Autors. Herausgegeben von Karl-Maria Guth. Berlin, 2016.



Mahsa Sadat Razavi¹
Maryam Soltan Beyad²

DOI: 10.31902/LL.2019.7.6

MAPPING THE JOURNEY: A STUDY OF MATURING FEMININITY IN ALICE MUNRO'S *LIVES OF GIRLS AND WOMEN*

Abstract: *Opposed to the anxiety of influence supposedly suffered by male writers with regard to their predecessors, Gilbert and Gubar (2000) propounded the concept of anxiety of authorship to hold true for female writers. According to this theory, women joined in a sorority with their literary foremothers in their efforts to prove their worthiness in taking up the male vocation of writing. In Alice Munro's short story collection Lives of Girls and Women, the mother is ever-present in her daughter's mind, and their relationship is instrumental in her maturation as a woman and a writer. In this paper, the relationship between the two women is explained in terms of some of the notions put forth in Gilbert and Gubar's The Madwoman in the Attic, namely the angel/monster dichotomy, the anxiety of authorship, female double consciousness, infection in the sentence, and the parable of the cave. Using these concepts, it is aimed to show that although these notions were proposed as a model for 19th century woman writers, the modern-day Del is yet to come to terms with the anxiety of authorship and its accompanying problems.*

Key words: *Angel/Monster Dichotomy, Anxiety of Authorship, Female Double Consciousness, Infection in the Sentence, Parable of the Cave*

Introduction

A comprehensive reading of some influential theories put forth by critics with regard to influence and its role in the maturation of writers revealed that they were not applicable to the case of a modern woman deciding to take up the pen: they either completely excluded women from consideration, or else focused solely on female writers and poets of 19th century, whose situation markedly differed from that of their descendants. Thus, this research was conducted as an attempt to answer a pressing question: "How does the modern woman conceive of her art with relation to her female predecessors?" Alice Munro's *Lives of Girls and Women* was chosen for this discussion since it powerfully portrayed an emerging woman writer, and readily yielded to the task of providing a means for an analysis of influence as it affected the female literary scene.

Munro is regarded as a chronicler of women's lives, since them and their problems are extensively featured in her works. For instance, Thacker recognizes *Lives of Girls and Women* as "a feminist *cri de Coeur*" (2). Munro reverses the fairy-tale notion that women need protection, and portrays women managing to brave the world on their own (Löschnigg, 117). She usually investigates this notion with regard to the institution of marriage and gender roles as they are practiced in households. In her works, gender relies upon a "myth of home and family" in which

¹ PhD candidate at the University of Tehran (Iran).

² Associate professor at the University of Tehran (Iran).

a "father and mother [are] devoted to the moral and/or spiritual well-being of their offspring" (*The Fantasy of Family* 5). She also places special emphasis on how girls construct their gender identities; for instance, Del is shown encountering traditional gender roles, and despite her young age, choosing her own way of dealing with them (Chang 29). According to Chang, the central focal point for Munro is the notion of gender differences; how a boy adopts the attitudes deemed fit for his sex, while the girl, lacking a role model, uneasily adopts the inferior status that patriarchy assigns her (31). Munro moves beyond this male vs. female struggle, and presents the reader with a bigger and more comprehensive picture of life (Beran 77).

More often than not, she opts to show these gender roles play against each other in her depiction of family relations, highlighting those between mothers and daughters. Murphy identifies past connections, especially familial ones, to be important in Munro as well, particularly in *Lives of Girls and Women* (46). As governing matriarchs, mothers suffer all the trouble that their rule entails, while having to face being overthrown by their own offspring. They are recurring themes in Munro (43), and in family-focused stories, they are shown juggling different tasks, and sometimes feeling inadequate and insufficient in the roles traditional gender division ascribes them (Löschnigg 121-3). Hallvard Dahlie too recognizes Munro's mothers to be "unfulfilled and despairing" (215). Löschnigg states that "inseparable from the Munroian mother-figure, who often also struggles to assert her identity as an artist, is the family home, which is depicted as the space against which male and female gender-scripts are pointedly accentuated" (123). Munro's relationship to the mother can be further explained in terms of personal issues; apparently, her own mother was ailing and in decline (Staines 33). Even when mothers are not ailing, they are resented, as if the constant battle between mothers and offerings has worn them throughout the years. But this battle for primacy is very important in the construction of one's character, and thus focused on in Munro, because "intimate yet attentive knowledge about one's mother leads to unsparing self-knowledge" (Hay 267). *Lives of Girls and Women*, with its foregrounding of the emotional ties between a mother and daughter, is very much based on Munro's experience, as John Metcalf reports her having said that the "emotional reality" of the work is completely based on her own life (58). The ever-lasting connection to the past usually seen in Munro is thus defined by Murphy:

"The typical writer in Munro's fiction is, then, ambivalent about her work but driven to do it. She struggles for representative accuracy, which failures of love and/or talent undercut. Munro's writers labor to connect memory and identity, and the problems inherent in such connection provide the central conflicts of Munro's fiction. But always, connection itself is the subsuming theme. Three kinds of connection are especially important to the Munro *Weltanschauung*: travel, the connection of one place to another in a journey replete with metaphorical meaning; change, the connection between past and present; and sexual love, probably the most fundamental and highly problematic of human connections". (45)

Each of the three connections mentioned above find their ultimate representation in one of the three writers: Ada travels and leaves her family behind in order to carve out a separate identity for herself, Del hunts after sexual gratification as setting herself apart from her mother, and lastly, Munro changes names and immediate surroundings in order to explore her troubling bond with the Mother.

The *Lives's* affinities with the Künstlerroman gives the reader ample opportunity to view the woman-in-the-make that is Del; and its episodic nature highlights the stages she goes through in her maturation. Therefore, studying it in terms of the theories of Gilbert and Gubar can reveal the secrets behind Del's construction of identity, and can additionally provide the readers with a better understanding of how modern female writers conceive of their works.

Discussion

1. Angel/Monster Dichotomy

Because men have been the authoritative guardians of the pen, they have wielded great power over the way women are represented, castigating those who pose a threat to their own monarchy. Those women who refused to be shut off in these restrictive roles were invariably depicted as evil step mothers or envious queens whose greatest desire was to have their virginal daughters dead. Both these types show that women "can appear from certain points of view to stand both under and over (but really simply outside of) the sphere of culture's hegemony" (Ortner 86). As a result of this, women are bereft of autonomy, since they are not part of the culture, but are the Others that culture faces with either respect or hatred (*Madwoman* 19-20).

Del is no stranger to this rigid dichotomy, as her small town is fraught with its manifestations, yet she has to decide where she stands with regard to it. As is typical of a Munro heroine, Del is fascinated with femininity, both behavioral and physical (Löschnigg 116-7). She can see different types of femininity represented by the women she has come to know in her lifetime. Mainly, she is indecisive about the two models advocated by her mother and the town: one requires her to repress her femininity and the other demands that she adhere to certain criteria for gendered behavior, but neither one of which particularly appeals to her (116).

Her Aunt Elspeth and Auntie Grace are good embodiments of the traditional and respectable female, who focus their tremendous energies on their house chores and gossiping (*Lives* 33-4). Observing Nile, her uncle's wife, Del realizes by "the aunt's gross exaggeration of femininity, . . . that the gendered identity is not a natural characteristic of women and that the aunt has failed to internalize this" (Chang 32). Similarly, she is rather troubled by the way girls like those who work at the Creamery are always unnaturally impeccable, and is confused when Naomi begins dressing up and adhering to the same rigid standards (*Lives* 142-3). She herself tries to adapt to what is expected of her to some degree, as when during the episode at the Gay-la Dance Hall, she tries to adhere to the attitude expected of her, laughing and dancing so as to appease her male partner's demands (*Lives* 149, 51). Elsewhere, she allows Jerry to get away with his sexist slurs about the capacity of

her brain (155), without pointing out to him how his ego is being protected by her "feminine sensibility" (*Alice Munro* 44).

On the other hand, Del gets to know the Jubilee monsters, or else, those women who openly defy the society's rules. Among them, her own mother stands out, since she practically engages in anything the town finds outrageous. Gilbert and Gubar have pointed out that a woman who chooses writing is viewed as a monster, immoral, and a sexually-defected or over-sexed demon (63); and Cinda Gault maintains that "Addie's association with the conventionally masculine narrative of facts in her encyclopedias" make her appear manly (448-9). To Del, her mother is the virgin who does not understand much of the realm of sexuality, something which is of grave importance to herself. Del hankers after the passion which their small town only acknowledges for men (Löschnigg 118). The mother's version of womanhood is not completely unappealing to Del, since it allows for her possession of an intellectual side; nonetheless, it fails to meet her other needs.

None of the options that this society permits Del sounds satisfactory: no matter the choice, she would lose a great portion of her identity. Therefore, she decides to transcend the dichotomy, fuse the two poles, and she thus phrases this desire: "I wanted men to love me, and I wanted to think of the universe when I looked at the moon" (*Lives* 144). Douglas Glover notes how Munro takes care to place the sexual and nonsexual side by side in her volume, thus fusing the two previously-separated spheres (98). These fusions could be attributed to Del, since she is the narrator of these tales. Thus, they may be regarded as Del's efforts in combining the two realms in her narrative in order to do away with the mutual exclusivity of the virginal and perversely sexual. Further, Del writes two women into fiction, and in their portrayal, fuses the two opposite stereotypes in order to depict women as they truly are.

The first woman to be sketched in the volume is her own mother, Ada. In her revised version of this ancient dichotomy, Del casts the mother as the harrowing virgin, a girl in a woman's body who is terrified of sex, and shies away from explicit sexuality. Her pureness is doubly glaring since from a young age she was sexually molested by her brother, a fact she never clearly expresses. Although according to Victorian codes of conduct, the angel had "no story of her own to tell," (*Madwoman* 22) and was merely a chasm to be filled with meaning as men deemed fit, Del shows Ada to be very outspoken indeed. She goes door to door selling encyclopedias, travelling the country roads (*Lives* 57), refusing to be circumscribed by her condition as a poor mother of two in rural Canada. She writes extensively to papers, advocating the use of birth control, using the pseudonym "Princes Ida" (69-70). The ironic undertones of a woman who is very much against sex and regards it as a subjugation to men advertising birth control under the pseudonym of Tennyson's angel is quite notable. This untraditional angel has fallen from grace, and satanically opposes religion.

Del's second and more original creation is presented in the epilogue to the collection, entitled "The Photographer", in which she tells the story of Caroline, a waif loosely based on Marion Sherriff, who courts her own doom. This is not a new strategy, since Ann Douglas had well shown how women engaged in a "domestication of death" by drinking vinegar, becoming anorexic, or tightly lacing

their corsets so as to facilitate their illness and ultimate death. These methods were practiced in order to gain power, because the tombstone was “the sacred emblem in the cult of the overlooked” (202). Through dying, these subjugated women would be granted seat and dominance over the realm of the dead, or as Welsh puts it, “the power of an angel to save implies, even while it denies, the power of death” (182-3). The uniqueness of Del’s Caroline, and the reason it helps break the dichotomy of female representation is that it is a modified Gothic tale. This description of Caroline will greatly help prove the point (*Lives* 192).

As Coral Ann Howells maintains, Del is not satisfied with the Gothic genre, because it displaces female knowledge and sexuality with fear and fleeing (“Alice Munro” 77). Thus, she creates a Gothic tale in which the anorexic dead woman is reincarnated and drags men to the underworld; precisely because she used to be the dead angel, she can be reborn as the monster who brings death to others. When she meets The Photographer, the death-like man with the camera, she gives herself to him “without the tender contempt, indifferent readiness she showed to other men, but with straining eagerness and hope and cries” (*Lives* 193). It may be claimed that because he is a photographer, he could be the embodiment of the male gaze that views women through a lens. When the photographer vanishes, and Caroline can feel “her womb swollen like a hard yellow gourd in her belly”, she drowns herself in the river (193). What is noteworthy here is that Caroline is doubly killed by art, once by the art of the photographer who captures her, and the second time, by the woman who freezes her in words, that is, Del. In her tale, Del combines the angel and the monster to create Caroline, a woman who chooses her own doom, and in so doing, asserts her autonomy over patriarchy. Caroline is the one who runs after the photographer, and then at the end, walks into her own death in the river, but not before bringing death to her persecutors.

2. Anxiety of Authorship: The Dreadful Vocation

Anxiety of authorship results from women’s uneasiness about their authorial will, since that amount of aggressiveness has been socially barred to them. This common anxiety creates a bond between women, making them effective members of a sorority against patriarchy (*Madwoman* 51). When being an author means “mistaking one’s ‘sex and way’” and “becoming an ‘unsexed’ or perversely sexed female”, it makes a woman be seen as “a monster or freak” (34-5). *Lives of Girls and Women*, depicts three writers in their literary endeavors, namely Uncle Craig, Del, and Ada, and shows the reader how these efforts are received in society. As the stories in this book clearly demonstrate, when deciding to opt for a career in literature, one is bound to face different receptions according to one’s sex. Uncle Craig, as the male writer depicted in the work, spends his days typing away endless trivia about Jubilee (*Lives* 32), trying to endow the town and his family with a grace he feels is owed to them. Although his efforts amount to nothing more than a family history, he and his work are treated with utmost respect by his sisters (32-3), who may be seen as quintessential members of a rural community. This is in direct contrast to the attitude the same ladies give Ada and her literary endeavors (36). Del, as a member of this sexist society, is not exempt from its attacks, and has to

tolerate sexist slurs in addition to bearing the brunt of the criticism leveled at her mother.

In "Princess Ida", Del recounts how she became aware of the illegitimacy of her love for words. Out with her mother selling encyclopedias, she felt "complacent" and confident in her right to pursuing knowledge (*Lives* 59). She was not yet aware how to most members of her community, knowledge was "just oddity", as unseemly as "warts" (58). On one of these outings, and as she was about to recite the name of presidents, the reality of the situation dawned on her (59). After this realization, she felt physically sick, and never again agreed to recite from the encyclopedias. What Del experienced was the anxiety of authorship, which accompanied her realization that according to the town, her thirst for knowledge was an anomaly. Ada herself apparently does not experience such feelings of shame, as she claims, they are "the luxuries" that she "could never afford" (59). But this refusal of hers affects her daughter, since Del is the one who takes the brunt of the sneers directed at her mother. By way of alleviating this shame and anxiety, she decides to fight discreetly, a tactic which will be discussed fully in the next section.

3. Female Double Consciousness: The Rebellious Second Sex

As Gilbert and Gubar have shown in their book, some female writers such as the Brontës attempted to reduce patriarchal opposition to their works by adopting male pseudonyms or view points, while covertly propounding their own ideas. This double consciousness was internalized in order to come to terms with and reduce the anxiety of authorship (73). Ada does not develop this double consciousness, since instead of planning coups against patriarchy, she wages war against it, but Del develops it early on in her interactions with men. Charlotte Brontë is a role model for Del, and she herself declares so when reading about the writer's life (*Lives* 154). With the exception of the failed Baptism, she does not oppose patriarchy and its tenets in an outrageous way. She excels in the internalization of this double consciousness, something her mother has never been able to adopt since she equates it with duplicity and prudish provinciality.

Del clearly differentiates between intellectual and physical submission to men, and this knowledge enables her to enjoy the pleasures of the flesh they have to offer. In her encounter with Mr. Chamberlain, she retains her integrity very well. She does enjoy his sensual and secretive assaults, but when alone with him at the fields, she turns the tables on him. Playing the role of the girl who has been only recently awakened to sexuality and is still baffled by it, she turns into a voyeur, and watches Mr. Chamberlain as he masturbates and falls to sexual abandonment. She is not in the least excited or amazed at the spectacle he has put on display, instead describes the whole incident in such clinical terms (*Lives* 135-136) that it becomes apparent that the whole event has been an experiment on her part. A similar pattern is shown in her relations with Garnet French. She succumbs to his advances as long as they bring her gratification and relieve her of sexual tension, but when he wants to abuse the leash he has on her, she reacts by tearing it to shreds. She wonders how he could have possibly assumed that he or anyone else could have any sort of real power over her (187). She refuses to become a victim, instead opting to show her nimbleness in every move. However, Garnet is aware of Del's lack of real submission, and that is

why he tries to force her into a baptism (*Lives* 187). This is probably owing to the fact that suppressors are aware that as a result of their subordination, the suppressed may harbor rebellious thoughts and only submit in appearance (*Madwoman* 73-4).

Adopting and developing a double consciousness has its own harmful effects, sometimes it can make the woman writer feel caged and repressed, and at other times, it can damage the work, making it look flawed (*Madwoman* 74). Del is not exempt from feeling this way. She has to keep her feelings to herself, and refrain from showing them, which mostly leaves her feeling repressed and unable to defend herself. When her sexual experiment with Jerry goes awry (*Lives* 162), Del is furious, but when faced with the patriarchal demand to be comradely, she has no choice other than to comply. Similarly, she only internally answers Jerry's sexist notions about women. Also, Del's epilogue to the short story collection, in which she details her version of Marion Sherriff, certainly looks flawed. While in the first section of this chapter, this story was discussed because of its successful fusion of the angel/monster dichotomy, here it will be discussed because of its disturbing elements. Although this story intends to depict a woman who takes control over her life, if read against the grain, shows itself to be quite fatalistic. Caroline, the sensual martyr, is a woman with serious mental issues who rushes to her doom and voluntarily courts death. Thus, the story acts as a chilling foreboding to the horror and psychological confusion awaiting the woman who tries to submit to and fight patriarchy at the same time. According to this story, one thing is certain in this woman's life, and that is her eventual demise.

4. Infection in the Sentence: The Diseased Mother

The literary foremothers, along with support, impart to their daughters the burden of their fight against patriarchy, thus making them afraid and ailing. This infection in the sentence "breeds" and reaches the daughter as she browses the pages written by the mother. As a result, the daughter would find it hard not to resent the mother for the metaphorical "sterility" she imposes on her creative faculties. In the case of Del, this "sterility" is quite literal. Feeding her daughter on the "black milk" of her rage against a system that limits her, Ada has been trying to prepare Del to nurse the same vendetta. But she is not the only one who issues warnings: throughout her journey, Del is haunted by women who echo her mother's words, most notably Naomi's mother (*Lives* 98-9). Also, society is not particularly appreciative of a woman's sex drive, and Naomi says as much when she declares rape victims to be guilty, since "a boy can't help himself" whereas girls should necessarily curb their sexual urges (110).

Throughout the work, Ada shows her resentment towards sex, considering it to be a degradation. For instance, she does not believe Fern and Mr. Chamberlain engage in sexual activities because of being superior to the town's "dirty-mindedness", and calls the Gay-la Dance Hall "Sodom and Gomorrah", the appellation given the place by the Presbyterian Church (*Lives* 119, 147-8). She refuses to share the common belief that Marion Sherriff killed herself because of being pregnant, believing this to be a blow to her reputation (191). Also, Ada does

not approve of Naomi because she fears the potential “contamination” of Del by her “sexual preoccupation” (119).

Murphy points out how in Munro’s works, sex is compelling to young girls because of its mixture of danger and mystery (47). This certainly holds true in Del’s case, since to her, sexual acts are dangerous yet extremely alluring, and in thinking about them, she alternately feels disgust and fascination (*Lives* 46, 39, 41, 120). She sees normality as “the skin of everyday appearances stretched over such shamelessness, such consuming explosions of lust”; thus, she is disappointed with the normal appearance of the town prostitutes and the pamphlets in Fern’s bedroom (124, 133-4), and considers her own sexuality as treacherous (*Lives* 132). When daydreaming about Mr. Chamberlain (124-5), it is important to note that these thoughts do not go further than the moment of nakedness because of Del’s guilt and her ignorance about how initiation is supposed to take place. Her thinking of sex as an animalistic act has resulted in her incapacity to imagine its initiation, that “stage of transition, bridge between what was possible, known and normal behaviour, and the magical, bestial act” (123-4). Therefore, one might attribute her interest in being brutalized (124, 130-1) to the way it would relieve her of the guilt associated with initiating her own debasement. Later on in the short story cycle—and with the introduction of Garnet French—Del is able to overcome these unhealthy sexual thoughts, and fully appreciate carnal knowledge.

5. Parable of the Cave: The Origin of All

In her introduction to *The Last Man*, with its talk of the Cumeaen Sibyl, Mary Shelley relates how she came into contact with the words of wisdom written by her foremother, which she used in her literary efforts. The womb is an ultimately mystical and powerful place, where disparate elements fuse in order to give birth to a new life. Gilbert and Gubar point to a similarity between wombs and caves, declaring that “the womb-shaped cave is also the place of female power, the *umbilicus mundi*, one of the great antechambers of the mysteries of transformation. As herself a kind of cave, every woman might seem to have the cave’s metaphorical power of annihilation” (95). The cave is the place where wandering men meet their demise, but to the cave-dweller herself, it does not pose any threats. Thus, women and their wombs have been feared, since they embody what is dangerous to men (95). In order to preserve itself, patriarchy alienated women from their caves, so that they would not have access to their destructive powers. Since men have traditionally been the guardians of the pen, they conceived of a strong similarity between their pens and the marker of their gender. Taking this into consideration, it becomes easier to understand how a woman who dared take up the pen was seen as a freak, since she was venturing to use the phallic symbol which was extremely unsuitable for her hands. She was mocked, and her literary endeavors were likened to abnormal children. Thus, women’s banishment from a realm of literature was really an extension of the censure imposed on her use of feminine faculties, and as a result, by freeing one’s body from restrictions, one would be able to free her mind from limits as well.

For Del, the pleasures of the flesh and the word are inextricably woven together. This is due to the fact that she sees an exploration of sexuality as a way of

freeing the self and becoming a better writer. Just as Mary Shelley had to ponder over the coded Sibyl's leaves, Del needs to detect animal drives hidden under the façade kept up by society. Throughout the stories, there are numerous instances in which Del seems haunted by sexually-charged words and what they entail (*Lives* 119, 126, 134, 147, 161, 140, 98, 123-4). Despite the clear link between sexuality and writing, and also contrary to the fact that her sexual experimentations liberates her as a writer, Del is dumbfounded when it comes to releasing her body through words. Confronted with Clive's command to dance him "loose", she pores over the meaning it could possibly have, and is unable to forge a link between her body and her mind (*Lives* 149). In a similar situation, she tries to leave her body to Jerry Storey so that he may facilitate her awakening. Lying naked on his bed, this prelude to "making love" sounds more like a grotesque parody of the first sex depicted in romances. Jerry clinically examines her, talking dialect, and urging her to play along with his game (161). This encounter is also sterile as well, since similar to the incident with Clive, it ends with Del walking home alone, ungratified. Del's sexuality is accompanied by a certain muteness, in other words, a mist clouds her mental faculties, and she becomes a woman of flesh. In her relationship with Garnet, instead of verbal communication, there is a silent exchange of sexual favors (180). At the climax of the relationship, the moment of the proposed baptism, Del finds her voice again, and walks away from him as the chiseled writer.

Walking back to Jubilee, her surroundings take on a new meaning quite different from before. In her epilogue, Del gives the reader a sense of what these new impressions entail for her career as a writer. She is interested not in Caroline, but Marion and what had actually happened to her (*Lives* 196-7). She can now understand how human lives are "dull, simple, amazing and unfathomable—deep caves paved with kitchen linoleum" (198), and wishes to explore their hidden depths. Her creation of the Gothic tale of Caroline was necessary in her development as a writer, since it helped her come to terms with the limits patriarchy imposed on her as a woman. But now, as she is sitting with Bobby Sherriff, Marion's brother, she tells the reader how in time, she will hanker after details. She will desire nothing more than to record things, like her Uncle Craig used to do, but this obsession would be "voracious and misguided", since no one could possibly transcribe all the nuances of reality: her hunger for reserving "every last thing, every layer of speech and thought, stroke of light on bark or walls, every smell, pothole, pain, delusion, held still and held together—radiant, everlasting" will never be satiated (198-9). Del's lists would be more glorious than those of her Uncle's, since she would try to include in them all the particles that make up life, weaving the abstract and the concrete in order to create a grand tapestry. As she herself tells the readers in the voice of an omniscient narrator, she will come to yearn for this provincial town (198); Jubilee, with its conservative, old-fashioned inhabitants, shares the germ of life with the rest of the world.

Unfortunately, not all women can use the cave to their advantage, and what could have been an empowering force becomes an impediment. The woman who was subjected to the brutal rejection of her sexuality, became unable to write with a pen, a situation alien to a male writer who is so empowered in his sexuality that he sees his pen as a penis. This frustration and failure to fully achieve one's potentials

can be detected in some of the character of *Lives*, most notably Addie. Addie is not successful in her language-based escape from her conservative society, but she still believes in language's redeeming power. As Cinda Gault asserts, "Addie Jordan's need to do something remarkable with language provides the impetus for her daughter to vindicate her mother's perhaps naïve faith in language by becoming a writer" (453). Therefore, Del follows her mother's path, correcting it as she deems fit, and thus brings it to its target destination. According to Janet Beer, Del's journey ends triumphantly, since at the end of the series, she rejects Garnet as a way of rejecting a fate similar to her mother and Aunt Moira, who are diseased and ailing in their marriages. Del's decision to opt for writerly exile rather than love is quite grand, considering how the stories of men recounted in the volume end "in stasis, with a funeral, with failures of imagination, refusals to change and even regression" (145-6). Just as Mary Shelley came to an understanding of her ancestor's leaves on her own, Del is essentially alone in her journey, although others may have seemed to accompany her. Howells asserts as much when she claims that "Del's love affair has confirmed her sense of isolated selfhood, while giving her some insight into the delicious rhythms of her own body and of the painful contradictions between fantasy and reality" ("Secrets and Discoveries" 46). The relationship with Garnet completes Del's Künstlerroman, bringing her a better understanding of life and making her a free woman, both of which are important in her career as a writer.

Conclusion

In the course of this research, Alice Munro's short story collection entitled *Lives of Girls and Women* was read in terms of some notions developed by Gilbert and Gubar, so as to arrive at a better understanding of the journey its heroine undertakes in order to shape her character as a writer and a woman.

Considering the short story cycle for its portrayals of the angel/monster dichotomy, it can be seen that Del refuses to be limited by either of these sides, instead, juxtaposes the ordinary and the domestic with the wildly sexual so as to do away with them. Other than that, she transcends the dichotomy by the way she portrays two women in her stories, namely, her mother and Marion Sherriff.

Ada does not show signs of being possessed by the anxiety of authorship, since she fully believes in the righteousness of her path. On the other hand, Del is seen as suffering the pangs of this anxiety, as she can witness the resentment her mother's writerly tendencies incite in people.

Checking Ada and Del for their possession of female double consciousness, one can see that since Ada does not suffer from the anxiety of authorship, she has not developed the double consciousness either. On the other hand, Del has resorted to this double consciousness as a way of alleviating her anxiety.

Del is shown to have contracted the infection in the sentence from her mother, since she has plied Del with stories of how devious sexuality is and how it can endanger a woman's autonomy. As a result of this, Del is quite unable to conceive of a healthy sexual relationship; instead, she views the act as an evil and violent deed.

Just like Mary Shelley in the parable of the cave, Del embarks on a journey to understand the coded messages of her predecessor and come to a better understanding of them. Since writing and sexuality are closely linked with each other, Del's exploration of her female space brings about a liberation of her literary energies as well. In her explorations, she experiments with different companions before settling on Garnet as the suitable one.

References

- Beer, Janet. "Short Fiction with Attitude: The Lives of Boys and Men in the *Lives of Girls and Women*." *Bloom's Modern Critical Views: Alice Munro*. Ed. Harold Bloom. Infobase Publishing, 2009. 143-151.
- Beran, Carol L. "Images of Women's Power in Contemporary Canadian Fiction by Women." *Studies in Canadian Literature/Études en littérature canadienne* 15. 2 (1990): N. pag.
- Chang, Jungyoon. "Girls and Gender in Alice Munro's Short Stories." *Asian Women* 32.2 (Summer 2016): 27-47.
- Dahlie, Hallvard. "Alice Munro." *Canadian Writers and Their Works*. Ed. Robert Lecker, Jack David, and Ellen Quigley. Vol. 7. 1985. 215-256.
- Douglas, Ann. *The Feminization of American Culture*. Knopf, 1977.
- Gault, Cinda. "The Two Addies: Maternity and Language in William Faulkner's *As I Lay Dying* and Alice Munro's *Lives of Girls and Women*." *The American Review of Canadian Studies* 36.3 (Fall 2006): 440-57.
- Gilbert, Sandra M., Susan Gubar. *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination*. Yale Nota Bene, 2000.
- Glover, Douglas. "The style of Alice Munro." *The Cambridge Companion to Alice Munro*. Ed. David Staines. Cambridge University Press, 2016. 86-110.
- Hay, Elizabeth. "The Mother as Material." *The Cambridge Companion to Alice Munro*. Ed. David Staines. Cambridge University Press, 2016. 267-283.
- Howells, Coral A. "Alice Munro: *Lives of Girls and Women*, *The Beggar Maid*." *Private and Fictional Words: Canadian Women Novelists of the 1970s and 1980s*. Routledge, 1987. 71-88.
- , "Secrets and Discoveries: *Lives of Girls and Women*." *Alice Munro*. Manchester University Press, 1998. 31-50.
- Löschnigg, Maria. "'Oranges and Apples': Alice Munro's Undogmatic Feminism." *The Cambridge Companion to Alice Munro*. Ed. David Staines. Cambridge University Press, 2016. 111-142.
- Munro, Alice. "A Conversation with Alice Munro." Interview by John Metcalf. *Journal of Canadian Fiction* 1.4 (1972): N. pag.
- , *Lives of Girls and Women: A Novel*. Penguin Group, 2009.
- Murphy, Georgean. "The Art of Alice Munro: Memory, Identity, and the Aesthetics of Connection." *Bloom's Modern Critical Views: Alice Munro*. Ed. Harold Bloom. Infobase Publishing, 2009. 41-56.
- Ortner, Sherry B. "Is Female to Male as Nature is to Culture?" *Woman, Culture, and Society*. Ed. Michelle Zimbalist Rosaldo and Louise Lamphère. Stanford University Press, 1974. N. pag.

- Ross, Catherine Sheldrick. "Alice Munro." In *Dictionary of Literary Biography*, edited by W. H. New. Vol.53. Gale Research Inc., 1986.
- Staines, David. "From Wingham to Clinton: Alice Munro in Her Canadian Context." *The Cambridge Companion to Alice Munro*. Ed. Staines. Cambridge University Press, 2016. 23-54.
- Thacker, Robert. "Introduction: Alice Munro's 'Approach and Recognition.'" *Alice Munro: 1973-2013*. University of Calgary Press, 2016. 1-19.
- Wilmot, John. "Timon, A Satyr." *Poems by John Wilmot the Earl of Rochester*. Ed. Vivien de Sola Pinto. Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1953. N. pag.

ISSN
2336-9884